

Annex 4:

REPORT ON THE GRTT WORKSHOP HELD AT MANDEL TRAINING CENTRE, MARLBOROUGH, HARARE: ON 7-8TH NOVEMBER 2000

Introduction

The MLGPWNH¹ (responsible for promoting RTT² projects), and MYDGEC³ (housing the national machinery for the advancement of women), jointly hosted the workshop. The workshop served three purposes, namely:

- ◆ To feed back to and solicit comments on the second Draft Report from
 - Respondents (mostly representatives of donor agencies) who had earlier been interviewed for information for the first Draft Report
 - Members of the Gender Forum (mostly NGOs co-ordinated by UNIFEM, Harare) whose comments on the first Draft Report were incorporated in the second Draft Report.
- ◆ To provide an opportunity for relevant Government departments and NGOs to comment on the second Draft Report as the final input to the study. (It had been difficult to secure interviews with the relevant Government departments to collect data for the first draft report).
- ◆ To identify priority issues in GRTTP⁴ and come up with a Plan of Action and an institutional framework for the implementation of the Plan of Action. The issues were identified from
 - The analysis of gender issues in RTT in Zimbabwe
 - The analysis of gender gaps in current RTT interventions in Zimbabwe.

Below is a summary of the proceedings of the workshop.

Preliminaries

After self-introductions, Mrs E Madziva of the Ministry of Local Government, Public Works and National Housing delivered the welcoming address.

Participants' Expectations

Participants stated their expectations about the workshop as summarised in point form below.

- ▶ Come up with contribution to national policy on RTT - currently there is too much fragmentation
- ▶ Way forward on (implementable) gender issues
- ▶ Share experience on how to improve rural transport especially for women
- ▶ Implementable action plan for gender and RTT
- ▶ Better understanding of gender and RTT programme
- ▶ Ability to relate RTT to gender
- ▶ Sharing findings from the study and how they will relate to other countries and a way forward for Zimbabwe

¹ Ministry of Local Government, Public Works & National Housing

² Rural Travel & Transport

³ Ministry of Youth Development, Gender & Employment Creation

⁴ Gender in Rural Travel & Transport

- ▶ Identifying economic empowerment strategies for women
- ▶ Insight into incorporating gender in the transport sector and Local Authority RTT programmes
- ▶ Progress since formulation of RTTP programme and introduction of gender into RTT
- ▶ Update on RTTP and gender dimension
- ▶ Linkages between Zimbabwe Trust poverty study and current study
- ▶ Learn from experienced participants
- ▶ Relationship between RTT and gender
- ▶ Pick up best practices for replication in work
- ▶ Clearer understanding of issues in RTT and how they differ from conventional transport programmes
- ▶ How findings compare with findings elsewhere
- ▶ How study can be used for transport and RTT programme planning
- ▶ Recommendations to guide Steering Committee on RTT
- ▶ Link between Gender, GRTI and RTT
- ▶ Using gender strategies to reduce poverty
- ▶ Using recommendations for planning "Way Forward"

Workshop objectives

Ms P.Maramba explained the purpose/objectives of the workshop and suggested that the aims of the workshop would address only some rather than all of the above expectations. She explained that the workshop focused on gaps in the report "Gender issues in RTT in Zimbabwe". The study provides an overview of the gender issues in RTT in Zimbabwe and the extent to which RTT interventions addressed accessibility constraints on women. As such, the study was not an in-depth "evaluation". Another aim was to identify gender issues in RTT that needed immediate attention and a plan of action to address the issues.

World Bank; DGF; GRTTI; RTTP and RTT

To unravel these acronyms, Ms Maramba elaborated the background to the study on "Gender in Rural Travel and Transport (RTT) in Zimbabwe". She explained how the World Bank, through the Development Grant Facility (DGF), facilitated the Gender and Rural Travel and Transport Initiative (GRTTI) to strengthen the gender perspective in Rural Travel and Transport Programmes (RTTP) in six African countries including Zimbabwe. The above-named study is one of the activities undertaken in Zimbabwe and other African countries.

What is Gender?

P.Maramba facilitated the discussion on the following concepts:

- Sex Vs.Gender
- Social identity
- Division of labour
- Access to and control
- Misconceptions about gender - i.e. seen as synonymous with women
- WID and GAD

It became apparent that the majority of the participants needed gender awareness training in order to acquire a working knowledge of the subject.

Study findings on Gender issues in RTT in Zimbabwe

By means of transparencies, Mr. Tichagwa presented a summary of the study findings on gender in RTT in Zimbabwe. The study relied on secondary sources such as GoZ/Sida/ILO (1997), IFRTD (1999) and others. Key findings were:

PATTERNS OF RTT IN ZIMBABWE

- Over 90% of RTT activities take place in and around the homestead, within a radius of 4 km.
- Over 80% of RTT activities are around subsistence activities such as trips to the grinding mill and clinic, fetching water and firewood and transporting crops from the field to the homestead.
- The bulk of transportation is by head loading.
- Women and children are responsible for over 80% of the RTT activities.

GENDER ISSUES IN RTT IN ZIMBABWE

(a) Community / household level

- Women are responsible for the bulk of RTT burden. This is because the bulk of RTT activities relate to the reproductive roles of women - fetching water and firewood, taking children to the clinic, producing food etc.
- Ownership and use of intermediate means of transport (IMTs) by women is very limited. Most households do not have IMTs, and most of the existing IMTs belong to men and women and men use the IMTs mainly to transport produce from fields to the homestead and/or to the market.
- Gender inequalities in the division of labour, access to and control over resources and in gender relations of power combine and perpetuate the above gender inequalities in the share of the RTT burden.

(b) Practitioners' level - (practitioners include transport operators, technology designers, planners and implementers):

- Transport operators do not view women as a special market with special transport needs. For this reason, women producers selling in the informal market have to use buses or hitchhike in the back of a lorry to take produce to the market in urban areas.
- Most labour saving tools and implements are designed by men, mainly for men's tasks. Hence, most technologies are bought by men, for use by men. For example, although carts are suited to transporting water and firewood, women rely mainly on head loading.
- Planners and implementers use economic cost-benefit analyses to make investment decisions. In RTT, this approach marginalises women's reproductive activities since these are "social" and not "economic".

(c) Policy-makers' level

- Zimbabwe has no policy on rural transport. For this reason, macro-level economic planning does not cater for RTT needs and priorities in a consistent and sustained manner.
- Zimbabwe has no national gender policy. For this reason, the provision of roads and transport services does not address gender issues in RTT.

- National policies and development plans are not as integrated as they should be for a co-ordinated and holistic approach to providing services to the communities. For this reason, the provision and location of social infrastructure and services, e.g. in education and healthcare, does not account for local mobility and accessibility needs.

After the presentation, each participant received a copy of the summarised report.

Group Work: "Missing Gender Issues in RTT"

The participants went into three groups to identify "*missing gender issues*" that should also be included in the final report on "*Gender in RTT in Zimbabwe*". The following issues emerged from the groups (combined):

MISSING GENDER ISSUES

- ▶ The need to establish woodlots and water points near homesteads - since the firewood and water account for bulk of RTT activities.
- ▶ Provision of alternative sources (of finance)
- ▶ Lack of organisation at local level (voluntary programmes)
- ▶ Lack of gender awareness among transport operators
- ▶ Facilities that are not user-friendly e.g. suspension footbridges
- ▶ Direct education for men - they must share RTT burden with women
- ▶ Involvement of male and female children and youth in RTT as part of their social education.
- ▶ The need to include traditional leaders (the custodians of the culture that creates gender inequalities in RTT activities) in gender awareness raising
- ▶ The need to include male-dominated centres of power in gender awareness raising. The process at present is biased towards females
- ▶ Awareness raising on gender issues in RTT
- ▶ Participation of both women and men in research and implementation (feedback) and in labour based works - important gender lessons can be learned by the community.
- ▶ The need to address problems with public transport services - inadequacy, time-tabling and poor inter-district linkages
- ▶ Need to amend Local Authority regulations that prohibit siting of facilities (grinding mills, business centres) in the villages.
- ▶ Importance of feeder roads for produce marketing and inputs procurement
- ▶ Importance of Rural Depots

GENDER IN CURRENT RTT INTERVENTIONS

Mr.Tichagwa presented a summary overview of current RTT interventions and an analysis of their gender impacts as follows:

FORMAL INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECTS

Interventions in this category included the following:

- ◆ Traditional road construction and maintenance approach. In this approach, Central Government is directly responsible for the provision and maintenance of trunk and feeder roads.
- ◆ Labour based road construction, rehabilitation and maintenance. These were piloted to demonstrate an alternative and cost-effective mechanism

for road maintenance. A target in the project is to achieve a 50% female representation among the forepersons and manual labourers.

- ◆ Small-Scale Contractor Project. These are piloted to demonstrate the cost-effectiveness of providing essential rural infrastructure through the private sector. This is in line with the reform policy of disengaging Government from work that could be more efficiently done by the private sector. The project also has a target of 50% female representation among contractors and among workers on the road gangs.

The study judged these as having little relevance to the RTT needs of villagers. They are designed to facilitate outward-bound transport services. This addresses only a small proportion of the villagers' RTT needs - procurement of inputs and marketing of produce. From a gender perspective:

- Improved roads attract transport service providers, especially bus operators, and thus improves access to urban destinations
- Improved roads also facilitate establishment of shops along the improved roads. Women have easier access to essential groceries such as sugar, salt, paraffin, maize-meal etc
- Women employed on road gangs earn income with which they start income-generating activities. This strengthens their survival strategies. Some women have also bought durable assets with their wages.
- In terms of the RTT burden and its gender distribution, the roads have little or no impact.

INFORMAL INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECTS

Interventions in this category include the construction, operation and maintenance of footpaths, tracks and footbridges. These are implemented in the three districts of Chipinge, Rushinga and Zaka. The study findings were that:

- The projects went a long way towards meeting local mobility needs. That is, movement in space was now easier and smoother.
- The improved paths and tracks facilitated use of IMTs especially wheelbarrows and carts where bad terrain prevented their use before. From this perspective, the RTT burden has been lightened.
- The improved paths and tracks enabled the target groups - women and men - to carry out their RTT activities more smoothly.
- However, the gender distribution of the RTT burden remains unchanged. Women and men still perform their traditional gender roles and associated RTT activities. I.e. women remain accountable for the bulk of the RTT activities / burden.

RLF FOR PURCHASING INTERMEDIATE MEANS OF TRANSPORT (IMTs)

IMTs are low-cost means of transport e.g. wheelbarrows, pushcarts, ox-carts etc. The IMTs lighten the RTT burden, thus allowing bigger loads to be transported over a shorter time than before. In the project in Chipinge, Rushinga and Zaka, access to the IMTs is via the revolving loan fund (RLF).

Credit is available to those who are up-to-date with their Development Levy payments to the RDC. The study findings were as follows:

- The target is that 51% of the beneficiaries of the RLF should be women. The project is on course towards meeting this target. However, there are no special provisions or "enabling strategies" to ensure that the most vulnerable groups e.g. the poor and female heads of household have access to the RLF.
- The RLF addresses the women's strategic gender need (SGN) to own IMTs. (However, some issues could not be established in the study, namely:
 - What particular types of IMTs are the women buying?
 - On what RTT activities are the IMTs used?
 - Do women have complete control over the IMTs at household level?)
- Overall however, the intervention focuses on meeting practical gender needs (PGNs), i.e. lightening the RTT burden within the context of traditional gender roles. There is no attention to the need to re-distribute those roles and associated RTT activities between women and men. That is, the SGNs are neglected.

Overall, the above interventions do not address the gender relations of power that give rise to gender inequalities in the division of labour and in the share of the RTT burden. They address only practical gender needs that lighten the burden of gender roles and neglect the strategic gender need of redistributing the roles and RTT burden equally between women and men. Thus, women remain accountable for the bulk of the RTT burden.

Reducing the RTT burden enables women and men to save time on RTT and spend it in productive activities to increase productivity and income and to reduce poverty. However, within the traditional gender division of labour, greater productivity also means there are more goods for women to transport. Hence, it is important not only to lighten but also to redistribute the RTT burden equitably between women and men.

Group Work: "Gaps in current RTT interventions"

Participants went into groups to:

1. Identify the gaps in the gender analysis of the RTT interventions
2. Come up with suggestions/project proposals to address the gaps

The table below summarises the results of the group work (combined). The use of a small font size helps to present the table on one page.

Gap	Intervention/Project
1. Credit facility usually controlled by men	1. Empower women through: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▶ Awareness campaign ▶ Access to decision-making positions in the management of the credit facility
2. RLF excludes own consumption needs - leads to misuse of credit	2. At least 15% of loan value to be included for own consumption needs
3. DDF has no money and no capacity	3. Secure more donor funds
4. Control/ownership of assets (by men)	4-5. Create awareness through workshops, seminars and meetings, targeting villagers, youth, traditional leaders and policy-makers
5. Decision-making (by men)	6-7. Put policies in place and incorporate gender issues. Address bureaucratic tendencies
6. Inadequacies in the Transport Act	
7. absence of a Gender Policy	8. Develop appropriate curricula after consultation with all stakeholders
8. Absence of gender issues in primary school curricula	9. Participatory approaches in policy formulation, project design and evaluation
9. Lack of participation	10. RDCs to formulate gender sensitive policies and by-laws and criteria for selecting transport operators
10. Lack of appropriate by-laws	11. Clarify ownership of the programme for assured sustainability. Allocate adequate funds to address issues of poverty
11. Ownership of the gender programme is ill-defined	
12. No gender policy	12. Develop gender policy
13. No gender conscious transport policy	13. Develop a gendered transport policy
14. Inadequate coverage and depth of gender awareness campaigns	14. Coverage to include policy-makers, RDCs, community, community leaders. Adequate training of facilitators
15. Poor settlement and infrastructure planning	15. Gender sensitive settlement plans
16. Inadequate consultations with communities	16. PRAs
17. Environmental awareness - indiscriminate tree cutting	17. Awareness campaigns; development of IMTs

Priority Issues

In a plenary session, Ms.Maramba asked the participants to identify, from the "gaps" listed above, the priority issues that needed urgent attention. The table below presents the resultant list after a lengthy discussion.

Priority Issues
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A Gender Policy 2. A Transport Policy 3. Gender & RTT awareness raising 4. Research on RTT-related issues 5. Review of RDC Strategic Plans and RDC Gender Syllabus 6. Capacity building: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Microfinance - technical services/backstopping - planning - infrastructure provision and maintenance

Plan of Action

The facilitator asked the participants to rank the issues in their relative order of importance, and to present them in the form of a Plan of Action. The facilitator explained that the recommended actions should be those that can be implemented either immediately or within the next 12 months. It was not easy to reach consensus on the relative rank orders of the issues, except on **Gender Awareness Training** as the most urgent issue. The table below presents the agreed Plan of Action.

Activity	Actors	Time Frame
A national baseline survey of RTT-related issues including gender	Min. of MLGPWNH (lead agent)	(The need for this was not widely supported in the plenary)
Mainstreaming gender issues in RTT into the Gender Policy Framework	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ministry of YDG&EC (lead) • Gender Focal Points • NGO Gender Forum 	Mid-November 2000
Gender & RTT awareness raising / training targeting: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decision-makers - MPs, Heads of Ministries • Traditional leaders • Provincial Development Committees • RDCs • Communities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Min. of MLGPWNH (lead) • Gender organisations • Steering Committee • Min. of YDG&EC 	Immediate. Proposal to be submitted by/on 1/12/00
Engendering the Transport Policy process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Steering Committee (lead) • NGOs • Min. of YDG&EC 	When Programme Co-ordinator is in place
Capacity building for RDCs in gender planning skills	LGPWNH (lead) RDCs, NGOs	January 2001
Review of RDCs Strategic Plans and Gender Syllabus	Min. of YDG&EC (lead) Other ministries RDCs; NGOs	March 2001
Expansion of the loan fund for IMTs in 3 districts	Min. of LGPWNH (lead) RDCs, NGOs e.g. ZFU	June - December 2001

Institutional Mechanism

In the above table, the "Actors" column indicates the lead agent and supporting institutions for each specified action. The specified lead agents were to develop project proposals for implementing the various activities identified.

Participants also recommended that the membership of the Steering Committee should be more inclusive and encompass the following:

- Gender organisations. The workshop recommended that the Steering Committee should contact the Gender Forum to send representatives.
- The Gender Department. The workshop recommended that the Ministry of Youth Development, Gender and Employment Creation should provide a representative in the Steering Committee.

End of Workshop

After formulating the Plan of Action, the workshop closed with an exchange of vote of thanks between Ms Maramba (for the facilitators) and Ms M.T.Dendere of the MYDG&EC (for the participants). Below is the list of participants attending the workshop.

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

NAME	ORGANISATION	DESIGNATION	CONTACT ⁵
R.M.Ziracha	DPP	Chief Plan. Officer	Box Causeway 968
C.Jan Sakko	ILO/ASIST	Technical Advisor	12th Floor, Karigamombe Bdg
T.C.Mbara	Univ.of Zimbabwe	Lecturer	Box MP 167
S.Masvanhise	MRDC	Chairman	P.B.7664 Chinhoyi
M.Nyamakato	MYDGEC	Snr Prov.Officer	P.B.992 Bindura
Thandie Chikomo	Zimtrust	Regional Manager	Box 4027 Harare
K.R.Duus	Danida/MoTE	Techn.Advisor	Box 4711 Harare
R.Mozhenti	ARDC	Devel.Advisor	Box BE 411 Belv. Hre
M.Madzinga	MYDGEC	Prov.Head	Box 3356 Byo
R.D.Kwenda	MYDGEC	Prov.Head	Box 798 M'dera
T.Ndoro	MYDGEC	Under Sec	P.B. 7762
P.V.Ndoro	MYDGEC	Prov.Head	Box 78 Gwanda
O.S.Mlilo	GRDC	Chairman	Box 59 Gwanda
E.Mahlunge	KWC	Director	Box AY 302 Amby
K.Moyo	GRDC	Driver	Box 59 Gwanda
C.C.Chakauya	MYDGEC	Prov.Head	P.B.9057 Gweru
J.M.Maringwana	MYDGEC	Acting Prov.Head	P.B.Q. 7737 Mutare
Lilian K-Goliati	ZFU	Gender Prog.Coord.	Box 3755 Hre
E.Dhlodhlo	Dondolo-Mudonzvo	Loan Officer	Box 1741 Gweru
S.Bizamare	MED(OPC)	Dep.Director	P.B. 7700 C'way
W.Goromonzi	Comm.Action Proj.	Proj.Manager	P.B. 7707 C'way
B.Mutimhodyo	MYDGEC	Acting Prov.Head	P.B.1711 Chinhoyi
M.T.Dendere	MYDGEC	Admin.Officer	P.B.7762
E.Madziva	MLGPW&NH	Under Secretary	Bag 7706 C'way
R.Mteiwa	MYDGEC	Snr Plan. Officer	Box 213 Masvingo
G.Munyongani	Women in Politics	National Coord.	P.B.7762 C'way

⁵ **Abbreviations:**

Bdg - Building
 Belv - Belvedere
 Byo - Bulawayo
 C'way - Causeway
 Hre - Harare
 M'dera - Marondera