

Draft

Gender and Transport
A Strategy for Africa

Prepared by: Elizabeth Rankin
August, 1999

GENDER and TRANSPORT: A STRATEGY for AFRICA

1. Context

Transport networks and services are integral to the sustained economic development and growth of countries. This is an accepted fact. Also accepted is that transport is intricately related to individual subsistence and survival. As a result investments in the sector are substantial, with future needs significant. The World Bank estimates that over US\$1.0 trillion is required to finance transport sector investments in the developing countries within the next 10 years. The commitment by the multilateral community for this period is estimated to be about US\$50.0 billion, with a further US\$10.0 billion committed by the recipient governments as counterpart financing. In addition it is forecast that the international private community will also finance a total of over US\$300 billion.

How does this relate to Africa? In January 1998 Mr. Wolfensohn noted that “of the US\$300 billion in total foreign private capital flows (expected), Sub-Saharan Africa is (targeted) to receive about US\$12 billion. And of that, only US\$2.6 billion (will be) in direct investments - a trivial amount in relation to the size and potential of the continent”. There is currently a hiatus in African development. Sub-Saharan Africa's economies are in a protracted state of crisis. Hard-won material improvements in people's lives, in many parts of Africa, have eroded. The situation is bound to breed further economic disillusionment, social unrest and possibilities of war. This is an untenable situation. Structural Adjustment Programs, based on classic western economic development theories, have so far failed to bring about recovery to pre-crisis levels of material welfare. As an antidote there is need for proactive national development strategies with realistic assumptions and aims, to avoid the social fragmentation and economic anarchy already evident in many African countries. The issue is human capital investment now rather than disaster relief in a few years. A great part of the lost perspective in this area deals with women, and their general dis-association from economic development in African countries.

From a historical perspective, the Bank has financed about 100 transport projects in East and West Africa during the 1990s. Most have been in the roads sector. Although transport projects have increasingly become more socially and environmentally sensitive during this decade, there is one area where attention has been lacking. This concerns a dynamic approach to gender inclusion in the sector. Although the Bank has had a Department, Division or Group specifically focused on gender issues Bank-wide since the late 1980s, which have produced a number of significant reports, the transport sector has not taken advantage of the findings, lessons learned or solutions/recommendations presented. To the sector's credit, however, a Gender and Transport Thematic Group has recently been created with the mandate to aggressively address gender issues in the transport sector Bank-wide. Also recently, in the Africa region, the rural transport sub-sector has begun to integrate gender issues into a select number of projects, under the auspices of the Africa Rural Travel and Transport Program (RTTP).

What has been the focus of gender analysis at the Bank? Since 1990 a number of specific syntheses and issues papers on cross-country themes and under-documented topics concerning gender have been prepared ¹. Among these are included:

- Law, Economic Development and Women in Africa,
- Structural Adjustment and Gender Issues in Sub-Saharan Africa,
- Gender Issues and the Management of Fragile Environments in Africa,
- Women in Development: The Legal Issue in Sub-Saharan Africa Today,
- Refugee and Displaced Women and Children in Africa,
- Gender and Entrepreneurship,
- Gender Issues in Economic and Public Sector Management, and
- Gender, Growth and Poverty Reduction in Africa.

In other Forums there have also been a number of publications, among which are:

- Women and Labor-Based Road Works in Sub-Saharan Africa. ILO Working Paper.
- African Rural Households and Transport: Reducing the Burden of Women. IHE Working Paper.

In addition to the above, there have also been a number of Africa country-specific Women in Development (WID) issues papers prepared by the Bank on: Mauritania, Guinea Bissau, Nigeria, Rwanda, Mali and Ethiopia, as well as gender sensitive country economic and sector papers prepared on Uganda (Human Resources Sector Paper), Senegal (Private Sector Assessment), Nigeria (Nexus Study), and Burkina Faso (Private Sector Development Study). For purposes of sectoral analysis the Bank gender focus has been on five specific sectors: Agriculture, Education, Infrastructure, Health and Energy. In Infrastructure the focus has mainly been on water and sanitation. Why not transport? A fundamental lack of interest until very recently, where for the most part the transport sector has not embraced any of the findings or lessons learned by the Bank gender groups. This includes the Sub-Saharan Africa Transport Program (SSATP), which has undertaken considerable analyses on a wide spectrum of issues in the transport sector in Africa, but has not initiated any work respecting gender-related transport issues nor has it shown any gender sensitivity in any transport analyses prepared thus far. The one exception, as noted above, has been the rural roads or rural infrastructure sub-sector in Africa which has recently begun to design gender specific components in their projects, and/or identify specific gender interventions as part of overall rural transport/infrastructure programs. The RTTP, which is an arm of the SSATP, has in fact become a champion of gender issues as they relate to rural transport, even actively participating in Gender Forums. What has spurred this localized interest? There has been a substantial amount of information compiled on rural gender issues in Africa over the past decade. Among the pertinent findings are the following facts: (a) between 45-70% of agricultural labor and food production, including that related to tree and horticultural crops is carried out by women;

¹ See Annex 4 - Bibliography

(b) women market about 40% of the surplus food crops, marine catch, and small livestock and poultry surpluses; (c) women provide about 40-50% of total workdays for commercial smallholder coffee and cocoa plantations, and 25-30% for copra and rubber plantations; (d) women provide about 40-50% of total workdays in the catchweight of fish and mollusks; (e) women provide 50% of labor in domestic food storage and 100% in food processing², and (f) women-headed households are increasing in numbers, presently exceeding 40% of African households. Transportation for women is of fundamental importance - both from a domestic and commercial perspective. What is the main form of women's travel and transport in rural Africa? Both in production, processing and marketing rural Africa walks and carries its burdens - including goods, possessions, produce, crafts and each other - and the typical vessel of transport is the woman. Household surveys indicate that 87% of rural trips take place on foot, and that women account for more than 65% of the household time and effort spent on transport and travel, typically carrying a load of 20 kilograms about 1.5-5.5 km/day. Why is this important in the overall context of transport? Rural Africa represents the beginning of the productivity chain with women being instrumental in both the production and movement of produce. As such their needs and concerns in the overall transport chain of events is necessary if Africa is to emerge as a viable modern region.

Internationally gender has begun to feature as a recognized issue in transport policy and planning while transport has begun to feature on the agenda of gender policy and planning³. And although still in an embryonic stage of development at the Bank, the Gender and Transport Thematic Group is creating a dynamic agenda to address the issues relevant to both gender and transport sectors, with a mandate to identify options for further integration. The fact that men and women very often have different transport patterns and different transport needs is slowly being recognized, but as yet this recognition is accepted only in the rural transport sub-sector. "Gender and Transport" is sitting, therefore, on something of a new professional ground. At present it is fair to argue that there are no systematic gender inclusion procedures for transport either in terms of training of professionals, the participation of users or the design and planning of systems, services and equipment. As a result it is easy as a Task Manager to overlook gender: no protocols are in place and no sanctions are applied to those who fail to consider the neglect of the transport needs of over half of the world's population.

Why this resistance to inclusion of gender concerns in the transport sector in general? The following presents some of the more common mis-conceptions held by transport sector staff, with the associated realities tabled.

² Women in Development: the Legal Issues in Sub-Saharan Africa Today. IBRD Publication. 1992

³ The recent Gender and transport Forum, entitled Balancing the Load, which was held in South Africa July 12-18, and attended by representatives from most of the African states, the ILO and the World Bank, attests to its growing importance.

| Theory | Reality |
|---|--|
| 1. gender is NOT a transport issue; it is a health, education, energy, water/sanitation issue. | - all access to these services are by road, either in terms of the provider or the client. |
| 2. gender is a cultural and social issue which is NOT in the realm of transport to resolve | - this attitude re-inforces and accommodates social restrictions imposed. The same prevailed in the developed countries in the early 20th century - with barriers broken down only through persistent intervention. |
| 3. with regards to the roads sub-sector, the building of roads, DE FACTO, improves the lot of women and offers tremendous opportunities previously denied. | - unless baseline data is taken and comparisons before and after made, this cannot be taken for granted. Cases have been identified where road improvements have greatly added to women's burdens (i.e. increased agricultural responsibilities without concomitant compensation, flight of men from the area creating hardships, etc.) ⁴ |
| 4. with regards to the ports, rail and aviation sectors there are NO gender issues. | - training and employment of females is all but totally disregarded in these sectors although the competence exists. |
| 5. introducing gender into project preparation, etc. is administratively CUMBERSOME- another band - wagon issue of the Bank | - no more arduous than any other requirements for project preparation. The same had been said of environmental issues. Managers have solved this problem by contracting out where expertise is limited. |
| 6. transport projects are assessed using economic cost-benefit analyses; there are NO quantifiable benefits which can be identified with respect to gender. | - work has been done concerning the quantification of time savings with respect to women and improved transport efficiencies, but other techniques need to be developed and alternative methods of identifying unquantifiable benefits determined. |
| 7. the Bank is NON-SEXIST; it is an equal-opportunity provider. | - projects seldom, if ever, encourage women's participation in either training components or employment opportunities in Bank projects. Men are automatically chosen without due consideration for gender awareness, and advertisements are funneled through male avenues. |
| 8. the Bank's procurement guidelines are transparent, and NON-gender exclusive. | - they lack gender sensitivity, do not encourage female participation, are advertised through male media only, and do not offer any incentives for female participation. |

As an extension to the above, why should the Bank focus attention on gender issues in transport?

Fact 1: It is not a trivial fact that women compose at least 50% of the population of any given country.

Fact 2: It is not trivial that in Africa women are the main contributors to agricultural production and development, where on average over 70% of work performed in this sector is done by women.

⁴ In its First and Second Year Plans, the Government of Bangladesh proposed a policy that would phase out small moving vehicles, such as rickshaws and scooters. However, studies revealed that 35% of female commuters (in urban areas) relied on rickshaws as their sole mode of transport, 6% used them in combination with bus services and/or scooters, and 25% relied on them for accessing educational opportunities. Suffice it to say that the policy was never implemented.

Fact 3: It is not trivial that the agricultural sector is one of the main contributors to GDP - from 20% - 40%, and therefore women's contribution is key.

Fact 4: It is not trivial that average agricultural output in Africa could be increased by 10-15% by simply shifting existing resources between men and women's farm plots⁵ and increasing transport options.

Fact 5: It is not trivial that women are also the mainstay of the service sector (which accounts for about 15% of GDP) and by extension the tourist industry (which is growing substantially and contributes about 8% to GDP).

Fact 6: It is not trivial that although still in relatively small numbers in light industry, women are not inconsequential.

Fact 7: It is not trivial that women are the mainstay of families.

All this is to say that women play an important part in the economies of Africa and have requirements vis-a-vis access to transport networks and services, which may in fact differ from that of men. A recent analysis of the structure of the productive economies in Uganda further underlines the relationship between GDP and female productivity:

| Sector | Share of GDP | Share of Exports | Gender Intensity of Production | |
|----------------------|--------------|------------------|--------------------------------|-------|
| | | | Female | Male |
| Agriculture | 49.0% | 99% | 75% | 25% |
| Industry | 14.3% | 1% | 15% | 85% |
| Services | 36.6% | - | 32% | 68% |
| Total/Average | 100.0% | 100% | 50.6% | 49.4% |

Source: Elson & Evers 1997

2. Transport Strategy

The World Bank focus in the transport sector has been on issues which it considers of significant importance to improved functioning of the sector. Gender issues are regarded as either inconsequential in this context or implicitly covered by “conscientious” Task Managers. What are these issues of “magnitude” and how could gender concerns be more appropriately included in their articulation. The following presents a conservative snapshot of some of the basic issues identified:

⁵ In Tanzania, for example studies have shown that a reduced time burden for women will increase household cash income by 10% (coffee and bananas), labor productivity by 15% and capital productivity by 44%. Gender, Growth and Poverty Reduction in Africa. IBRD 1998.

| Transport Issue | Gender Intervention |
|---|---|
| 1. increased institutional capacity | - conscious inclusion of women in training and employment programs will improve understanding of gender issues and concerns, allow for them to be articulated more appropriately in policies and projects in all transport sub-sectors. |
| 2. improved management and operations | - specific targeting of women for management and senior operations positions will balance present inequality creating a more inclusive environment for all transport-related activities. |
| 3. financial management | - conscious inclusion of women in training and employment programs. This is an area of perceived strength of women and as such would benefit not only institutions involved but also create a more balanced work environment. |
| 4. decentralization of responsibilities & financing | - greater female participation in decision-making bodies will allow for decisions to be based on the need of both genders, not just one of them. |
| 5. appropriate regulatory environment | - explicit sensitivity to gender in all policies, regulations and legislative endeavors will create a more gender-sensitive environment, empowering women to take more direct control of resolution of their specific concerns. |
| 6. establishing a legal status for all roads | - inclusion of women in legal decisions will be a stepping stone to empowerment in other legal issues. |
| 7. increased private sector participation | - target incentives for female-owned & operated concerns to encourage inclusion of women. |
| 8. introduction of new but appropriate technologies | - IMTs, as well as advanced technologies to ensure appropriate means of mobility for women of all incomes. |
| 9. attention to safety | - focus on decreasing women's fatalities and injuries as a direct step in eliminating present inequalities in dealing with this problem, and using them as educators of their own children in this regard. |
| 10. environmental sensitivity | - explicit inclusion of women in programs as issues related to environmental degradation often impact directly on both their livelihood and capacity to carry out household chores |
| 11. participation in globalization of economies | - attention to entire transport chain, especially as pertains to gender inclusion, in recognition of their vital role in economic growth. |
| 12. improved appraisal techniques | - development of quantifiable gender benefits and economic effective indicators to offer Task Managers sound bases on which to design gender interventions. |

It has been established in the Africa Region that Rural Transport needs to take into consideration gender transport issues and concerns in order to develop gender appropriate solutions. To this end transport projects and programs are being designed with gender specific interventions in mind, or conversely with gender components built in as separate but inter-related activities. What of the other transport sub-sectors? Gender concerns have not permeated the collective consciousness of either Task Managers or policy/project advisors in urban transport, railways, ports/harbors/shipping, or aviation.

The purpose of the present exercise is to present gender issues and concerns in the transport sector overall, and develop recommendations not only for Task Managers but also for inclusion in the Africa Transport Strategy. The Transport Strategy for Africa is “an ongoing process (which) reflect(s) the evolving reform processes and the changing environment as the reform agenda progresses”. It identifies why transport matters for African Development, lists the issues which need to be addressed by sub-sectors, presents strategy “cornerstones” and implementation approaches, and offers some examples of the strategies at work. It is based on the individual Sub-Sectoral Transport Strategies⁶ prepared in the region as well as the individual Africa Country Transport Strategies⁷. Overall the Africa Strategy is well presented with a systematic approach taken to deal with perceived issues and problems which have been identified over the years in the transport sector, both globally and in individual sub-sectors. It reflects trends at the margin. What the Strategy does not reflect is an acknowledgement of the issues and concerns which are presently skirting the horizon for which groundwork needs to be laid and preliminary attention given. Among these are issues related to social concerns in transport. For purposes of this analysis social issues are herein addressed in the context of gender, and more specifically women. The purpose is to draw attention to the need to include gender considerations in the design, implementation and monitoring/supervision of ALL Bank transport projects and programs. It aims to identify gender issues as one of the shifting paradigms in the transport sector which needs to be addressed - where increased employment of women in the commercial and public sectors, increased contribution of women to economic development, and increased participation of women along each link of the transport chain all need to be factored into the transport sector’s “future”.

3. Identification of Gender Issues in Transport

Sub-Saharan Africa has about 940,000 km of designated rural roads with a replacement value of about US\$48 billion. In addition it also has a vast network of undesignated rural roads, tracks, paths and footbridges. Along this network is generated one-third of the region’s GDP coming from agriculture, 40% of export revenues⁸ and 90% of all domestic transport. In addition this region has over 50 commercial ports and 30 international airports with virtually each country also operating a viable railroad system. The region is

⁶ Included in the review were the strategies for: roads; rural roads; rail; port and maritime sub-sectors; and air. The only consistent social issue noted in roads, rail and ports strategies was overstaffing and the need to downsize. The Rural Roads Strategy did refer explicitly to gender in its policies and strategies but not in a stand-alone manner.

⁷ The individual Country Transport Sector Strategies did not deal with gender issues as a part of their overall approach. However among the issues identified in many of strategies social concerns could be recognized as implicit.

⁸ Options for Managing and Financing of Rural Transport Infrastructure. IBRD 1998.

marked by both coastal and land-locked countries. There are a number of Regional Economic Programs in place to reduce trade barriers and increase regional coordination and cooperation. Transport plays an important role in the economic development of each country individually as well as regionally.

A significant amount of gender casework has been carried out in Africa, both in-house by the Bank and outside by IFID, ILO and a number of donors including CIDA, SIDA, Danida and NORAD. The following presents results from some select studies. Group 1 focuses on road interventions and Group 2 on interventions in the other transport sub-sectors as well as other sectors with relevant experiences.

Group 1 - Roads sub-sector

| Country/Project | Findings and Lessons | Issue |
|---|---|---|
| Mauritania: Nutrition, Food Security & Social Mobility | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - use of pilot programs an excellent devise to sensitize population and incorporate appropriate interventions. - components included: (i) use of female technicians selected from co-ops; (ii) women's training in micro-finance; (iii) social mobilization through rural radio broadcasts and information brochures; (iv) technical supervision were women's co-ops, NGOs, etc. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - pilot/demonstration projects key - use of female managers & WID specific training - use of gender sensitive information distribution systems. |
| Mozambique: Rural Roads | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - imported used bikes from the U.S. to take advantage of tax exemption status for such items. However government refused to grant tax waver which negatively impacted project success. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - government incentives & tax regulations need to be transparent & applied uniformly |
| Bangladesh: Rural Transport Interventions Case Study | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - typical economic activities planned for women included preponderance of cottage industries which accommodated social restrictions and transport service shortfalls. - Bank projects often re-inforced discriminatory gender allocation of services, further cut women off from markets, and perpetuated male dominance. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - transport should NOT re-inforce & accommodate gender restrictions. |
| India: Study of 3 Forest Economy Villages | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - bikes were allocated to communities but used exclusively by men. - some options for women included: special buses to carry loads on market days; collectivizing the market; improving paths; bringing sources of water, health, & education facilities to the villages themselves, and protecting and re-generating village forests. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - not all options are applicable to women - transport needs to identify specific gender interventions if women are to reap any benefits |
| Zimbabwe: Report on Intermediate Technologies | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - specific training for women is required in use of IMTs - when introducing IMTs consideration needs to be given to gender appropriateness - not many IMTs are rented out, more instances of shared IMTs was found, sometimes in exchange for labor. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - IMTs need to be gender sensitive and appropriate - identification of IMT options, demonstration & training is a req't. |
| Nepal: Rural Transport | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - rural roads brought new opportunities to households, but these required more travel & transport tasks which fell more onto women, i.e. opportunity to sell more dairy products led to increases in cattle which led to increased at-home work for women who tended cattle. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - desegregating data enables task managers to identify roles & responsibilities of beneficiaries omitting potential negative impacts of women |
| Morocco: Fourth Highway Project | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - no specific gender interventions were designed or planned for the project. - despite the above a number of gender specific impacts were identified: (i) improvement in girls' enrollment in primary education; (ii) hospital visits | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - sometimes careful and thoughtful planning, under exceptional conditions, will provide results not anticipated. However, this is only one example out of a portfolio of many, |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| | <p>by females doubled; (iii) family diet improved; (iv) butane became affordable & replaced fuelwood hence alleviating one of women's daily burden; (v) expanded rural taxi & bus service led to increased mobility & rural-urban links; (vi) increased agricultural mechanization and agricultural co-ops.</p> | many Projects. |
| Ghana: Development of IMTs | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - IDA-financed, Ghana's Technology Consultancy Center promoted production and use for women of: (a) bikes with trailers; and (b) hand -pushed farm vehicles. - designs were adapted to local conditions and demos were set up. - credit lines were established and Technical Assistance provided to start-up firms to manufacture vehicles given - NGOs were used, they were found to be experience in financial management but lacked the capability of maintaining appropriate accounts. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - IMTs require support in financing and promotion. - loan terms and conditions need to take into account borrowers ability to repay, with the interest rate maintained at the real loan value level - NGOs can be instrumental but need to be examined for competence in all key areas. |
| Rwanda: Strategy for Using Female Labor in Road Construction | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - past recruitment was undertaken by "bourgmestre" who preferred men who paid taxes and belonged to certain political parties. - new recruitment process involved: (a) massive publicity using multiple media on recruitment procedures and women's eligibility; (b) public meeting where people chose poorest or most needy by a "people's" choice criteria; and (c) submission of list to commune chief for approval. | - men tend to choose men for opportunities unless some other methods or criteria are presented. |
| Botswana: Rural Roads Project | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - NORAD-funded project used female laborers in rural roads construction and maintenance. - 20% target chosen for women's participation. But this was not exceeded because overseers had no incentive to exceed quotas - it was found that women were equally productive, although work patterns were accommodated to meet agricultural labor needs and cycles. - women were more literate and prepared to receive training as gang leaders, but they were not considered as men supervisors chose men. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - women need to be targeted for inclusion or it does not happen - targeting does work however it needs to be used as a "minimum" guideline. |
| Nicaragua: Women's Participation in Infrastructure Planning and Construction | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - DANIDA-funded effort to improve rural infrastructure in roads and water canals - elected committees with women participants, and together projects were prioritized. - women participated in local construction works leading to greater representation among local-level decision-makers - construction jobs were allocated so that women could work part-time, closest to their villages, and where possible on all-female gangs. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - female participation ensures not only gender sensitivity in project choice but also increases women's participation in employment activities. - road construction works can be carried out equally by men and women |
| Peru: Participatory Workshops in rural roads development | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - participatory workshops were organized to involve local communities in planning, project commitment and maintenance road projects - men and women were involved and encouraged to take part and take leadership roles to find solutions for both groups. | - gender-sensitive participation can lead to equitable solutions which include labor-based maintenance methods which include women as workers, and funding for IMTs for women as well as men. |
| Mexico: Attracting Civil servants to Labor-based Programs | - creation of an institution within the Directorate-General of Rural Roads and Construction where professional and paraprofessional staff were ingrained with an esprit de corps which revolved around encouraging the | - introducing the right mix of incentives has positive effects. This can be easily translated into |

| | | |
|--|---|---|
| | use of labor- based rural access road construction methods. - approach supported by establishment of a career pattern for staff which provided visibility for engineers and promotions resulting from involvement in labor-based programs. | inclusion of gender sensitive programs |
|--|---|---|

**Group 2 - Rail, Ports/Maritime, Air sub-sectors
& Other Infrastructure Sectors**

| Country/Project | Findings and Lessons | Issue |
|---|---|---|
| China: Comprehensive Transport Management Training Project | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - agreed at the outset that women would be involved as trainers/trainees - specific targets for the involvement of women were set at the project preparation stage, with the only 2 areas where women were excluded being in container transport & highway/bridge assessment programs - an analysis of the situation of women in China was carried out at the time of project preparation, including a workforce analysis of female participation in rail, roads, waterways, aviation, handling and pipelines. - consultations with other donors were carried out re - the role of women and transportation in China | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - training programs need to be designed to specifically include women in all transport sub-sectors - best way is to target percentages. - serious gender related data gathering & analysis is a pre-requisite in design of training programs at all levels. |
| China: Civil Aviation transport training project | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - it was established during project preparation that women would be involved as trainers and trainees. - the distribution of women at middle and senior management positions throughout the aviation sector was uneven, making it difficult to find qualified female candidates. - surveys were carried out to identify candidates & targets for male and female participation were set for all training activities, between 25% - 40% were women. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - surveys are useful to identify not only no. of candidates but also their capability. - when there is a will there is a way. - the aviation sector has gender issues to address |
| Tanzania: Railway Corporation Locomotive Assistance & Training | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - during project preparation the need to integrate women more fully in the training program was identified, with specific funds set aside which were non-transferable. This was the first time anyone had addressed gender issues as part of the analysis of human resource needs and changes. - a gender specialist with infrastructure experience was hired - a WID Affirmative Action Plan was developed. - a difficult component to implement because of resistance by project managers. However, eventually women were trained in management information systems, computer applications and freight forwarding. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - development of Affirmative Action Plans may be necessary - the incorporation of gender specialists is more apt to lead to gender sensitivity in project preparation - even the rail sector has gender issues to address. |
| Turkmenistan: Urban Transport Stakeholder Workshop | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - academic community, representatives of Ministry of transport and municipalities and IBRD were brought together to review preliminary results of a social assessment. - dialogue included women - as a result a significant number of reforms were implemented in public transport management, including: (a) improved service; and (b) improved liquidity due to agreement to increase tariffs yet cost of transport to poor halved. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - social assessments and stakeholder workshops provided critical inputs into both project preparation and formulation of transport policies. - provision of gender-sensitivity training to eliminate biases and barriers to women's participation in project works. |
| India/Mexico: Rail Transport System Improvements | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - India's nation-wide rail service provides for women-only compartments to accommodate needs of females. The same is true of India's urban transport systems - During Mexico's peak urban travel times, certain subway cars are designated for women only to ensure comfort and safety and to encourage female use of the transit system. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - provision of transport services to meet both men's and women's preferences do NOT represent further financial burdens but ultimately leads to increased ridership & revenues for the transport system. |
| India: Hydro-electric Project | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - this project involved substantial dredging of an inland waterway. - project planners consulted local male fishermen to ensure no negative impacts would result for the local economy. It was found that men | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - women in all sectors and all projects need to be consulted. |

| | | |
|--|--|---|
| | <p>fished in small boats off-shore so no impact was identified.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - women were not consulted, however, but it is they who fished in the shallow waters. As a result the women's source of livelihood was destroyed. | |
| Pakistan: Oil & Gas sector project | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - given the role of women in Islamic society special attention was given to identifying situations where women would profit from training - gender sensitization sessions were held for project participants, beneficiaries and other people working in the energy sector. - programs were initiated recruiting women graduates directly through universities using scholarships and internships for women to study in technical fields - a gender specialist was hired to monitor project progress. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - cultural issues need not be a barrier to women's integration in projects. - universities were used as a means of training women in previously male-dominated fields. |
| Zimbabwe: School of Mines | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - a survey identified companies willing to hire women and implement an affirmative action plan - the key elements identified as pre-requisites included: (i) a coordinated approach & campaign to resolve issues immediately as they arise; (ii) commitment from policy-makers; (iii) sensitization of staff; (iv) increased employment of women in teaching and management positions; (v) sex- desegregated data. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - surveys are useful in determining appropriate action plans |
| Canada-Vietnam: Information technology Exchange project | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - a management plan was developed which clearly stated that gender-sensitive IT infrastructure, applications and policies would be put in place. - gender considerations were integrated into each component as a cross-cutting issue with women's equitable participation specifically promoted. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - gender-specific web-sites, scholarship funds, sensitivity training & dev't of gender-specific IT programs are feasible. |
| Ghana: Water & Sewerage Corporation Assistance project | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - a results-based management & monitoring framework was developed in the management plan - full participation of women in decision-making process where appropriate - least cost technologies were selected in conjunction with the community members taking full account of the needs of women. - affordability & tariff-setting included full participation of women | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - tariff issues need to take into account affordability of women. |
| North Sulewesi: Water Resources Institutional development project | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the project considered impact on whole population - landowners, sharecroppers, renters, land laborers, lowland & hillside farmers both men and women. - monetary gains lead to increased responsibility in home financial management, generally the duty of women - labor needs increased, with more cash responsibilities particularly for men - community self-help groups became farm labor groups which became men-only. - women earned less than men - post-harvest processing of rice milling once done by women was taken over by male-owned & operated mills. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - desegregated data at the outset and a strong monitoring system is required to ensure positive benefits for all project participants. - WID specialists should be included in all stages of project preparation and implementation. |

4. Conclusions

The issue of gender in transport projects may be compressed into 4 specific concepts which are referred to as the 4 As:

| Access | Appropriateness | Availability | Affordability |
|--|--|--|--|
| to destination | of mode | of service | of traveler |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - network - employment - services - social activities | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - road - rail - ships/ferries - air | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - frequency - - space | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - by type of mode - by income group |

Lack of attention to the 4 As within the entire transport chain eliminates women from causal interventions and hinders economic development. One point to consider is the inter-relationship, or "link", between the economic chain and the transport chain. If one starts at the beginning of the transport chain and identifies both economic and household activities related to this chain, what will become evident is that both men and women have roles to play that are separate and individual, and that their needs along this chain are likewise individual. The "bottom" of the economic chain, if base production is considered, revolves around the rural areas in Africa, where agriculture production, forestry, mining, and related services, etc form the first "link" in both the production and transport chains. Rural roads are the first link to the next economic chain, if you will, which is processing. The last transport "link" in the economic chain is export, and conversely import, and domestic delivery. In terms of export and import, the ports and airports provide the final transport link along with roads and railroads in land-locked countries.

Another point to consider with respect to changes in economies is that as with developed countries, two-income families are becoming more common, with both men and women working outside of the home. This is one of the shifting paradigms that transport needs to take into consideration because women may not necessarily fit into the traditional employment mould. This occurrence will impact not only the structure of the workforce but also transport requirements.

Many of the gender issues identified in the preceding pages underline the fact that there are a number which are over-arching, affecting all of the transport sub-sectors. Those that are more specific to each transport sub-sector are identified below.

Ports - the changing role of ports deeply affects their staffing needs both in numbers and skills. Training and hiring of women in areas where they have perceived strengths should be part of Bank transport project design. This is particularly relevant in the context of port modernization, which requires new technologies and new skills. As public interest in port management has escalated, where concerns about safety of ships and cargoes, preservation of coastal environments, regulations of monopolies and cartels, and equal treatment of all port users requires greater consultation at all levels, women need to be included in these consultation processes. A common law or civil law approach where increased privatization of management and operation of ports, as well as contracting out of services and other activities, needs to take into consideration the role that women can and should play in the new millennium as owners, operators, civil works contractors, laborers and employees.

Rail - the main areas of concentration by the Bank in this sub-sector include a focus on: (a) concessioning/privatization; and (b) increased regional cooperation and attention to regional competition. Other than those issues noted above in "ports", which are likewise relevant in the case of railroads, additional issues which directly relate to women include: staffing and staff redundancy programs; inadequacy of the social net including payment for public service obligations; inadequacy of regulatory framework; backlog of rehabilitation; and over extension in peripheral activities. These are all areas where inclusion of women is essential.

Air - effective and efficient air transport plays a key role in the process of economic development of any given country. It is vital to the exploitation of the enormous tourism potential of the region and also the development of non-traditional agricultural exports for which the region has comparative advantage. However African airports and the aviation industry in general is lagging behind worldwide trends and becoming a bottleneck for regional integration. The issues are similar to the other transport sub-sectors noted above; restrictive regulatory framework, monopolies, inefficient operations, strong government interference, and inequality in training and employment policies. Women are still primarily employed as airline agents on the ground or stewardesses up in the air. No airline employs women as technical specialists including pilots, maintenance crew, etc. and even fewer women find themselves in the ranks of management. However, as the industry changes all of these issues can now be placed on the table for discussion and resolution. This is a prime opportunity to be more gender sensitive, including gender issues both directly and indirectly as part of the overall development plan for the sector.

Roads (Rural and Urban) - There are a number of key points which have emerged with respect to road networks and transport services both in the urban and rural areas. The first concerns the demand and/or appropriate supply of services, from rural and urban markets and stalls, through education centers, health clinics, water and fuel stations, social and cultural complexes, as well as centers of formal employment. The emphasis is too often on unfulfilled demand when at times it should be concerned with provision or supply of services. The interconnectivity of rural and urban infrastructure needs to be reflected as part of integrated transport planning and transport chain analyses. Transport brokers are a potential savior for the rural households for example - but just as important are the introduction of modern devices which would eliminate such needs, including good telephone systems (be it stand-alone or mobile), or other communications systems, including the computer. Improved information flows to women will provide tremendous opportunities in all areas. Appropriate road design standards including the allocation of space for informal commercial businesses (both in rural and urban areas), as well as sidewalks and/or paths for non-motorized transport including pedestrians, will improve women's daily travel and transport as well as economic activities. Increased diversity of both non-motorized and motorized vehicles will offer women increased mobility - something presently sadly lacking in both the rural and urban areas. In addition, the development of gender inclusive credit schemes will allow women to

more fully integrate their commercial activities with daily domestic chores, increasing travel and transport. Finally introduction of price incentives, such as reduced taxes and duties, as well as reduced capital costs for conventional and non-conventional transport systems, will create an avenue for increased mobility. Countries such as Pakistan and Sri Lanka have already adopted such systems, as have a long list of developed countries. Inclusion in training and employment programs related to road works, such as labor-based techniques, as well as contracting and consulting are all instruments for creating gender inclusivity,

Rural Roads - A number of specific issues and problems have been identified respecting rural road infrastructure. These include: (a) unclear responsibilities with fragmented decision-making; (b) lack of legal framework for community ownership of roads and paths; (c) disintegration of planning systems with over-centralized decision-making, (d) inconsistent and uncoordinated planning and uneconomical allocation of financial resources; (e) insufficient and uncertain maintenance funding; (f) inadequate local capacity with a lack of incentives for local road staff; (g) weak private sector response and an urban resource bias; and (h) inappropriate technical standards for road design and technology. Resolution of these issues within a gender sensitive framework will require aggressive interventions. The underlying problems include weak local institutions, the need for an improved participatory processes, and the need for establishing a legal status for rural roads. Attention to options for management models are also required. However, whether: a central government rural roads department or some version of local government management including using contract management agencies, joint service committees, and/or private consultants is elected, solutions must be gender sensitive. Financing, which remains another key concern also needs to be gender sensitive, whether these include locally raised revenues, central-local fiscal transfers, road maintenance funds, donor/community/government and road fund financing. The past focus on roads had designers paying little attention to the transport patterns and mobility issues related to rural households and in particular women needs. This must be reversed. Rural roads need to be considered more as a pivotal network in the whole transport chain which relates to all other modes or transport sub-sectors. In this regard the inclusion of women as prime movers in this area needs to be considered more directly.

5. Recommendations

The Africa Transport Technical Notes presently do not display any gender sensitivity, even in those notes where gender figures prominently - such as with IMTs, T.A.s, etc. Implicit references do nothing to encourage Task Managers to embrace gender inclusion in their projects. There is an urgent need therefore to bring the issue of gender into the Bank's "public eye" by identifying gender concerns in transport notes, papers, etc. Demand and supply analyses, action planning, management interventions, framework development, monitoring and evaluation should all be gender sensitive. Some of the best ways to be ensure gender inclusivity is based on "common sense" approaches such as: (a) stipulating

that all data collected be done on a sex-desegregated basis; (b) that specific targets be set for women's participation at all levels, be it decision-making bodies, training programs, employment opportunities, etc; (c) demonstrating that gender has value-added through information dissemination, education/sensitivity programs, communication via female media, demonstration projects, etc; (d) developing appropriate "tools" for analysis, design and appraisal monitoring and evaluation which objectively illustrate gender benefits; (f) "institutionalizing" gender interventions in much the same way as was done with respect to environmental issues, by the creation of project categories for gender assessment; (g) putting in place protocols for Task Managers and also sanctions for failure to apply protocols; and (h) focusing on gender issues in macro-level transport planning, preparation of transport strategies and comprehensive development plans. Women's assets need to be exploited in transport planning and implementation, de-politicizing gender concerns and seeing them as economic imperatives, political necessities, and instruments for poverty reduction. Areas where gender sensitivity in transport are particularly useful include:

- A. *Planning and Setting Priorities for Gender Interventions.* Strengthening of institutional components through local participation, financial arrangements, monitoring, etc; improvement in appraisal technologies by refining consumer surplus approach, project screening mechanisms, social benefit estimations, and cost-effectiveness approaches of basic access; using integrated planning approaches in all transport investments, with particular attention to production issues, markets analyses and social impacts; decentralization of educational and health care facilities includes the planning for health care supplies.
- B. *Ensuring Law is not an Institutional Barrier to the Economic Empowerment of Women.* Transport deals directly with the regulatory environment and should take into consideration gender issues in the resolution of transport legislative concerns, etc.
- C. *Gender Participation in Decision-Making and Mobilization of the Masses.* This requires: gender inclusion in civic associations, local political organizations, rail passenger groups and boards, shippers councils, aviation corporations, road funds, environmental groups, etc; introduction of regional fair-share campaigns for public transport especially those servicing townships and rural areas; attention to pedestrian safety where over 50% of traffic fatalities involve pedestrians most of whom are women and children; structuring metropolitan planning and resource allocation frameworks to be gender inclusive and to recognize full fiscal, social and environmental costs of automobile/highway systems vis-à-vis transit-dependent systems; need for systematic gender inclusion procedures for transport in terms of training of professionals, participation of users, and design and planning of systems, services and equipment.
- D. *Labor-Based Methods for Road Works and Contracting for all Civil and Other Works Need to be Gender Inclusive.* The use of labor-based methodology for road works has been an important part of the strategy to improve rural transport in Africa for the past 25 years but there has been an obvious lack of attention to the inclusion of women.

Three specific reforms requiring attention include: greater participation of women in labor-based projects, identification of reliable funding for women as well as men; decentralized project administration using female foremen and managers as well as males. Labor-based methods can produce excellent results on even complicated projects as demonstrated by the following: Upper Ganges Canal, the first German Autobahns, the Trans-American Railway, and the Sahayak Canal. There is a need to expand labor-based road program reforms and interventions with particular attention to: labor laws to include women, design standards to include women's concerns, and training for women; Improved production arrangements and basic delivery mechanisms for expanding labor-based methods; improved dissemination of information concerning women's eligibility for employment and scarcity of forewomen; and provision of transport to work sites. With respect to contracting and the Bank's procurement methods, there is a need to integrate women more fully into the construction industry, encourage women contractors to compete, and introduce procurement guidelines which are gender sensitive and inclusive⁹.

The following tables identify those gender issues in transport of primary concern and outline the transport options for implementation in each sub-sector as relates to: (a) Bank projects, and (b) Bank staff.

A. Bank Transport Projects - all sub-sectors including: Road Transport/Rural/Urban, Rail, Ports/Harbors/Shipping/Ferries, Air/Aviation¹⁰.

| Applicable Categories | Gender Issues in Transport | Transport Options for Implementation |
|---|---|--|
| All sub-sectors | - Inclusion of females in planning and integrated decision-making through participatory processes | - Targeting female in decision-making bodies & building gender capacity at all levels of decision-making |
| All sub-sectors | - Increased sensitivity to gender issues of connectivity between sectors. | - Use integrated planning in sectors dependent on provision of transport; including agriculture, industry, service & tourism; as well as health, education, social services - Inclusion of specialists from other sectors related to transport, with equal opportunity & participation by both genders. |
| All sub-sectors | - Equal gender representation in government, councils, steering committees, project teams | - Targeting & capacity building in Dept's of Transport, plus specialized agencies & organizations focusing on transport as Road Fund, Shipping Councils, Rail Boards, Aviation Steering Committees, & Local, Municipal, Regional & Federal Gov't Dept's, Community Ass, etc. - Bank Project Teams to include WID/female transport specialists in-house, field missions or consultants.. |
| Roads, Rural Roads, Urban Transport, | - Increased mobility for females in all incomes using all transport modes, both private and | - Support of IMTs , traditional transport services, |

⁹ See Annex 1.

¹⁰ Refer to Annex 2.

| | | |
|-------------------------|--|--|
| Ferries | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> public - attention to non-traditional sectors, notably subsistence agriculture and the urban informal sector | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> best road design & appropriate motorized services - Public financing support, public subsidies, tax incentives - Reduce prices and increase supply of IMTs - Promote IMTs through mass media, demos, pilot projects, etc. and sensitize women on using IMTs - Develop gender oriented credit schemes |
| All sub-sectors | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increased female access to financing for both commercial and individual transport interventions | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - information dissemination & earmarking of funds for gender inclusion. |
| All sub-sectors | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Inclusion of gender needs assessments for all transport projects as appropriate | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - sex desegregated data by age |
| All sub-sectors | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Sensitivity to gender issues of affordability in cost recovery | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - judicious fare-setting with consideration given for inclusion of women in fare-setting to ensure compliance. |
| All sub-sectors | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - increased female employment as laborers & contractors in civil works - increased employment of females in operations & mangm't in public & privates sector enterprises. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - work-force analyses, utilization of labor-based methodologies, gender sensitive contracting processes. |
| All sub-sectors | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - due process & sensitivity in female termination, especially with public & private sector down-sizing | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - redundancy packages to include gender analyses. |
| All sub-sectors | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increased job training for women | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - targeting, particularly in areas of new technologies. |
| Maritime Sector | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Liberalization of trade and transport services to include women - Actions to inclusion gender sensitivity in projects. - Need for inland clearance depots (ICDs) and improved inland transport through the development of gender sensitive shipping markets, hubs around ports for onward distribution, employment and training of women in booking and shippers' councils and freight bureaus | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - gender conditionality in Bank loans - liberalization of sector, harmonized legislation with gender inclusivity - embrace all options of transport chain and liberalize sector in new policies to reflect gender needs - reform shippers councils to include gender representation - implement training programs and upgrade available human resources in the sector - Private/public sector partnerships to promote efficiency, certification, intermodal revolution and inclusion of gender - Inclusion of women in training programs associated with: containerization, advance cargo information systems, port, rail, road and lake tracker systems as well as tracker interface systems, terminal control, central logistics units |
| Urban Transport | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - most women still travel by foot, there is almost NO traffic facilities for pedestrians & non-motorized transport, services to take both types of travelers into consideration. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - surveys and sex-desegregated data will enable appropriate provisioning of transport for women. |
| Road Maintenance | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - include women in the consideration of programs to ensure minimal negative impact on off-road market settlements | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the principal policy implications relate to pivotal role of road maintenance & need for program focus on assisting women in off-road settlements, |

| | | |
|------------------------|--|---|
| | | both in terms of network & provision of transport services. |
| All sub-sectors | - Increased co-operation between males and females | - Sensitivity/awareness programs for both men and women. |

B. Bank Transport Staffing - all sub-sectors including: Roads, Rural Transport, Urban Transport, Rail, Ports/Harbors/Shipping/Ferries, Air/Aviation.

| Applicable Categories | Gender Issues in Transport | Transport Options for Implementation |
|------------------------------|--|---|
| All sub-sectors | Gender Transport specialist (GTS) | On all projects, either in-field or at HQ |
| All sub-sectors | Gender Impact assessments | Part of social impact and environmental assessments |
| All sub-sectors | equity in traditional transport staffing | Targeting of female participation - at least 25% of transport economists, engineers, financial analysts |
| All sub-sectors | cross-reference gender impacts | Requirement in transport projects |
| All sub-sectors | equity in procurement guidelines, including works, purchases, consulting | Re-assess procurement guidelines. |
| All sub-sectors | economic analysis expanded to include gender | Policy activity |

7. Next Steps

First - Need for clarity and depth in the identification of inter-related issues. Desegregation of data is one element, integrated planning including transport chain analysis is another. Inclusion of women at all levels of decision-making, training and employment is yet another.

Second - Need to build, especially at this stage, borrower conviction and awareness of the reality of the problem and of the benefits of solving it - in other words quantification of both the costs and benefits. Sensitivity and awareness programs is one way to address the issue. Also building up of methodologies for objective analysis is another.

Third - Need to prepare a mechanism for executing proposed actions or programs based on a will to act. Multi-disciplinary committees are one method, targeting is another, protocols and sanctions for non-inclusion is still another. This was done very successfully with environmental issues in the late eighties with the introduction of environmental categories for projects. Another approach would be the introduction of "voluntary codes of conduct".

Resources - a natural consequence of "reform" proposals such as this is the necessity to plan adequate resources for execution. A review of the resources allocated for tackling the "environmental" issues is an excellent starting point, as well as in-house Bank policies to more fully integrate women into Bank operations. In addition, the pervasive nature of the

proposed policy reforms is such that sustainable supervision will be required at the implementation stage. Develop women's budgets initiatives¹¹ .

Missing Bank Elements - the most important ones identified include: (a) in-sufficient in-house knowledge and capacity; (b) ineffective communication with clients and other financing institutions, donors as well as the private sector; (c) insufficient allocation of resources to do meaningful project and sector work; (d) excessive emphasis on theory at the expense of implementation of practical solutions, demonstrations, pilots and just generally, experience; (e) limited scope of transport sector work - the perennial funnel vision; (f) no champion of gender/transport monitoring and support, a need for a focal person to push the concept institution-wide; and (g) employment advertisements to indicate that "applications from female candidates are encouraged"¹²

Lending Implications - implementation of a program such as is recommended presupposes both active participation and follow up. The Bank could intervene in the form of a structural adjustment credit for the transport sector to finance technical assistance components, equipment, software, etc. but the subject is complex: (a) while some measures can be taken in the context of a transport project, others, particularly those having to do with financing and banks - involve other disciplines, hence a potential problem in project structuring; (b) present difficulties in developing countries are mostly managerial, but borrowers often attribute them to the absence of material means, as a result defining the components could pose difficulty.

Comprehensive Development Plan - this new initiative of the Bank is an attempt at integration of two specific concepts: country focus and integrated development planning. However, in its development there is no explicit attention to gender and the fear is that as a result gender will again be lost in the development spectrum. The following matrix offers some recommendations for more positive gender inclusion¹³ In transport projects.

| Select CDF Considerations | "Engendered" Considerations |
|--|---|
| 1. good and clean government | Gender-inclusive "voice", representation, accountability |
| 2. sound justice system | Gender bias in definition and/or application of law, complex relationships with custom and customary law, property and other rights and in recourse to the legal system. Cross-linkages with financial system, private sector promotion |
| 3. sound financial system | Gender-differentiated obstacles in access to financial services, access and outreach, inclusion of non-bank financial intermediaries, access to appropriate financial services. See above. |
| 4. safety net, social policies including employment policies | Gender-targeting with a focus on women as beneficiaries. Employment needs to take into account of non-market |

¹¹ As in South Africa. See Annex 3

¹² There are a number of institutions which actually post this in their advertisements. However these are mostly international organizations such as: WHO; Price/Waterhouse; ILO. African advertisements usually pre-suppose male candidates and often even use "he" as the operative word, none were identified as being encouraging or using even "he/she"

¹³ Gender and the CDF. Memo by C.M. Blackden 3/2/99

| | |
|---|--|
| | labor |
| 5. Roads, transport telecommunication | Gender-differentiated information which forms the basis of networking and power relations |
| 6. sustainable development, environment and culture | Pro-active gender inclusion |
| 7. rural strategy including integrated solutions | Mis-direction of assistance to agriculture, not reaching the real clients, technology, extension research are all male-focused |
| 8. urban strategy | Changing gender roles, household relations as assets |
| 9. private sector development | Gender-based solutions to entrepreneurship. |
| 10. country-specific "special considerations" | Pro-active "genderization" in political and economic circles including women's budget initiatives. |

Female Contractors

Discussions with women civil works contractors were held in Senegal, Cameroon, Ghana and South Africa. During these discussions a number of concerns were raised respecting the construction industry in the African countries, specifically as related to difficulties encountered by women contractors. The issues were based around the following topics:

- Medium-sized road construction firms owned and operated by women are experiencing difficulty in breaking into the business. The business is dominated by men who network very closely among themselves, and do not welcome female based contractors. In some cases male contractors under-price works just to win bids but then hire women contractors to do the jobs at a lower price and reduced profit. In addition, there is a perception problem for women in construction where male engineers openly discriminating in choice of contractors.
- One of the major constraints in growth of women's contracting firms concerns the lack of access to credit to purchase required equipment. Banks and credit institutions use much more stringent criteria in the case of women applicants and impose much higher interest rates on women clients, double or even triple that of their male counterparts. Attempts to purchase second hand or auctioned equipment have been disastrous because much of this equipment has been vandalized, often lacking main parts to function (such as engines or gears, etc.) and is therefore useless.
- Women have not organized themselves into any comparative associations or lobby groups, mainly because of a lack of support or assistance to show them how. There is a need for the introduction of a support system for women to assist in their competitiveness.
- Most of the projects which come up for bid are government projects which are financed traditionally by donors and development agencies. The findings of the women contractors is that the Bank's procurement process is not at all female friendly, with the bidding procedures needing a serious re-assessment; the issue of transparency needing significant review; the pre-qualification process amended to ensure equal access; information dissemination more female-friendly being; and training in the industry more open to women and in fact targeting women.

Recommendations:

To address the issues raised a number of recommendations are presented for consideration:

- Women are powerful in numbers or when they are associated as one entity. In order to penetrate the male-dominated construction sector they need to

organize themselves into lobbying groups and approach the issue aggressively. Individually they have limited leverage and often resort to "begging" for contracts, trying to cajole, be nice and too easily backing off. It is recommended that the Bank assist the women contractors to organize themselves into an association for the purpose of lobbying the government for improvements in the contracting industry which would enable them to participate more fully. Examples from other countries successful in setting up similar groups would be useful as would training in relevant approaches.

- It is recommended that the Bank consider, in their road projects, the creation of a line of credit (under US\$1.0 million) specifically focused on medium-sized women's contracting firms for purchases, management and training, and general improvements in their ability to compete in a male dominated environment. Projects could also include a special hire-purchase equipment clause for women in contracts to enable more equitable competition.
- In Bank procurement guidelines consideration should be given to a preference rating for women contractors or a target set for their participation in civil works and other procurement activities. Also consideration should be given to the setting of interest rate caps in on-lending for government projects to encourage more diversification, and female inclusion.
- South Africa has set up an "Emerging Contracts council" which assists new small contractors coming into the sector, specifically women, in training, classification and the securing of the first few contracts. This has worked wonders in establishing women contractors and could be used as a framework in other African countries.
- The South African Government has withdrawn from involvement in construction and development. They are more and more engaging in public-private partnerships (PPS) for these purposes. However the guidelines under which these PPSs operate are quite unique and bear consideration for Bank financing transport projects involving civil works, etc. Under the South African model the private sector must include, in its bid, social development and social empowering components from a minimum of 10% of project value. Evaluation criteria give heavy weight to this component - where winning bids are more often in the range of 30% for this activity. Women contractors figure heavily in this area.
- The South African approach to labor-based contracts is also interesting and should be analyzed for potential inclusion by the Bank. The premise is quite straight forward; labor-based contracts do not mean simply the placement of more workers on a job, but means transfer of knowledge to more workers. On the job training, classification of workers, and the attainment of technical certificates are all part of the program. Women in particular, but also men, have gained significantly from this system, where the development of these kinds of skills have greatly increased employability.

Checklist for Gender Intervention

| Category | Description |
|-------------------------------------|---|
| Desegregation of Data | - by gender and age. Include social and labor/workforce data, accident data, etc. |
| Gender Surveys | - carrying out of needs assessments, workforce analyses, O/D surveys, traffic demand modeling, etc. |
| Gender Capacity Building | - through participatory techniques, training and employment |
| Gender Integration | - sectorally; creation of multi-disciplinary teams; creation of gender sensitive project and financing teams including communities, NGOs, governments, donors |
| Information Distribution | - dissemination through use of multi-media and other female avenues. |
| Gender Targeting | - target percentages for female involvement in training and employment as well as identification, design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of projects and Technical Assistance. |
| Gender Transport Specialists | - inclusion of Gender Transport Specialists (GTS) in project teams as project staff and component managers. - identify a GTS to overview gender inclusivity in transport projects in Africa. Preference should be given to a woman. |
| Specialist Roster | - compile a roster of gender-transport specialists and Terms of Reference for Task Managers. |
| WID Project Categories | - creation of WID project categories similar to environmental categories, where Category "C" would pass on the basis of a WID no-objection; Category "B" would necessitate the inclusion of WID specialists on project teams; and Category "A" would require gender impact assessments. |
| "Genderize" Training | - prepare gender-oriented training programs in project components. - develop gender specific scholarships, apprenticeships and internships both in government and private sector institutions |
| Gender-Sensitive Financial Analyses | - review affordability issues in tariff-setting and cost-recovery options. |
| Gender Restrictive Environments | - in social contexts develop empowering programs for women within transport projects - create gender-sensitive and inclusive transport regulations, laws and legislation. |
| Bank Program | - prepare a 5-year targeting program both for projects and transport staff in the Bank. |
| Participatory Approach | -participatory involvement of women at all levels, from community councils, through local, municipal, regional and national governments, through road Funds, steering committees, shipping councils, rail boards, aviation boardrooms. |
| Pilots, Demos | -prepare pilot, demonstration projects to develop options and solutions to address gender needs and concerns in transport. - support non-traditional transport services, including IMTs and new technologies. |
| Gov't Dialogue | -enter dialogue with governments to identify incentives and tax breaks to encourage female mobility and increased involvement in economic activities. |
| Sensitivity programs | -develop sensitivity and awareness programs both with the Bank and with borrowers to commit the sector to full gender integration. - develop sensitivity and awareness training programs for both men and women, both within and outside the Bank. |
| Procurement Guidelines | - review procurement guidelines to ensure gender sensitivity |
| Construction Industry/Labor-Based | - assess construction industry, in particular labor-based operations and women contractors participation rate to tailor a program to increased gender participation in the sector. |

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Programs | - encourage labor-based techniques in construction works. |
| Affirmative Action Plan | - prepare Affirmative Action Plans for projects and programs in transport sectors where need is identified. |
| Bank Conditionality | -create applicable conditionality in Bank projects to encourage borrower and Bank commitment to gender inclusion. |

Tools to Engender National Budgets

1. **Gender-desegregated beneficiary assessments** to assess the views of women and men as potential beneficiaries of public expenditure on how far current forms of service delivery meet their needs.
2. **Gender-desegregated public expenditure incidence analysis** to investigate the extent to which degree women, girls and boys, benefit from expenditure on publicly provided services.
3. **Gender-desegregated policy evaluations of public expenditure** to evaluate the policies that underlie budget appropriations in terms of their likely impact on men and women.
4. **Gender aware budget statements** to indicate the expected implications for gender inequality of the expenditure estimates in total and by Ministry.
5. **Gender-desegregated analysis** of interactions between financial and time budgets to understand the implications of the national budget for household time budgets, to reveal the macroeconomic implications of unpaid work in social reproduction.
6. **Gender-aware medium-term economic policy scenarios** to produce a policy framework which recognizes that women and men participate in economic activity in different ways, contribute in different ways to macroeconomic outcomes, and experience different costs and benefits from macroeconomic policies.¹⁴

¹⁴ Elson 1997, Demery 1996, and Esim 1995.

Bibliography

A. Country-Transport Sector Notes:

- Benin - Transport Sector Strategy
- Burkina Faso - Country Assistance Strategy: Transport Sector Concept Paper
- Cameroon - Transport Sector Strategy Note
- Chad - Sector Note and Issues Paper - Transport
- Cote d'Ivoire - Concession du Train Urban: Processus de Selection du concessionnaire (structuration de l'appel d'offres)
- Cote d'Ivoire - transport Sector Strategy
- Ghana - transport Sector Strategy
- Guinea - Preparation de la Note Sectorielle des Transports
- Mali - Transport Sector Strategy
- Niger - Transport Sector Strategy
- Nigeria - Transport Sector
- Rwanda - transport Sector Strategy Note
- Sierre Leone - Transport Sector Strategy
- Senegal - Transport Sector Strategy
- Togo - Transport Sector Strategy

B. Africa Transport Sector Strategy Papers:

- Strategy for the Port and Maritime Sub-sectors
- Air Transport Strategy for Sub-Saharan Africa
- Rural Roads and Transport Strategy for Sub-Saharan Africa
- Strategy for the Rail Sub-Sector in Sub-Saharan Africa

C. Gender and Transport Projects and Studies

- Bangladesh: Women's Mobility and Implications for Rural transport Studies.
- India: A Study of Three Forest Economies. Villages in Bihar State and Women's Transport Needs.
- Zimbabwe: management and Design of Low-Cost Transport Devices project.
- Nepal: Rural transport Study.
- Malawi: transport information System Preparation Project.
- Uganda: Boda-Boda Taxi Service Study.
- Papua New Guinea. Accelerating Agricultural Growth. An Action Plan. Report # 16737-ONG. IBRD. June 1997
- Mozambique. Country Assistance review. OED Report #17209. December 1997
- Ghana: The Commercial Use of Non-Motorized Transport: Evidence from Accra. Transportation research Board. January 1996
- Morocco: Impact Evaluation Report - Socioeconomic Influence of Rural Roads (Fourth Highway Project - Ln 2254-MOR). June 1996

D.Publications (Articles & Books)

- Project Approval Document on a proposed Learning and Innovation Lending Credit to the Islamic republic of Mauritania for a Nutrition, Food Security and Social Mobilization Project. February 16, 1999. Report #8535-MAU
- IK Notes. Village Bankers: The Experience of Fandene (Senegal). No. 6. March 1999.
- Interview with Karen Overton Re: Mozambique Rural Women's Association project.
- Africa Transport Technical Notes (SSATP):
 - April 1996
 - A new Generation of Road Funds to the Rescue of African Roads. May 1997
 - Privately Financed Road Infrastructure. A Concession Company's Point of View. December 1996.
 - Restructuring Highway Agencies - The FinnRa Case: Options for Africa. August 1998.
 - Developing Africa's Transport. February 1998
 - Developing Africa's transport. February 1998
- SSATP Working Papers:
 - Promoting Intermediate Means of transport. Working Paper #20. October 1996
 - The Provision of Rural transport Services. Working Paper #37. April 1998
 - Trade and transport in West and Central African States. Round Table. Cotonou, Benin. Working Paper #30. June 1997
 - Trade and transport Facilitation. Review of Current Issues and Operating Experiences. Working Paper #27. June 1996
 - The Institutional and Financial Framework of Rural transport Infrastructure. Working Paper #17. April 1997
 - The urban Transport 1998-2002 Strategy Development Plan. P.Bultynck. Working Paper # 35. September 1998
- Developing Sustainable Toll Road Concessions in South Africa. M.F. Mitchell
- Sustainable Transport - Cycle Rickshaw Revival. No.9. Fall 1998
- Sustainable Transport. No.7. Winter 1997
- The LifeRider. Riders for Health Newsletter. Spring 1999.
- Design and Approval of Rural transport Infrastructure. Basic Access for the Poor. IBRD. TWUTD March 1999.
- Carriers of Culture: Women as a Means of Transport in Urban Accra, Ghana. Development Management. University of London 1998.
- Users Not Losers: Gender Representation in Transport design and Operation. Development Management. University of London. 1998
- Expanding Labor-Based Methods for Road Works in Africa. World Bank Technical Paper #347. E. A. Stock, J. de Veen. October 1996
- Options for Managing and Financing Rural transport Infrastructure. World Bank Technical Paper #411. Christina Malmberg Calvo. 1998
- International Forum for Rural Transport and Development. Report 1996-1998
- Women and Labor-Based Road Works in Sub-Saharan Africa. IHE Working Paper IP-4. ILO regional Seminar for the Road Sector. J. Howe, D.F. Bryceson

- Initial progress in Addressing Gender Issues in the Work of the Africa Region. IBRD technical Note. December 1991
- Driving Towards Sustainable development. IRU 1996
- Lessons and Practices. OED Precip:
 - From Foodline to Lifeline: Rural Roads in Morocco. #119. June 1996
 - Urban Transport. #11. November 1997
 - Ports. #9. June 1996
- Social Assessment: Identification of Urban transport Priorities in the Kyrgyz Republic. Social Development Notes #45. December 1998
- African Rural Households and transport: Reducing the Burden on Women. IHE Working Paper IP-2. J. Howe, D.F. Bryceson. July 1992
- Electric transport and Electric Vehicle development at EDF, the French National Electric Utility. CAB 10/98
- Economic Cost of Barriers to Road Transport. Hague Consulting Group. IRU 1998
- Gender, Growth and Poverty Reduction. Special Program of Assistance for Africa 1998 Status Report on Poverty. C.M. Blackden, C.Bhanu. World Bank Technical Paper #428
- Globalization, privatization and Modernization: Effects on Port Labor. World Bank Transport Expo. Washington April 12-16 1999
- The Impact of Road Construction on Women's Trade in Nigeria. Journal of Transport Geography. G. Porter. 1995
- An Agrarian Continent in Transition: Rural Labor, Market Expansion and Service Infrastructure in Africa. IHE. J. Howe, D.F. Bryceson. IP-9. April 1995