



**Trainers' Notes**  
Rural Transport Training Materials

# Module 3: Finance and Management

## Part 1

Issues of local level management

## Part 2

Case study: New institutional framework in Guatemala

### SESSION 3.1



**SSATP**  
Africa Transport  
Policy Program



**DFID** Department for  
International  
Development



theIDLgroup

## Overview of Session 3.1

<p><b>Session Objectives</b></p>	<p>By the end of the session participants will be able to:</p> <p><b>Technical paper</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Describe key challenges to effective rural transport management</li> <li>Analyse possibilities for reform within the rural transport sector, with a focus on policy and strategy</li> <li>Explain a framework for better management of local government roads and paths</li> <li>Analyse the management and financial issues related to community roads and paths</li> </ul> <p><b>Case study</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Explain a new institutional arrangement for managing rural roads sustainably</li> <li>Identify key lessons that can be drawn from this case study and applied to other countries and/ or projects</li> </ul>
<p><b>Rural Transport Knowledge Base materials used with this session</b></p>	<p>Issues of local level management  <b>By:</b> C.Malmberg Calvo (1998)</p> <p>A new institutional framework for the management and finance of municipal rural roads: a case study from Guatemala  <b>By:</b> Guillermo Ruan, World Bank (1999)</p>
<p><b>Training Materials</b></p>	<p><b><u>Presentations</u></b></p> <p>3.1a Issues of local level management.</p> <p>3.1b A new institutional framework for the management and finance of municipal rural roads: a case study from Guatemala.</p> <p><b><u>Activity Sheets</u></b></p> <p>53 Community failure to take responsibility for access roads and paths</p> <p>54 New institutions for managing rural roads</p>

# Structure of Session 3.1

Key Topics	Training Methods
<b>Part 1</b>	
<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>Presentation</b>
<b>2. Challenges of managing rural transport</b>	
2.1 Background	<b>Presentation</b>
2.2 Overview of the issues	<b>Ideas gathering</b>
2.3 Challenges of managing rural transport: key experiences	<b>Presentation with discussion</b>
<b>3. Framework for reform</b>	
3.1 Overview	<b>Q &amp; A</b>
3.2 Framework for reform	<b>Presentation with discussion</b>
<b>4. A framework for managing local government roads</b>	
4.1 Overview	<b>Q &amp; A</b>
4.2 Framework for local management	<b>Presentation with discussion</b>
<b>5. Managing and financing community roads</b>	
5.1 An exploration of the issues	<b>Group discussion</b>
5.2 Strategies and ways forward	<b>Presentation</b>
<b>Part 2</b>	
<b>6. Case Study</b>	
6.1 Introduction	<b>Presentation</b>
6.2 Poverty and rural roads in Guatemala	
6.3 Guatemala rural roads pilot project: objectives	<b>Presentation</b>
6.4 New institutions for municipal roads	<b>Presentation</b>
6.5 Reflections on lessons learnt	<b>Case study activity</b>
<b>Summary of session 3.1</b>	

### Trainers' Summary






This session is divided into two parts:

- Part 1** is based on the technical paper: Issues of local level management
- Part 2** is based on the case study: A new institutional framework for the management and finance of municipal rural roads: a case study from Guatemala


## Session 3.1 Trainers' Notes


### Part 1







## 1. Introduction

<i>Training Methods</i>	<i>Content</i>	<i>Materials</i>
<b>Presentation</b> 	<p>Explain how this Module and session fit into the overall structure of the Rural Transport Training Materials. The Module and session to which these notes and presentation relate is highlighted in green.</p> <p>Introduce the first part of session by explaining the learning objectives and session structure.</p> <p>The first part of this session is based on the technical paper: Issues of local level management. Issues related to the management of rural transport are explored, especially areas of responsibility, role of government and communities, and levels of capacity and institutional development. The session explores several frameworks related to the reform of transport policy, and addresses issues of the management of roads by both local government and communities.</p> <p><b>Key Points:</b></p> <p><b>Session Overview Part 1</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li> Challenges of managing rural transport</li> <li> Framework for reform</li> <li> Framework for managing local government roads</li> <li> Managing and financing community roads and paths</li> </ul>	Presentation 3.1a Slides 1 - 5








## 2. Challenges of managing rural transport

Training Methods	Content	Materials
<p><b>Presentation</b></p> 	<p><b>2.1 Background</b></p> <p>Provide an overview of the core problem and key questions that need to be addressed.</p> <p><b>Key Points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>④ Attempts to create and maintain a sustainable network of rural roads in many developing countries have failed</li> <li>④ Often the wrong facilities provided in wrong places using wrong technology</li> <li>④ Key questions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ Why has there been a failure to provide sustainable rural roads networks?</li> <li>✓ What can be done to improve the management and financing of rural roads?</li> <li>✓ What is the role of local government?</li> <li>✓ What is the role of local communities?</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>Presentation 3.1a Slides 6 - 7</p>



Training Methods	Content	Materials
<p><b>Ideas Gathering</b></p> 	<h2>2.2 Overview of the issues</h2> <p>Open the discussions on the wide ranging issues of local management of rural transport by running <i>an ideas gathering</i> exercise in plenary.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>⦿ Ask participants to make one or two word contributions that relate to the statement:  <i>Issues of local planning management</i></li> <li>⦿ Note points on flip chart</li> <li>⦿ Divide the points into the following categories:             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>≈ local government capacity</li> <li>≈ community capacity</li> <li>≈ policy and institutional factors</li> <li>≈ planning</li> </ul> </li> <li>⦿ The key learning points are discussed in detail below.</li> </ul>	<p>Flip chart, pens</p>

Training Methods	Content	Materials
<p><b>Presentation with Discussion</b></p> 	<h3>2.3 Challenges of managing rural transport: key experiences</h3> <p>Building on the points raised in the previous activity, facilitate a discussion on the factors affecting the management of rural transport, using the presentation and Q &amp; A to explore key themes in details. Bring participants' experiences into the analysis.</p> <p>Begin the presentation by providing an overview of the five issues to be discussed (listed on presentation slide 6), then go through each issue in detail.</p> <p>Ask questions like:          In what ways is local capacity inadequate?          How do inappropriate road design standards affect the provision of rural transport?          How may the issues and problems with rural transport we have discussed be addressed?</p> <p><b>Key Points</b></p> <p><b>The five key issues:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li> Unclear responsibilities</li> <li> Disintegration of planning system</li> <li> Inadequate local capacity</li> <li> Weak local government and community institutions</li> <li> Inappropriate design standards and methods</li> </ul> <p><b>Continued...</b></p>	<p>Presentation 3.1a Slides 8 - 15</p>










<i>Training Methods</i>	<i>Content</i>	<i>Materials</i>
	<p><b>... Continued</b></p> <p><b>Key Points</b></p> <p><b>The five key issues in detail:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>  Unclear responsibilities           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ fragmented responsibility</li> <li>✓ confusion over ownership</li> <li>✓ ad-hoc community contributions</li> </ul> </li> <li>  Disintegration of planning system           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ lack of consistent national policy or strategy</li> <li>✓ failure of government agencies to coordinate</li> </ul> </li> <li>  Inadequate local capacity           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ lack of incentives for local staff</li> <li>✓ little private sector involvement</li> <li>✓ urban bias</li> </ul> </li> <li>  Inappropriate design standards and methods           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ focus on conventional highways</li> <li>✓ inappropriate for needs of rural households</li> </ul> </li> <li>  Weak local government and community institutions           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ highly centralised</li> <li>✓ vertical structure with decision making and financial authority at central government</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p><b>Addressing the challenges:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>  Decentralisation and building local capacity         </li> <li>  Make sustainable improvement to RTI         </li> </ul>	

## 3. Framework for reform


Training Methods	Content	Materials
<p><b>Q &amp; A</b></p> 	<p><b>3.1 Overview</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Introduce this part of the session by exploring the key aspects of a framework which need to be addressed in order to improve the rural transport services.</li> <li>Begin the discussion by asking: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><i>What aspects of a framework for reform of rural transport need to be developed?</i></li> </ul> </li> <li>Note points on flip chart.</li> <li>These points will be explored in detail below using the presentation slides.</li> </ul>	<p>Flip chart, pens</p>
<p><b>Presentation</b></p> 	<p><b>3.2 Framework for reform</b></p> <p>Summarise the points raised above by presenting the three aspects of a framework that need to be addressed.</p> <p><b>Key Points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A rural transport policy and strategy <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ conceptual framework</li> <li>✓ should not be a paper process</li> </ul> </li> <li>Ownership and responsibility <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ important need to clarify who owns each asset</li> </ul> </li> <li>Local capacity <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ training for public and private sector</li> <li>✓ develop economies of scale</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>Presentation 3.1a Slides 16 - 19</p>







## 4. A framework for managing local government roads

Training Methods	Content	Materials
<p><b>Q &amp; A</b></p> 	<p><b>4.1 Overview</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Introduce this part of the session by exploring the range of issues that need to be addressed in the development of a framework for managing local government roads.</li><li>Begin the discussion by asking: <i>What aspects of a framework for managing local government roads need to be developed?</i></li><li>Note points made by participants on flip chart.</li><li>These points will be explored in detail below using the presentation slides.</li></ul>	<p>Flip chart, pens</p>

<i>Training Methods</i>	<i>Content</i>	<i>Materials</i>
<p><b>Presentation with Discussion</b></p> 	<h3>4.2 Framework for local management</h3> <p>Facilitate a discussion on the series of activities that could be carried out to improve the provision of rural transport services. Ask questions like: What legal aspects of road ownership need to be considered?</p> <p><b>Key Points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li> Clarify local and government responsibilities, and obtain better information</li> <li> Inventory and functional classification             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ records</li> <li>✓ regular inspections</li> </ul> </li> <li> Road inventories             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ for local government and community roads and paths</li> </ul> </li> <li> Legal ownership             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ legal recognition</li> <li>✓ review annually</li> </ul> </li> <li> Generating management and local capacity             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ create in-house capacity or contract out to the private sector?</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>Presentation 3.1a Slides 20 - 25</p>






## 5. Managing and financing community roads

<i>Training Methods</i>	<i>Content</i>	<i>Materials</i>
<p><b>Presentation</b></p> 	<p>Introduce this part of the session by explaining the core problem with managing rural roads and paths.</p> <p><b>Key Points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>🌐 Governments often leave responsibility for access roads and paths to communities</li> <li>🌐 ... but communities rarely assume responsibility</li> </ul>	<p>Presentation 3.1 a Slide 26</p>

Training Methods	Content	Materials
<p><b>Group Discussion</b></p> 	<h3>5.1 An exploration of the issues</h3> <p>The purpose of this activity is to analyse the reasons why communities fail to take responsibility for the management and maintenance of access roads and paths in rural areas. Participants should explore as wide a range of issues as possible from micro to macro levels, including examining trends over time. They should also draw on their own experiences from various countries, and make suggestions for ways in which problems may be addressed.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>  Divide participants into groups of 3 or 4, and give them Activity Sheet 53         </li> <li>  Ask participants to discuss:             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A. <i>Why do communities fail to take responsibility for access roads and paths?</i></li> <li>B. <i>What can be done to address this failure?</i></li> </ul> </li> <li>  Ask the groups to prepare their findings on flip chart and to elect a person to present the finding.         </li> <li>  Each group presents their findings to the plenary.         </li> <li>  Facilitate a discussion on the findings and draw out the key learning points.         </li> </ul>	<p>Presentation 3.1 a Slide 27</p> <p>Activity sheet 53</p>

### **Trainers' Note**





- 1) *Question 1 builds on preceding discussions in this session. Possible Key Points for question 1 include:*
- ☉ Communities were not consulted during planning processes for the building or maintaining of roads*
  - ☉ The legal responsibility for the path/ track/ road is not clear (is it government? community? commercial companies e.g. tea companies?)*
  - ☉ The role of different stakeholders such as the community, local government and road agency was not clear and precise areas of responsibility not drawn up*
  - ☉ The community does not consider the road/track important enough to spend time maintaining it*
  - ☉ The community do not have the technical skills, know how or equipment to carry out maintenance*
  - ☉ Communities were once paid for their work in maintaining roads but were subsequently expected to do the work voluntarily.*
- 2) *Key Points for question 2 are expanded upon in the following section.*


<b>Training Methods</b>	<b>Content</b>	<b>Materials</b>
<p><b>Presentation</b></p> 	<h3>5.2 Strategies and ways forward</h3> <p>This presentation builds in the previous activity. Drawing on the comments made above, present the issues and potential strategies for addressing these issues, as outlined in the technical paper.</p> <p><b>Key Points</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>  Community ownership           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ ownership is needed in order to develop incentives for communities to take on management</li> <li>✓ a legal framework is required to give recognition of ownership to communities</li> <li>✓ requires community consent to ownership</li> </ul> </li> <li>  Planning – must be participatory         </li> <li>  Technical and managerial advice is needed           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ training</li> <li>✓ villages may form road associations</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>Presentation 3.1 a Slides 28 - 31</p>
<p><b>Presentation</b></p> 	<h3>Conclusions</h3> <p>Summarise the first part of the session by highlighting the key issues and ways forward for addressing problems with local management of rural roads.</p>	<p>Presentation 3.1 a Slides 32 - 33</p>













## Part 2


# 6. Case Study: Guatemala

<i>Training Methods</i>	<i>Content</i>	<i>Materials</i>
<p><b>Presentation</b></p> 	<p><b>6.1 Introduction</b></p> <p>Introduce the second part of this session explaining the objectives with a brief overview of the topics to be covered.</p> <p>During this part of the session, a case study from Guatemala will be examined.</p> <p><b>Key Points:</b></p> <p><b>Session Overview Part 2</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li> Poverty and rural roads in Guatemala</li><li> Guatemala rural roads project: objectives</li><li> Institutional framework for municipal roads</li></ul>	<p>Presentation 3.1 b Slides 1 - 3</p>

<i>Training Methods</i>	<i>Content</i>	<i>Materials</i>
<p><b>Presentation</b></p> 	<h3>6.2 Poverty and rural roads in Guatemala</h3> <p>Explain the context on which the project is taking place and the links between rural transport and poverty. Describe the current nature of the rural roads sector and the problems faced by the sector.</p> <p><b>Key Points:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Guatemala's rural poor have difficulty accessing markets and basic economic and social services</li> <li>Multiple actors include General Highway Directorate, Office of Vice-President, development projects, municipalities, communities, NGOs</li> <li>Lack of standards</li> <li>Lack of coherent institutional framework for sustainable management and financing</li> </ul>	<p>Presentation 3.1b Slides 4 - 5</p>

Training Methods	Content	Materials
<p><b>Presentation</b></p> 	<h3>6.3 Guatemala rural roads pilot project: objectives</h3> <p>Describe the outline of the project, including the project objectives.</p> <p><b>Key Points</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>  Pilot project takes place in the poorest part of Guatemala: San Marcos, North western Highlands         </li> <li>  The goal of the project is: design and gradually implement institutional arrangements for sustainable maintenance of rural road network with the intention of replicating these arrangements in the rest of the country         </li> <li>  Objectives of the project are:             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <b>rehabilitate</b> national and key departmental routes</li> <li>✓ <b>test</b> new technologies for cost-effective strengthening of rural road surfaces</li> <li>✓ <b>pilot</b> new institutional framework for management and finance of municipal rural roads</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>Presentation 3.1b Slides 6 - 7</p>

<i>Training Methods</i>	<i>Content</i>	<i>Materials</i>
<p><b>Presentation</b></p> 	<h3>6.4 New institutions for municipal roads</h3> <p>Describe the project framework including management, financing and additional project activities.</p> <p><b>Key Points</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>  12 municipalities joined together to achieve scale and cost efficiency </li> <li>  The municipalities formed an association – AMAMNO <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ representatives from 12 municipalities</li> <li>✓ executive board</li> <li>✓ executive director</li> </ul> </li> <li>  AMAMNO assists municipalities </li> <li>  Financing of AMAMNO includes creation of a road fund, and cost sharing for community and municipal roads </li> <li>  Additional activities and outputs include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ inventory, function classification, and condition survey of rural roads</li> <li>✓ alternative maintenance regimes</li> <li>✓ simple road conditioning and monitoring</li> <li>✓ small scale contractor management and technical training</li> <li>✓ appropriate technical standards and criteria for rural road investments</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>Presentation 3.1b Slides 8 - 12</p>

Training Methods	Content	Materials
<p><b>Case Study activity in groups</b></p> 	<p><b>6.5 Reflections on lessons learnt</b></p> <p>The purpose of this activity is to draw on the lessons from the Guatemala experience and consider how these may be applied to other countries.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>④ Divide the participants into groups of 4 or 5 people</li> <li>④ Give each group Activity Sheet 54 and a copy of the full text of the case study</li> <li>④ Ask participants to discuss the following points: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A. <i>What features of the AMAMNO pilot project could be applied to other countries and projects?</i></li> <li>B. <i>What could be done to improve the management and finances of the project?</i></li> </ul> </li> <li>④ Ask the groups to prepare their findings on flip chart and to elect a person to present</li> <li>④ Each group presents their findings to the plenary</li> <li>④ Facilitate a discussion on the findings and draw out the key learning points.</li> </ul> <p><b><u>Trainers' Note</u></b>  <i>There are no right and wrong answers to the questions in this activity. However, encourage participants to consider a wide range of issues, including institutional and management issues, and the role of the community.</i></p>	<p>Presentation 3.1b Slide 13</p> <p>Flip chart, pens</p> <p>Activity sheet 54</p>
	<p><b>Summary of session 3.1</b></p> <p>Conclude this session by reviewing the issues explored and the key lessons learnt, highlighting areas that may need further investigation or discussion.</p>	