

The Building Bridges: A Review of Infrastructure Services Projects Addressing Gender Integration

Prepared for WID and Gender Equity Division
Policy Branch, CIDA

by
Barbara McCann, McCann Consulting
January 1998

3. TRANSPORTATION

This chapter covers a range of projects in the transportation sub-sector. The two China Projects are good examples of partners sharing responsibility to ensure equal opportunities in training for women. At each step, the CEA and its counterparts undertook a systematic analysis of where women were working and devised an approach to improve the areas of difficulty.

In the Bangladesh project there was a concerted effort to determine target groups and identify areas of weakness in working with the local government councils to ensure women are included at each step. In the Tanzanian example, a set amount of funding was designated from the inception stage for WID activities - not a very common practice - and it took several years before those funds were utilized. This is an example of a partner organization and the CEA not supporting the gender strategy. In the Vietnam example, while there is sex-disaggregated data on training provided, there is no indication of the actual number of training days/months provided and it is therefore not possible to get a clear indication of female participation beyond numbers.

The emphasis is mainly on women's employment and training opportunities in all projects, except in the Rural Maintenance Program in Bangladesh, which addresses other issues such as sustainable livelihoods. This type of analysis, which examines all angles of a project, has the potential to identify new and creative opportunities for integrating gender into infrastructure projects.

There are currently three major CIDA transportation projects in China, two of which are reviewed below. While these projects are separate, there are some commonalities in the approach to integrate WID and Gender Equality. In addition, the same institutions, and staff within those institutions, are involved in various aspects of both projects, including monitoring, which provides a good opportunity for exchange of information and experience.

3.1 Comprehensive Transport Management Training Project (CTMTP), China

The purpose of this project is to provide management training and technical assistance in comprehensive transportation planning and analysis to Chinese personnel in the transportation sector. This includes support for: 1) work placements; seminars/workshops; and study courses/tours to improve the human resources development of the Chinese transportation sector; 2) technical assistance; 3) feasibility studies and case studies on specific industry-related problems; and 4) teaching aids and equipment.

The underlying principles that formed the basis of this project include:
9. the multiplier effect: skills upgrading for staff to be carried out in such a manner that the trained staff in turn will become trainers;

Women's Issues in Community Management of Water and Sanitation Facilities (May 1994)
Key issues

- planning service levels

- affordability and tariff setting
- women in decision-making
- training needs to enhance women's roles and maximize their benefits
- sensitizing men to women's issues
- communication among men and women on water supply and sanitation activities
- choosing technologies and water sources
- operation and maintenance
- financial management

Recommendations

Future training efforts should:

- * start with the attitudes and emotional basis of gender issues
 - * review how these affect the pursuit of practical and strategic needs
 - * review specifically how water and sanitation management is pursued
10. flexibility: this is a requirement and the outputs of the project must meet the users' needs;
11. relevance: training in Canada is to be focused, industry-specific where applicable and provided in both a work-related environment and academic institutions; and
12. integration of women: *"Both countries agreed that to the extent possible, women would be involved as trainers (Canadian) and trainees (Chinese) on the project. The CEA and participating line agencies agreed on specific targets for the involvement of women in the project at the Inception Report Stage".*

Both the management plan and inception mission discussions reiterated the importance of the participation of women, stating that they would have equal consideration in the training programs. Canada's requirements for female participation for programs in both Canada and China were that 25% of all trainees with the Chinese Ministry of Communications and 30% of all trainees with the Chinese State Planning Commission (SPC) and its agencies be female. Canada also stipulated specific numbers of females attached to specific training activities by person-months. The inception report also indicated that the CEA was prepared to recommend to CIDA a delay or reduction in the training if the agreed quota on women was not met. The training is wide-ranging and includes such issues/areas as: senior management training; container transportation; inter-modal transportation; quality management; analysis and evaluation methodologies; creating a comprehensive national transport database; highway and bridge database, evaluation and management systems. There are many participating organisations, both in China and Canada, drawing from government ministries, state/private enterprises, research institutions, and universities and colleges.

On the Canadian management team, the project is led by a female project manager, and other key positions in the CEA, including the human resources development training specialist and the workplace training specialist, are also women. The curriculum development specialist was tasked with the responsibility of incorporating the WID component. The China project coordinator is female and comes from within SPC.

An analysis of the situation of women in China was carried out for the inception report, including a workforce analysis of female participation in railways, highways, waterways, aviation, handling and pipelines. In addition, sex-disaggregated information was sought on labour participation in the Chinese partner organisations and related bodies. There were also consultations with other donors concerning the role of women and transportation in China.

Each of the monitoring reports indicates clearly the percentage of men and women participants, the number of person-months and location of training. Originally, the CEA indicated cumulative figures on progress reports, but on the recommendation of the monitoring firm, and approved by the Joint Project Steering Committee, these figures are now broken down by SPC and MOC participants. This has helped to identify more potential difficulties, including the process of and control over selection and availability of candidates.

Targets for female participation were originally based on staff levels in Beijing, which were higher than the provinces. This was noted and adjustments were made, including advertisements for the training program which encouraged women to apply.

Results to the last completed fiscal year of 1996/97 indicate that the total number of Chinese women trained in Canada was 16.5% and in China, 22%. In addition, the total training days completed by women in Canada was 18.3% and in China it was 30.3% overall. There was detailed information on the occupations, departments and agencies of all trainees. The only two areas of training in which women have not been represented is the container transport and the highway/bridge assessment programs.

It has been noted that upon their return to China, women have considerable opportunities for advancement and in some cases are entering the private sector where their newly acquired skills are in great demand. In addition, it has been observed that they seem to do better at developing and improving English language skills than the male participants. While there are no firm statistics available at this time, follow-up is being done with the training participants in terms of their current work placements, promotions and use of their training skills.

3.2 Civil Aviation Transport Training Project, China

The purpose of this project is to increase the managerial, planning and operational capacity of China's civil aviation organization by: 1) strengthening the Civil Aviation Management Institute (CAMI); 2) providing technical assistance to Zhejiang Airlines (ZAL); and 3) providing navigation equipment to Zhujiajian Airport (ZJJ). The 1995 inception mission in 1995 dealt firstly with the CAMI. On that mission, 3 of the 5 participants were women - 2 training specialists (in Canada and in China) and a curriculum development specialist.

It was established very early that women would be involved as trainers and trainees, both on the Canadian and Chinese sides, *"to the target levels mutually agreed by the participating agencies"*. Since CAMI already had a 57% female teaching faculty, a target of 50% for in-Canada training activities was achievable. There were three target groups: the instructors of CAMI, the Diploma students of CAMI, and employees of the Civil Aviation Association of China or its affiliated enterprises. Selection criteria for candidates taking training in China would be adapted for each group. For CAMI diploma students, preference would be given to female candidates when similarly qualified candidates were eligible and met all the qualifications.

It was recognized that the distribution of women at middle and senior management positions throughout the aviation sector was uneven, making it difficult to find qualified female candidates. To determine the male/female distribution of workers, a survey of potential candidates for in-Canada training was carried out among employees at CAMI and Zhejiang Airlines. For example, at CAMI, only 1% of those studying airport management were female and at ZAL, there were no women in senior management. However, the Chinese partners agreed that they would endeavour to include as many women as possible in all aspects of the project. It was recognized that adjustments in the targets might have to be made as the data base was improved and better analyzed each year. Targets for female and male participation were set for all training activities: female trainers for the in-Canada training was set at 40% and female trainers for the in-China training was set at 25%, based on available data and areas of training needs.

3.3 Tanzania Railway Corporation Locomotive Assistance and Training

CIDA is helping the Tanzania Railway Corporation (TRC) increase its capacity to maintain its locomotive fleet through the provision of equipment, technical assistance, services, monitoring, and training. As part of the CEA's training budget, an important decision was made that not only identified the need to integrate women more fully in the training program, but actually set aside specific funds for this activity which were non-transferrable.

This was the first time gender issues had been specifically supported in the many years CIDA had worked with TRC. No other donor, including the World Bank, had addressed gender issues as part of their analysis of human resource needs and changes. It was potentially an important initiative, but presented a great challenge within the context of the male culture that predominates in transportation sectors.

As part of the 1992 inception mission, the CEA hired a gender specialist with experience in infrastructure projects to identify the long- and short-term goals in the gender-related aspects of the project. As part of the Inception Report, a WID Affirmative Action Plan was developed. There were a number of delays in implementing the proposed WID section of the report by the CEA and TRC, and no action was taken.

Eighteen months later, further refinements were made by the gender specialist, including the provision of list of appropriately qualified local consultants to carry out the newly revised plan; expanding on the "bridging" course content; incorporating the reporting of WID issues into the project steering committee meetings; and examining other aspects of training for areas where WID considerations should be better integrated. Priority actions, both long- and short-term, were recommended. There were further delays and no local hiring took place as was recommended, nor did TRC management respond to the recommendations.

Another proposal was developed by the WID desk officer in the Manpower Division at TRC and the CEA and approved in 1995. At this point, no funds had been spent from the original allocation. More resources were put into training, with no gender survey to be carried out. It was decided public education and role modeling would be left to other unspecified CIDA projects. The money for the proposed bridging courses would be *"better utilized providing additional specialized training to TRC ladies with high potential"*. The proposal outlined the training needs of 20 of the 41 female senior supervisory staff. These employees represented 7% of the total number of women working at TRC. Twenty five percent of the women working at TRC hold the lowest grades in the organization's structure, and overall, women make up only 5% of the total labour force.

To date, a number of women from TRC have received training or are now scheduled to receive training in Canada and Tanzania in management information systems, computer applications and freight forwarding. Some will have practical training placements in a range of organisations in Canada. Another woman is completing a B. Engineering at Dar Es Salaam University, while two others are scheduled to do advanced degrees in labour studies. An extension of the funding for the WID-specific program was requested by the CEA and approved by CIDA. It is now anticipated that all 20 women supervisors will be given either long-term or short-term training.

3.4 Rural Maintenance Program Phase III, Bangladesh

The Rural Maintenance Program (RMP) was initially developed in 1983 to establish a routine maintenance system for earthen farm-to-market roads. The RMP hires destitute women to form its work crews - women who are divorced, widowed or abandoned and serve as the sole supporters of their dependents.

Over 61,500 women had improved their standard of living through employment opportunities by the end of Phase II (1995). This phase went beyond a simple infrastructure project to address the needs of the participants for sustainable livelihoods. It piloted efforts to "graduate" RMP crew women from the program through training and other follow-up activities. It developed modules for providing crew women with basic life skills and training in financial management, including investment, recurring costs, savings and profit. Women attended these sessions during their fourth year as crew members, just prior to their release from the RMP. By the end of Phase II, over 20,000 women had graduated from the program.

However, attempts to institutionalize the project within the Government of Bangladesh has met with some problems. In addition, its success was hampered by the perception of local government officials and most crew members that the RMP was a women's relief program rather than a road maintenance program. This was changed when responsibility for the program was moved from the Directorate of Relief and Rehabilitation to the Local Government Engineering Department (LGED) of the Ministry of Local Government, Rural Development and Cooperatives.

The goal of Phase III is to contribute to the long-term economic growth and development of the rural areas of Bangladesh. Phase III incorporates both road maintenance activities through the "Road Maintenance Component" (RMC) and the "Income Diversification Component" (IDC). The purpose of this phase is to provide the necessary skills to women so that when they leave the project they can earn a living and not return to destitution, as well as assist in the development of a sustainable system for cost-effective road maintenance by women.

In terms of the IDC, an independent review has confirmed that 70% of the program's graduates have not returned to destitution. To help in determining the impact of the project, the original baseline study This survey clearly defined what constitutes "poverty" for the purposes of this project, an important step in measuring impact. of the quality of life of participants has been updated, including data on food intake, marital status, age, number of dependents, education levels, and ownership of various assets.

The management of the RMC has also evolved. Its monitoring and supervision approach has changed from assessing the number of hours worked to a performance-based model that measures the output of the work crew | now referred to as a Road Maintenance Association (RMA) | over a given time frame. Under this model, all workers are treated equally and benefit equally from a strong work performance. Working as a

group, the RMA undertakes its own micro-management, meets regularly, solves internal problems, and is responsible to the local authorities as a group, thus reducing the vulnerability of individual members. Work is now easily measurable and standardized and more quality assured.

The turnover of RMC from CARE, the original executing agency, to LGED as defined by the "Transition Plan" is proving difficult for LGED, which is struggling to incorporate the various training modules, including the design and introduction of a Gender Training Module. Phase III also calls for the transition of the IDC to a Bangladeshi organization, but the most appropriate model for this transition has not been determined. While considerable results have been achieved to date, the challenge of Phase III is to attain long-term financial and managerial sustainability. Ownership needs to be internalized into the government's structures at all levels, from the unions to the central levels of LGED.