

**INTEGRATING GENDER INTO WORLD BANK
FINANCED TRANSPORT PROGRAMMES**

CASE STUDY

SOUTH AFRICA

SHOVA KALULA

PREPARED BY: SABINA MAHAPA

SEPTEMBER 2003

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

The immediate objectives of this study are to identify how gender dimensions are included in the preparation of the Shova Kalula programme, documenting the experience of implementation, identifying the outcomes and the lessons learned in respect of gender inclusion and good practices. The overall objective is to contribute to the study on integrating gender into World Bank Financed Transport Programs and projects being carried out by IC Net Limited.

Project Description

The Shova Kalula National Bicycle Programme is a ministerial initiative of the National Department of Transport targeting rural and underdeveloped peri-urban areas. The National Department of Transport has taken up the challenge to meet the need for low-cost mobility solutions in rural and peri-urban areas by developing and prioritizing the Shova Kalula (Ride Easy) National Bicycle Transport Partnership.

The purpose of this project was to implement a national transport partnership to promote the use of bicycles and work cycles as means of transport. The partnership was facilitated by the National Department of Transport and targeted partners such as local government, provincial government, business, non-profit organizations and foreign governments and organizations.

The overall aim was to implement one million bicycle transport packages in South Africa over ten years. A bicycle transport package will include most of the following:

- a low cost new or used bicycle
- a training course in riding and maintenance and transport uses
- access to service and support from a local/regional micro business
- special attention to empowering female users
- an Edu-bike Africa learner's workbook (where relevant)
- the option of earning a bike through working in the micro business
- an infrastructure review of the area's potential for safe bicycle transport
- periodic visits by a mobile bicycle transport clinic.

The goal of implementing one million packages would be pursued in partnership with local and foreign parties to leverage resources for *shova kalula* and would be achieved in phases starting with the 2000/1 financial year.

Methodology

Research was conducted at national, regional and institution and project levels using both secondary and primary sources. The purpose for collecting national data was to get facts relating to planning, objectives, implementation, estimated impacts and problems experienced in the project. The purpose for collecting data at institution and project levels was to obtain perceptions and actual outcomes of the project.

Secondary data were collected from reports provided by the Department of Transport, Council for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR), Public Works and the Department of Education. The purpose of the literature review was to have an understanding of the background to the national and project level contexts. Sources include the *Shova Kalula* Project Document; *Shova Kalula* National Bicycle Project Assessment of Phase 1; transport policy documents; documents and the budget speech of the Minister of Transport in 2002; Planning Guidelines on Public Participation; and the Public Transport Plan. Reports from Afribike on the background and expected impacts of the project were used to supplement these data reports.

Primary sources entailed consulting with stakeholders at national, institution and project levels. This involved field missions to shova kalula shops holding focus group discussions with shop managers, male and female, local politicians (councilors) and interested community members such as local shopkeepers. Focus group discussions were held with self-employed rural women's groups at market places. Discussions were held with representatives from government departments in charge of transport and the gender focal points. Further discussions were held with school teachers and learners in areas where the *shova kalula* shops are located.

Enabling environment

The literature review shows the constitutional and legal frameworks promoting gender equality in South Africa as quite enabling. For example, the Constitution provides for equality in the Bill of Rights. Everyone is equal before the law and has the right to equal protection and benefit of law. Being equal before the law means that it must treat everyone the same and that men and women must be treated equally. It is unconstitutional to discriminate against a person on any of the grounds, among others, of: race and colour, sexual orientation and gender. To this effect the Constitution protects people who have been discriminated against by affording them an opportunity to special treatment in the form of Affirmative Action, the Right to Dignity and Employment Equity.

The Constitution provides for a number of institutions supporting democracy, which are independent but subject to it and to the law, including the Human Rights Commission, Commission for Gender Equality, Public Protector and Independent Complaints Directorate. South Africa's macro policy environment is gender-sensitive.

Institutional Analysis

For quite some time the transport sector policy was gender-sensitive; this is shown by the policy documents with the commitment to redressing the evils of the previous government. Transport is recognized as an instrument of social and economic transformation and emphasis should be placed on empowerment, but gender does not appear in many of the institutional strategies that should transform the society. The National Transport Policy Forum (NTPF), Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP), Rural Development Strategy (RDS), White Papers on Transport Policy, MSA and the Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy documents do not adequately articulate the main objectives of the Constitution. This suggests a gap between macro policy and sector policy. Hence, even in the design and implementation of the *shova kalula* program, gender was not one of the specified conditions for the intervention. Gender focus was recognized later in the process by the service provider after realizing the possible impact that the program could have, particularly on the self-employed.

Project Level Analysis

The project was conceived by partnership between National Department of Transport (NDOT) as strategic controller, Afribike as service provider and South African Black Taxi Association (SANRAL) as NDOT project managers. CSIR did an evaluation of Phase 1 of the project. The project originated because of lack of mobility, primarily in rural areas which usually lack viable options for low cost transport interventions. As a result transport remains a constraint in terms of learners attending school in time. The bicycle was thought of as the cheap, affordable means of transport and its effective use was proven, as is true all over the world.

Since Afribike initiated the program, together with NDOT, it was appointed as the service provider for Phase 1 which was completed in mid 2002. However, a dispute over the final outcomes took months to settle, creating constraints of bicycle supply to the shops and resulting in shortages of stock in other shops and shop managers salaries taking time to be paid. Although the independent evaluation by CSIR showed that the program was a success, still it is not clear when NDOT will give direct management of the projects to provinces, as this is causing problems of control and decision-making. The expectation is that NDOT should decentralize the program as a sign of good governance.

Gender outcomes

Gender outcomes were analyzed in relation to the four key dimensions of poverty as defined by the World Bank in the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) - economic opportunity, security, capability and empowerment - at national and project levels. National level outcomes described the intended impacts of the program on beneficiaries, including mobilization of affordable bicycles, skills training, job creation and awareness raising and poverty reduction. All these gave the beneficiaries the opportunity to own means of transport, to go to work and earn a living and even to participate in the mainstream economy and therefore be economically secure.

Learners who used to travel 5-10 kilometers to school were able to reduce the distance to school and back home, thereby reducing disruption to lessons caused by late arrival. This gave learners ample time in the mornings and afternoons to work on their assignments. Acquiring a bicycle gave learners a chance to improve their quality of life and develop human capital further, making them capable of achieving the best possible position in life.

Progress on skills training and creating employment benefited about 50 per cent of women employed in the projects. These women were trained as bicycle mechanics and shop managers - the sector which is believed to be male dominated. The exercise was empowering to these shop managers, male and females, because the males became aware that women can also be mechanics, while the female managers were made aware that they can be capable of doing something worthwhile in life. All managers were given the opportunity to become future entrepreneurs.

Project level impacts dealt with the outcomes of the evaluation of Phase 1 by CSIR and the interim arrangement outcomes. They range from the impact on the communities to those on shop managers, learners and women who run small businesses. The problems encountered by the shop managers were also highlighted as they contribute significantly towards the implementation of the prospective Phases 2 and 3 of the program.

The interim arrangement outcomes had more to do with the actual impacts as articulated by users and non-users of bicycles but are similar to the impacts which emerged in the evaluation of Phase 1. Anecdotal evidence was part of that presented to clarify the impacts. In general, there has not been

any substantial impact on the ground, particularly re gender. The only clear gender impacts are those on shop managers and bicycle use which has increased. The overall gender impacts are unclear. What was clear was that many women did not know how to ride a bicycle and had to be trained. Furthermore, road safety measures were planned but did not focus on women.

Conclusion and Lessons Learned

Although the *shova kalula* program did not seem to have incorporated gender in its design and implementation, there are a few lessons to learn. These emanate from external factors influencing the program, institutional factors and contextual factors. External factors have more to do with the imported bikes which were affordable but did not have spare parts. This was inconveniencing for the users and discouraged potential users. Further, the alleged disputes between the service provider and the managers created problems for the smooth running of the projects. Ultimately the disbursement of bicycles remained gender-neutral because the program was preoccupied with sales. Institutional factors have to do with the weakness of the centralized model. A decentralized model was the logical choice, with provinces having their own service provider closer to the action. The service providers would then source bicycles from their own suppliers and most of these would be new bicycles catering for the local needs. The contextual factors deal more with logistical issues. That there was one service provider for the whole country makes it easy to understand why there were shortages of bicycles in some shops, particularly in remote rural areas. It is obvious that one supplier situated in Johannesburg may not manage to supply bicycles of different choices to different environments, given the financial implications of the venture.

The *shova kalula* program could be replicated in other parts of country and elsewhere in Sub-Saharan Africa. The lessons that could be learned from this program range from communication between the funding body, service provider, implementing institution and the beneficiaries, to participation of beneficiaries at all levels and to the centralized model not being the choice in such programs as it does not show mechanisms of good governance.

Conclusion

The *shova kalula* program has yet to demonstrate good practices, particularly with regard to incorporating gender issues. This has much to do with the institutional environment in which the program was conceived. NDOT has failed to actively mainstream gender into its programs and projects. It is important that institutions develop the capacity to mainstream gender and create an enabling environment for it to be successful. If the *shova kalula* program is implemented effectively with successful and sustainable outcomes, then it should be a catalyst for provincial and local authorities to consider bicycle transport planning in the policy framework.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

1. BACKGROUND	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Objectives of the Case Study	1
1.3 Scope of the Case Study	1
1.4 Report Outline	2
2. METHODOLOGY	3
2.1 Secondary Sources	3
2.2 Primary Sources	3
2.3 Analysis of Data	4
2.4 Limitations	4
3. ENABLING ENVIRONMENT	5
3.1 Macro Context (Politics and the Economy)	5
3.2 Gender Awareness	5
4. INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS	7
4.1 The National Transport Policy Forum (NTPF)	7
4.2 Transport and the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP)	8
4.3 Rural Development Strategy	9
4.4 Transport Policy Review	9
4.5 'Moving South Africa' (MSA) and Gender	11
4.6 Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy (ISRDS)	13

4.7 Evaluation of the Rural Transport Environment	13
5. SHOVA KALULA DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION	15
5.1 Overview	15
5.2 Shova Kalula Programme Description	16
5.3 Project Outcomes	17
5.4 Action Plan	17
5.5 Afribike Terms of Reference	18
5.6 Implementation Matters	19
5.7 Stakeholder Participation	20
6. GENDER DIFFERENCES IN OUTCOMES	21
6.1 Macro Level Outcomes	21
6.1.1 Mobilization of Affordable Bikes	21
6.1.2 Skills Training	22
6.1.3 Job Creation	22
6.1.4 Poverty Reduction and Awareness Raising	22
6.2 Micro Level Outcomes	22
6.2.1 CSIR Perspective (First Phase)	23
6.2.2 Micro Level Outcomes (Interim Arrangement)	25
7. CONCLUSIONS AND LESSONS LEARNED	28
7.1 Externalities	28
7.2 Institutional Factors	28
7.3 Contextual Factors	28
7.4 Replicability	29
7.5 Dissemination	30
7.6 Conclusion	30

REFERENCES	32
APPENDIX 1-A: List of Persons Interviewed	34
APPENDIX 1-B: List of Stakeholders	35
APPENDIX 2: Case Study Analytical Framework	36

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ANC	African National Congress
CARNS	Community Access Roads Need
COSATU	Congress of South African Trade Unions
CSIR	Council for Scientific and Industrial Research
FABIO	First African Bicycle Information Office
GASEWA	Ganteng Self-Employed Women's Association
HIV/AIDS	Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
IDP	Integrated Development Plans
IMT	Intermediate Means of Transport
ISRDS	Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy
JSCTF	Japan Staff and Case Study Consultant Trust Fund
KZN	KwaZulu Natal
MSA	Moving South Africa
NDOT	National Department of Transport
NGO	Non-government organization
NMT	Non-Motorized Transport
NTPF	National Transport Policy Forum
NRAL	National Road Agency Limited
PAC	Pan-Africanist Congress
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
PWCBO	Public Works Community Based Programme
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
RDS	Rural Development Strategy
SABTA	South African Black Taxi Association
SANCO	South African National Civic Organization
SANRAL	South African National Road Agency Limited

1. BACKGROUND

1.1 INTRODUCTION

This report, which presents a case study on the *shova kalula* bicycle project in South Africa, forms part of a study commissioned by the World Bank titled “Integrating Gender into World Bank Financed Transport Programs”. The work is financed by the Japan Staff and Case Study Consultant Trust Fund (JSCTF) and is being undertaken by a consortium led by IC Net Limited.

The overall objective of the study is “to assist the World Bank [and other agencies] to improve the efficiency and equity of transport policies and programs through ensuring that projects respond to the needs of both women and men”. This is to be achieved through:

- World-wide survey to review and document gender and transport initiatives promoted by the World Bank and other agencies to identify best-practices in the identification, design, implementation and evaluation of these initiatives; and
- Developing training material and reference documentation which will make the findings and recommendation of the studies easily accessible to transport project managers, planners and policy makers around the world.

As part of the world-wide survey, the overall Study Terms of Reference call for the identification of 10 countries in which case studies of best practice in the integration of gender into transport policies and projects will be conducted. South Africa is one of the case study countries where a series of specific inquiries focused on *shova kalula* bicycle project have been undertaken.

1.2 OBJECTIVES OF THE CASE STUDY

Using the case of *shova kalula*, the study will:

- identify how gender dimensions are included in the preparation of the program;
- document what has been the experience of implementation;
- identify the outcomes; and
- identify lessons learned in respect of gender inclusion and, where appropriate, suggest good practices.

1.3 SCOPE OF THE CASE STUDY

The study entailed an analysis of the type of transport policy and programs formulated and adopted in South Africa. The policies adopted in other related government departments, such as Public Works and Education, were scrutinized. The Department of Education was chosen because of its stake in the bicycle project, while Public Works appeared to have the best practice in incorporating gender in its Public Works Community Based Programmes (PWCBOs). Other stakeholders such as the National Road Agency Limited (NRAL), the World Bank’s South Africa office (funder of

Afribike Aids Ride), the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR), TransportTec and Afribike were included in the scope of operation.

Apart from analyzing policies and programs, the study entailed discussions with *shova kalula* shop managers, women's groups, learners and shop managers. The nature of the South African case study is such that teachers may not be excluded as custodians of learners.

1.4. REPORT OUTLINE

This report is divided into seven sections. Section 1 provides the background and introduction. The methodology used is outlined in Section 2. Section 3 gives an overview of the enabling environment and macro context. Section 4 provides the institutional analysis describing the development of transport sector policy at national level. Section 5 presents the program's expected outcomes and implementation. Section 6 discusses the actual outcomes in relation to the four dimensions in the framework for analysis. The last section draws lessons learned from the project itself and from other projects and the dissemination of the findings.

2. METHODOLOGY

Research was conducted at national, institutional and project levels using both secondary and primary sources. The purpose for collecting national level data was to get facts relating to planning, objectives, implementation, estimated impacts and problems experienced in the project, while that for collecting data at institution and project levels was to obtain perceptions and actual outcomes of the project. These levels are presented in Table 1.1 according to the stakeholders involved.

2.1. SECONDARY SOURCES

Secondary data were collected from reports provided by the Department of Transport, CSIR, Public Works and the Department of Education. The purpose of the literature review was to have an understanding of the background to the national and project level contexts. The sources used include the *Shova Kalula* Project Document; *Shova Kalula* National Bicycle Project Assessment of Phase 1; Transport policy documents; documents and the budget speech of the Minister of Transport in 2002; Planning Guidelines on Public Participation and the Public Transport Plan. Reports from Afribike on the background and expected impacts of the project were also used to supplement the others.

2.2. PRIMARY SOURCES

Primary sources entailed consulting stakeholders from national to project levels. The most useful methodology was qualitative even though quantitative techniques were used in some instances. Qualitative methodology was preferred because it is less formal but more interactive and less standardized but more interactive (Silverman, 2000). One of the most important methods was focus group discussions which were used to collect project level data to document the experience of women bicycle users and non-users. A discussion schedule was prepared to focus on: tasks performed by women involving transport; the transport mode used; cost of purchasing or hiring; perceptions of men on women who ride bicycles and of both men and women on the *shova kalula* bicycle project.

Interviews were held, at project level, with schoolteachers in areas where the *shova kalula* shops are operating to establish their understanding of the role of the bicycle in reducing late coming, tiredness and absenteeism and enhancing performance of their pupils. Issues of monitoring of the project were also raised in this group.

Interviews were held with officials from other government departments who had projects in rural and peri-urban areas in Limpopo Province such as Public Works, Health and Agriculture. The projects implemented by these departments were analyzed at each stage to identify how gender had been incorporated and the monitoring frameworks. Interviews at this level represented the national level.

Discussions were held with representatives from government departments in charge of rural transport in Limpopo Province, such as the District Council, who also had a representative during the design of the *shova kalula* program, the local government and the Gender Desk of the Department of Transport in Limpopo.

In-depth interviews were held with officials in Limpopo Province's Department of Transport about how the program was designed and implemented and consideration of the differences between men and women. Attention was paid to their expected outcomes and perceptions of the program. Limpopo Province features more in the data collection because it is home to 4 of the 10 shops established in the whole country, while the other provinces had 1 shop except for Free State Province with 2. The decision was also based on sales made by the bicycle shops. Limpopo Province had sold more than others, even when the sales of individual shops in different provinces are compared. The high sales indicate significant need for the low cost transport solutions in Limpopo Province. This point will be unpacked in the data analysis and discussion.

Observations and audit of the gender-related practices were used. This method was useful, particularly in the rural villages where the *shova kalula* shops have been established, given the negative attitude of many of the rural communities about women riding bicycles. It was useful to observe gender-related practices in rural and peri-urban areas, with the people's perception on women riding bicycles being the same. Above all, the purpose of using the observation method was to verify the data (triangulate).

2.3. ANALYSIS OF DATA

Data collected through focus group discussions were analyzed by using the framework for analysis provided in the case study design guidelines. Categories of outcomes were created among the stakeholders relating to the "micro", "meso" and "macro" levels (Tables 1.2 and 1.3). The purpose of these categories was to examine the differences in outcomes between men and women from the perspective of the three levels. Common themes were identified from the data through observation and linked with those from focus group discussions. Finally the emerging trends were established and discussed as the main findings.

2.4. LIMITATIONS

Shova Kalula covered six provinces of South Africa: Limpopo, Free State, Mpumalanga, North West, Gauteng and Western Cape. Conducting the study posed a big challenge as the provinces are far apart. Consequently, only five of the ten *shova kalula* shops were visited and the other five were sent questionnaires, to which only two responded. Government departments involved in the project, such as the Department of Education, appeared to know very little about it. The *shova kalula* project was planned to undergo two phases but, before the first phase was completed, the systems collapsed and this caused difficulties in terms of data collection. In reality, the first smooth phase appeared to have lasted for a year. One can only imagine the challenge in attempting to gather information about such a project where control is under interim arrangements.

3. ENABLING ENVIRONMENT

3.1. MACRO CONTEXT (POLITICS AND THE ECONOMY)

The first democratic elections in April 1994 marked a momentous political and socio-economic transition in South Africa. Some of the many challenges which confronted the new democratic state were the final eradication of the results of apartheid: reduction of poverty, since the country's economy was built on systematically enforced racial division in every sphere; and improving the quality of the majority through a sustainable, coordinated and integrated development program. Rural areas were divided into underdeveloped Bantustans and well developed, white-owned commercial farming areas; towns and cities were divided into townships without basic infrastructure for Africans and well-resourced suburbs for whites. Segregation in education, health, welfare, transport and employment left deep scars of inequality and economic inefficiency (RDP, 1994).

The history has been a bitter one in that poverty existed side by side with modern cities and developed mining, industrial and commercial infrastructure. In addition, women are still subject to innumerable forms of discrimination and bias. Having emerged from one of the world's most brutal and unjust economic and political systems, South Africa's democratic government has committed itself to overcoming poverty and improving the quality of life for all of its citizens.

3.2. GENDER AWARENESS

Through its Bill of Rights, the South African Constitution recognizes the rights of women as being of equal importance to those of men. This is evidenced on the one hand by the use of words such as “he” and “she” throughout the Constitution and this is an example of the “macro” environment being aware of gender rights. On the other hand, at a more practical level there are now many more women represented in government bodies. More than a quarter of the members of parliament are women and they also hold ministerial portfolios. At national level women are represented well. But at the local level, particularly in the rural areas, women are not even considered as stakeholders. Women are the biggest consumers of resources and are the hardest hit by the lack of facilities in rural areas. This not only impacts further on their participation, but makes them the best consultants regarding community needs.

The South African Government has also shown its commitment to gender through Affirmative Action. The Constitution protects affirmative action and says that people who have been discriminated against in the past should receive special treatment or opportunities to right previous wrongs. This is happening a lot in the workplace where many more women and Black people are being employed, because the past prejudice prevented them from getting jobs. This is surely a positive action and is a way to ensure equality in the future. Many businesses and the government have affirmative action policies. This is more visible in the government's procurement policies where mention is made on the type of candidate they require. Many of these procurement policies indicate that the candidate must be either Black, woman, or disabled.

To show commitment to gender equality, the Government has set up the Commission for Gender Equality in support of the Constitution. This commission's mandate is to promote respect for gender equality and for the protection, development and attainment of gender equality. To achieve gender

equality, the Government established guidelines that would facilitate equal access to goods and services for both women and men. These guidelines are set up in the Gender Policy Framework for South Africa. The Gender Policy Framework is not prescriptive but it does set standards and norms for the national program. To achieve gender equality means that every department has to come up with its own gender policy and strategies.

It needs to be noted that South Africa is still faced with many challenges with regard to achieving a society free of racism and sexism. These have to do more with how people relate to each other and how resources are allocated. Fortunately the challenges have been translated into national priorities, all of which have compelling gender dimensions which need to be addressed if the country is to advance towards gender equality. The key challenges are:

Gender relations : South Africa is in a process of transition, a key objective of which is the transformation of gender relations. The challenge is to shape the broad transformation project in a way which acknowledges the centrality and compatibility of the transformation of gender relations to the broader process.

Poverty. This is a major problem for women in South Africa. The systematic and socially-engineered location of women in rural areas and the underdevelopment of infrastructure in these areas have been directly responsible for the poor conditions under which the majority of South Africa's rural communities live. Apartheid laws coupled with repressive customs and traditions, disempowered women in ways that will take generations to reverse. While the democratic government has established enabling legislation, it must move towards delivery to alleviate and eventually eradicate poverty.

Globalization is an emerging world challenge. It is a system of redistribution of opportunities and benefits which may enhance the economy or lead to rising inequality and aggravated poverty. The challenge for South Africa is to ensure that women benefit equally with others in society. In reality, South Africa has a good macro policy environment with regard to gender because the constitution is gender-sensitive.

4. INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS

This section reviews transport policy commitments in relation to gender and transport in rural areas with the intention of later assessing whether they are empowering or disempowering rural women and to identify gaps between policy and practice. The review explores the commitments by the National Transport Policy Forum (NTPF); Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP); Rural Development Strategy (RDS); White Papers on Transport Policy, both national and provincial; Moving South Africa strategy (MSA); Planning guidelines in the implementation of land transport; and the Integrated Sustainable Rural Development (ISRD).

4.1. THE NATIONAL TRANSPORT POLICY FORUM (NTPF)

The 1994 elections marked South Africa's political, social and economic change and influenced government's action in relation to transport policy. For example, the NTPF was published in September 1994. The NTPF was referred to as a “people-centered” transport policy presumably, because in its establishment, the majority of the people were consulted. The NTPF document outlined strategies to deal with the fragmentation within the transport sector (NTPF, 1994: 13 - 14).

Through the NTPF transport was recognized as an instrument of social transformation, the document indicates that:

“The transport industry should be used as an instrument of transformation. Emphasis should therefore be placed on the creation of new business and empowerment as a tool in the economic process” (NTPF, 1994:2).

The process through which the NTPF coordinated transport policy was developed departs radically from the previous transport policy formulation as it was a result of debates, consultation and consensus by various stakeholders (Khosa, 2001). Such stakeholders included the African National Congress (ANC), the South African National Civic Organization (SANCO), the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU), the Congress of Traditional Leaders of South Africa, the National African Federated Transport Organization representing 50,000 transport operators, the Pan-Africanist Congress (PAC), the Southern African Black Taxi Association (SABTA), Transnet and several organizations representing the private sector. Through the NTPF, the formulation of transport policy was publicly discussed and debated by a vast majority of the organizations. In fact, the NTPF described access to transport as a basic right (NTPF, 1994).

The NTPF, in short, is committed to social transformation, economic empowerment and greater participations of stakeholders as evidenced by the number of organizations that took part in the process of policy formulation. But women's organizations are missing. The question will be if empowerment includes African rural women, then why are they not represented in such forums? How do you begin to empower them if they do not know what is going on? The other issue that needs to be addressed later in this thesis is whether the commitment to empower people is practiced, because talk of social transformation and economic empowerment is one thing and implementation of it is something else.

4.2. TRANSPORT AND THE RECONSTRUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME (RDP)

The ANC, in the RDP document, pointed out that:

“not only did the apartheid policy move the poor away from job opportunities and access to amenities, but also deprived the majority of people of a say in transport matters, and has led to the payment of huge travel subsidies, exposed commuters to vast walking distances” (ANC, 1994:36).

The new government therefore committed itself to developing an effective publicly owned passenger transport system integrating road, rail and air modes. The ANC argued also that rural areas require more frequent public transport and improved facilities, at affordable prices. Government also declared that access to transport and other emergency services such as health and education is a basic human right largely to be met by government. Thus, future transport policy must:

“Be flexible enough to take cognizance of the local conditions in order to make best use of the available transport infrastructure; take into account the transport needs of disabled people; ensure accountability so that the people have control over what is provided” (ANC, 1994:35).

The government emphasized that the importance of affordable and safe transport for women, children and disabled people. However, evidence suggests that much of the transport section in the RDP was based largely on rhetoric rather than a rigorous analysis of the transport sector (Khosa, 2001). Transport was given scant attention, occupying only 3.5 of the 147 pages in the document. That creates a suspicion that transport is not regarded as one of the most important elements in rural development, let alone gender issues in this regard.

In its programs and targets for transport, government has planned for the provision of national roads:

“Execution of national roads projects with enhanced labour components...

Provision of roads on the basis of a multi-criteria approach which takes into account basic needs, e.g. accessibility, in addition to purely financial considerations. The targets in this case are: Disadvantaged sectors of urban and rural communities requiring accessible transport services supported by adequate infrastructure provision; Disadvantaged members of urban and rural communities who can be economically empowered or employed through projects funded from public sector sources and in the road transport industry” (White Paper on RDP, 1994:78).

The question of roads in addressing transport problems, particularly in the rural areas, has been given first priority and greater attention. This is evidenced by many projects commissioned by the National Department of Transport and other agencies having had a distinct slant towards provision and maintenance of rural road infrastructure and in some cases, public transport. For example, the Community Access Roads Need (CARNS) project in (1996) in KwaZulu Natal (KZN) conducted a detailed study to estimate the size and cost of the road infrastructure gap (Klem, 1998). The V3 study in Limpopo Province looked at rural communities and access to public transport (Bosman *et*

al, 1997) and Gibb Africa's study, also in Limpopo Province, looked at distance contours of rural locations in relation to Potgietersrus (Jordaan, 1997). And yet, rural households travel and transport largely entails movement of small goods over short distances and travel within and between villages, local markets and surrounding areas, largely on foot (Mashiri, 1996). Marais (1987), for instance, studied 18 villages in the Eastern Cape and concluded that most rural transport and travel for villagers consisted of on-farm movements, especially of water, firewood, agricultural inputs and outputs and trips to and from school. The argument in this research is that until recently, the emphasis has been the provision of roads rather than gender access to resources such as transport and many other socio-economic and political services.

The targets have also been generalized as "urban and rural communities". There is a noticeable avoidance of gender throughout the White Paper on Reconstruction and Development.

4.3. RURAL DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY

The Government suggested, in the Rural Development Strategy document, that, to deal with rural poverty, it should

"put rural people in charge. In addition, the rural development strategy must be informed by the collective wisdom of our people and unite their efforts for development" (South Africa, 1995:3).

The strategic goals and vision of government are set very clearly and how it hopes to achieve them. The document has also tried to show fair understanding of the rural context. The present democratic government has declared that gender issues are crucial in dealing with rural poverty, for women are particularly at risk of being poor.

The document seems to take cognizance of women's issues such as participation and control and access to resources. However, it is not yet clear what delivery mechanisms will be used and how. The document indicates that the concerns of rural women were for land rights, access to water, electricity and telephones, access to grazing land and the abolition of polygamy, but transport is not listed. To these could be added many other issues of access emanating from customary law and the lack of understanding of bureaucratic systems. They include financial issues, information, education and training and capacity building. What seems to be clear is that transport is listed only as rural access roads, as if roads are enough for rural development.

4.4. TRANSPORT POLICY REVIEW

After the 1994 election the Department of Transport embarked on a project to revisit and review transport policy and formulate new policy to suit the changed environment. In formulating new policy, the Department of Transport was guided by the RDP national objectives:

"transparency, consultation and accountability. Important in this regard are the objectives of: socio-economic development, which includes aspects such as solving imbalances in the distribution of services among communities, meeting basic needs, and improving social conditions and physical health of the whole community; the objective of improved safety, and the objective of increased efficiency and effectiveness" (South Africa, 1995:8).

The policy making process involved different role players from all key sectors of transport and as far as possible was constituted to involve all interested groups involved in the process (South Africa, 1996:1). Comments were received from interested parties across the entire transport sector and the draft paper was circulated to key stakeholders in July 1996, to allow for final comments. The policies expressed in the White Paper are thus the result of a broad public policy making process. However, having noted the varied and often conflicting views, government had to take its own decisions bearing in mind what serves the national interest.

The question of gender in the objectives of National Department of Transport (NDOT) seems to be far fetched. There are also generalisation and avoidance of the concept. Whether the objectives are practiced as indicated is something else.

After extensive consultation with stakeholders in groups and plenary sessions, over a period of 18 months, the **White Paper on National Transport Policy** was submitted and accepted by Cabinet in September 1996. In the White Paper the ANC Government acknowledges the significant role of transport in the social and economic development of any country and that it should be given priority. Hence the National Transport Policy document promises to:

“provide safe, reliable, effective, efficient, and fully integrated Transport operations and infrastructure, which will best meet the needs of freight and passenger customers at improving levels of services and cost in a fashion, which support government strategies for economic and social development, whilst being environmentally and economically sustainable” (South Africa, 1996:3).

The Government intends to revise the legacy of the previous government, where its dominant role was as *regulator of bureaucratic detail, a provider of infrastructure and a transport operator* (South Africa, 1996:7). To achieve its vision, the Government promises to support the goals of the RDP for meeting basic needs, growing the economy, developing human resources and democratizing decision making (South Africa, 1996:3). A key focus of the national transport policy will be on meeting customer needs. This will involve a process of identifying key customer groups, assessing their needs and determining how these can best be met:

“These will include the users of passenger transport services for commuting, educational, business, tourism and private purpose, in the urban and rural, regional and international environments Those special customer groups include the poor, the disabled and those who send goods by any mode (South Africa” 1996:4).

The White Paper on a National Transport Policy promise to invest in infrastructure or transport systems in ways, which satisfy social, economic, or strategic investment criteria (South Africa, 1996:5), but made no commitment to gender. However, the document recognizes the difficulty in satisfying all customer demands in terms of high-level infrastructure needed and high costs.

The objectives set out in the provincial white papers, particularly in Limpopo and Western Cape, show no difference from national policy. The provincial policy documents emphasize social and economic development through transport. Although the White Paper on Transport Policy for Limpopo Province suggests that more attention should be directed to transport in rural areas, which constitute 89% of the total population, no commitment is made in relation to gender, except on one occasion where there is mention of “*equitable and non-discriminatory*” systems. The central tenet of the Provincial White Paper on transport is provision of passenger transport and infrastructure.

These are areas said to need government intervention in re-establishing proper control and to review priorities within the new South Africa reconstruction objectives.

What is interesting about South Africa is that the country has a gender sensitive-constitution, but the macro policy has not been translated into gender-sensitive transport policy. The planning guidelines as set out in the National Land Transport Act 2000 do not articulate the main objectives of the Constitution. The only way that this national gender-sensitive rhetoric has been accommodated is in the inclusion of some women termed “special categories” or “vulnerable and disadvantaged” and passengers with physical disability, within the principles of the National Land Transport Policy set out in the recent National Land Transport Transition Act 2000. Rural African women may be classified as “disabled” because of their multiple responsibilities which enslaved them within the confines of their homes - thus qualifying them as a special category. This is regarded, in this research, as an oversight that should have not happened given that the Government has been at the forefront of work on gender budgets. The issue here is that it is one thing to talk about gender needs and it is something else to come up with strategies that would address them. The Constitution has good intentions that do not filter down to national transport policy. The argument is that there is a gap between the macro-policy environment and the national transport policy. Consequently gender-needs are not adequately addressed.

4.5. 'MOVING SOUTH AFRICA' (MSA) AND GENDER

“Moving South Africa” (MSA) is a high profile, data-driven SAR 20 million project of NDOT, looking at appropriate transport strategies for the next 20 years, which was developed to realize the vision in the White Paper on national transport policy. Besides providing safe, reliable, effective, efficient and fully integrated transport, the White Paper also suggests two thrust areas: those that are means to achieve the goals; and those that are goals themselves:

Means:

Skills and technology building broaden participation in the economy and ensure competition.

Goals:

Customer needs : the transport strategy must be based on a data-driven understanding of the needs of different customer segments, their service levels and cost requirements.

Investment objectives: national investments in infrastructure and operations should provide the required returns, be they economic returns, financial returns to the investors or social returns to the people.

Policy requirements: the transport strategy should enable the achievement of national and regional policy objectives and of objectives of other arms of government.

Integration: the strategy should identify where regional, modal and institutional integration can be enhanced and facilitated.

Environmental sustainability: the impacts of various modes and transport alternatives should be measured for their environmental impacts.

Low cost for designated level of service: The transport strategy must recognize that various customers have different needs and strive to meet those needs at the lowest possible cost.

Meet basic needs : transport has an impact on the key goals of the Reconstruction and Development Programme of meeting basic needs of the people of South Africa (South Africa, 1997:3 -6).

The vision and goals of the White Paper are set out clearly; what is obvious is that MSA strategy is mandated to determine how to implement the vision in an environment of limited resources, capacity and time. The project will present strategic options for consideration based on rigorous analysis of data to ensure that government, together with stakeholders in the industry, make decisions based on facts and not on opinions. The project is also mandated to adopt a primarily customer-driven view of the transport industry, to ensure that the strategy ultimately delivers on the vision for transport set out in the White Paper and that meeting the needs of end users of transport services is maintained as the primary objective (South Africa, 1998/99:83). Perhaps most importantly, the strategy was required to create a context for action within which to achieve the White Paper objectives.

Through its Rural Transport module, MSA came to the conclusion that close to 80% of the rural transport problems could be resolved by studying and providing solutions for three of the nine provinces: Kwazulu-Natal, Limpopo Province and Eastern Cape where 69% of the rural population resides. South Africa has a dual economy characterized by first and developing world elements. The rural areas, which are largely poor, fall into the developing world category. Of the three, Limpopo Province has been chosen for this study because it has the highest poverty levels (Lipton *et al*, 1996) and also as it is the home of a number of previously disadvantaged communities in the former homelands.

What also came out consistently from MSA was the paucity of data to describe adequately the rural transport sector and its problems. It was concluded that there was need, *inter alia*, for an infrastructure audit to determine needs of rural communities with a view to developing a robust rural transport investment framework. This research will thus contribute to the relevant modules of MSA strategy; more importantly, it will provide a basis for the provincial rural transport database.

The Rural Transport Module also emphasized that NDOT must broaden the current approach to road building and upgrading in rural areas and incorporate its programs within a consistent rural development paradigm with other government departments involved in rural development. This project will seek to provide the building blocks for an inter-sectoral and cross-sectoral collaboration platform.

MSA has moved towards avoiding the concept of gender. This strategy is committed to meet the requirements of special categories of passenger focusing on learners and those with special needs, particularly those with disabilities (Dept. of Transport, 2001). The avoidance of mention of gender needs does not allow the assumption that they will be catered for.

MSA acknowledged that the majority of South Africans were marginalized in the development of transport systems throughout the country's history and that the needs of those customers who did not fit definitions of "average" were largely ignored. This latter category of passengers has included children, the aged and persons with disabilities. MSA research found, however, that the transport system today places a number of obstacles to access and mobility for categories of persons broader than the three mentioned above. What has developed is a picture of much larger set of needs which the available data were not able to provide to enable the development of a detailed strategy (Dept. of Transport, 1998).

4.6. INTEGRATED SUSTAINABLE RURAL DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY (ISRDS)

That rural transport has only recently drawn much attention of policy is evidenced by a number of policy studies and considerable public awareness that has been created in the Minister of Transport's budget speech of 2002. Recognition is made that rural people have vastly inferior access to basic services and the economic mainstream. Given this context, the delivery of rural transport infrastructure and services is seen as catalytic for sustainable economic development, improved social access and poverty alleviation in rural areas (Department of Transport, 2001).

Some of the relevant strategies to addressing the rural infrastructure include Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy (ISRDS) which is committed to coordinating delivery of integrated bundles of services and anchor development projects in terms of prioritized sets of rural development nodes (Department of Transport, 2001). There are a number of examples of focused areas by ISRDS where gender is mentioned.

“The marginalisation of agriculture, particularly in the former homelands, needs to be addressed with central acknowledgements of the role of women and gender issues. The neglect or inadequate performance of gender specific tasks such as land clearing, ploughing and the dipping of livestock on the one hand and planting, weeding and harvesting on the other, can have a major impact on agricultural production as a whole” (ISRDS, 2000:12).

The statement implies that the issue of gender needs is central to ISRDS as it relates to agriculture - thus advocating high involvement of women in this sector. The issue of integrating gender into transport projects is not entertained in ISRDS. The only time when transport is mentioned is when acknowledging that:

“The cost of living for poor rural people is generally higher than it need be because of their lack of access to transport and communications infrastructure, basic amenities such as water and electricity, and social services such as health and education. Furthermore, because of their poverty and vulnerability, rural households commonly resort to a variety of different strategies to ensure their survival so that it has become more appropriate to describe their economic activities as livelihood strategies rather than jobs or employment” (ISRDS, 2000:9).

ISRDS's generalizations about gender issues show the need for a more gender- specific approach for rural integrated development to be sustainable. But, as long as commitment is made to rural households, instead of looking at it from a gendered perspective, it is not going to be integrated or sustainable.

4.7. EVALUATION OF THE RURAL TRANSPORT ENVIRONMENT

The overall transport policies of the government since 1994 have been characterized by consultation of stakeholders. However, an important weakness in the recent transport policy formulation process is that it does not have a strong representation from rural areas and women's groups are not represented. This is no surprise because many rural people have long been poorly educated and least organized and therefore least able to demand assistance through formal and informal structures (South Africa, 1995). Yet, their ability to take charge of local government and contribute to decision-making will be critical to the effectiveness of rural local government.

What is also missing in the new transport policies and strategies is mainstreaming of gender issues in transport-related programs and projects. Because women are vulnerable members of society and their productive roles are sometimes not fully reflected in sector strategies, considering how transport policies and projects address women's needs is important for socially and economically sustainable transport policy. Yet little attention appears to have been paid to women's needs in transport projects. Making transport policy more responsive to the needs of women requires developing a structured approach to understanding their needs, identifying instruments to address those needs, analyzing the costs and benefits of those instruments and establishing an appropriate policy framework.

The Minister of Transport's 2002 budget speech acknowledged that mobility and access were important to achieve a sustainable transport system. He further confirmed that rural transport has been neglected because of lack of strategic guidance in rural transport. Although there was no mention of gender, the speech gave some indirect implications on it. He mentioned that government is engaged in initiatives incorporating promotion of ownership and usage of a variety of rural transport operations such as animal drawn carts and bicycles. Hence *shova kalula* was introduced in the rural areas and peri-urban areas

In terms of good practices, the Department of Public Works proved to have a good policy on gender compared to many others. For example in its objectives, the Department Public Works acknowledged that there are factors which may have a bearing on the development of women and which manifest themselves from both the internal and external environments. Internal environmental factors include redressing the imbalances in staffing and maintaining equitable representation of women at all levels. External environmental factors advocate application of measures and policies that promote optimal distribution of benefits to women, for example through reform of procurement and promotion of use of labor-intensive construction methods that target the employment and training of women. A good example of this is the Community Based Public Works Programme. The Department has introduced the Emerging Female Contractors Development Programme which identifies women with potential to establish businesses in the construction industry. These women are encouraged to own their businesses through training workshops and networking.

5. SHOVA KALULA DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION

5.1 OVERVIEW

This section discusses *shova kalula*'s design and implementation, including a description of the project, its action plan and its outcomes. Afribike's terms of reference are included because of the big role it played in design and implementation of *shova kalula*. The section includes implementation issues and concludes by analyzing stakeholder participation in the design and implementation of the project.

NDOT is confronted with many transport challenges, which affect millions of Black women and men workers who commute daily during peak periods, as well as schoolboys and girls. These challenges manifest themselves in different forms: high and unaffordable fares for Black women and men who are paid poverty wages (Khosa, 1997) and long travel distances to schools by young boys and girls, who often arrive at school late, tired or sometimes absent.

In addressing these transport challenges, NDOT, province governments, the National Roads Agency and Afribike initiated Shova Kalula National Bicycle Programme in 2001. *Shova Kalula* is a Zulu expression which translates strictly to "ride easy". The program results from realization by NDOT and other stakeholders such as Afribike of the need for low cost mobility solutions and the desire for increased personal mobility. Enhanced personal mobility and accessibility in a developing economy context invariably refer to greater use of intermediate means of transport (IMT) and in particular non-motorized transport (NMT) modes such as bicycles and donkey carts.

The White Paper on Transport of 1996, the MSA Action Agenda and the Minister of Transport's budget speech of 2000/1 indicate the need for further exploration of the potential of low cost mobility enhancement through bicycle transport, targeting the young and those communities and individuals that currently walk long distances. That many rural communities travel long distances and by walking is real and substantial in South Africa. This was highlighted in the October Household Survey that there are 573,000 urban workers (including small towns) and 472,000 rural workers who walk more than 20 minutes to work. Of all people with jobs, 20% walk to work in urban areas and 60% in rural areas. Data on the non-workers is not collected; however, a survey of rural Kwazulu Natal schools in 1998 indicates that:

- 75% of secondary school walkers walk more than 3 km.
- 43% of primary school walkers walk more than 3 km
- 15% walked more than 4.5 km.

This says that 555 000 African rural learners in KZN walk more than 40 minutes one-way to school. Of these, at least 280,000 walk more than 1 hour, one way to school.

A related survey of school principals revealed that 70% of pupils are often tired at school, 60% are often late and 58% sometimes absent due to long walking distances. These statistics highlight the transport problem experienced by the rural and urban poor, as well as a significant potential role for bicycle transport to reduce the burden.

Although its current modal share is low, bicycle transport has great strategic potential as a short-term low cost mobility solution, especially for those who walk long distances in medium sized towns and cities and in rural areas. Millions of South Africans cannot afford regular public transport because of unemployment and low wages. However, innovative bicycle transport development packages might enable them to increase their mobility.

In essence the South African case is representative of those developing countries which have high levels of walking but poor levels of safety and little infrastructure for non-motorized transport. The challenge is to begin to overcome these impediments to increased bicycle transport.

Key actions for success in a developing country context include:

- promoting affordable bicycles, work cycles and trailers;
- training users in riding and maintenance skills;
- assisting local entrepreneurs to develop bicycle micro-businesses; and
- training planners to cater for safer and more user-friendly infrastructure.

Shova kalula aims to promote bicycle transport in South Africa through practical experience especially:

- among low-income users;
- including youth, women and girls; and
- in rural areas, townships and medium sized cities.

This will be done through:

- an NDOT funded National demonstration program;
- using NDOT funding to leverage support from other spheres;
- supporting promising initiatives at provincial and local levels;
- developing micro-businesses to support bicycle transport;
- training interns in the bicycle transport business;
- promoting safer bicycle transport through training and infrastructure; and
- developing a mobile bicycle transport clinic/shop.

In addition, NDOT will aim to build partnership with locals and foreign parties to leverage resources for *shova kalula*. NDOT will promote and market *shova kalula* to ensure maximum awareness and support from communities, officials and politicians.

5.2. SHOVA KALULA PROGRAMME DESCRIPTION

The purpose of this project was to implement a national transport partnership to promote the use of bicycles and work cycles as means of transport. This partnership was facilitated by the NDOT and targeted partners such as local government, provincial government, business, non-profit organizations and foreign governments and organizations.

The overall aim was to implement one million bicycle transport packages in South Africa over ten years. A bicycle transport package includes most of:

- a low cost new/ or used bicycle;
- a training course in riding and maintenance and transport uses;
- access to service and support from a local/regional micro business;
- special attention to empowering female users;
- an Edu-bike Africa learner's workbook (where relevant);
- the option of earning a bike through working in the micro business;
- an infrastructure review of the areas' potential for safe bicycle transport; and
- periodic visits by a mobile bicycle transport clinic

The goal of implementing 1 million packages would be done in partnership and would be achieved in phases starting with the 2000/1 financial year. *Shova kalula* would facilitate partnership between NDOT and other parties. Implementing project partners would include national, provincial and local government structures and agencies. Service providers would be procured through the systems of the implementing project partners. Contracts and business plans would be in place before any transfer of funds from the NDOT to the implementing project partners.

It was clearly stated that procurement of service providers would have to be agreed by NDOT and should take into account the **empowerment** of small business. Further, all projects must supplement the aim of promoting bicycle transport use. A project partnership should, at a minimum, include a low cost bicycle package together with basic infrastructure **safety** review. In addition, allowance was made for a roadshow to promote the *shova kalula* partnership, to develop a broad list of possible project sites and to generate funding and resource commitments from potential partners.

5.3. PROJECT OUTCOMES

The expected outcomes of the *shova kalula* partnership were:

- **sustainable** bicycle transport use at the targeted sites and projects across the country, especially by low income users, **women and girls**;
- **viable** micro business development at the project sites, in support of bicycle transport users;
- **increased awareness** among communities, politicians and officials of the transport potential of bicycles and work cycles; and
- **enhanced understanding** through actual practical experience of the potential for bicycle transport to serve as a strategic solution for certain mobility needs among low income and rural people.

5.4. ACTION PLAN

The *shova kalula* project consisted of six tasks that had to be completed within a period of ten months from the procurement; these were:

Task 1: Roadshow

The first task was to conduct a roadshow that visits every province and promotes the concept of bicycle transport. Key audiences would include provincial departments of transport and education. In the roadshow a presentation on bicycle transport opportunities would be made followed by a discussion on possible cooperation and potential project sites. Provincial departments and relevant local authorities were expected to show commitment by responding to the call from NDOT. Service providers were also expected to perform a high level scoping exercise for developing a list of recommended sites for implementation of *shova kalula*.

Task 2: Recruiting interns

This involved hiring and training at least 6 interns with the aptitude to work in the bicycle transport business. Their contracts should last for 6 months. The selection of interns should strive to include women. These interns would be paid a stipend and would be expected to participate in the different aspects of the project. It was expected that the interns could start work soon after the road show and site selection process were completed.

Task 3: Site selection and scoping

This task was to recommend sites for selection by the Minister. Once approved, a detailed scoping would be performed. Site steering committees would be established and agreements would be entered into with the relevant authorities responsible for the project area. A site implementation plan would be developed, covering such aspects as current situation, target areas, target markets, container shop location, consultation, infrastructure reviews, pricing structure, partner commitments and evaluation.

Task 4: Site implementation

This task involved establishment of the container shop, the launch of the project, the training of a local shop manager, the training of target users, marketing the offerings to surrounding areas and involving politicians. It was envisaged that opening of sites would be phased - once a month.

Task 5: Mobile bicycle transport clinic/shop

This involved procuring a suitable commercial vehicle and trailer for use in marketing, promotion sales, training and general outreach across the country. This would create a wider presence than just the single site in the province.

Task 6: Evaluation of phase 1 and recommendations for phase 2

This involved an audit of the implementation efforts at the different sites as they are rolled out as well as an overall phase 1 evaluation after all sites have been completed. The results would be reported to all stakeholders and it was envisaged that briefing for parliament would be conducted. The evaluation would be managed by the members of the National Management Committee

5.5. AFRIBIKE TERMS OF REFERENCE

Afribike's terms of reference were interpreted as in line with the development objective envisaged by NDOT, which was to help reduce poverty by improving access to basic socio-economic services. The objective of the project was specifically to establish a durable framework for bicycle promotion in South Africa in partnership with Afribike's bicycle Aid Franchise product.

The project was designed in three complimentary components. Components one and two, which were completed between February and April 2001, consisted of:

Component 1: Reinforcement of partnerships for bicycle promotion

- identification of partners at provincial and local levels
- identification of pilot areas
- identification of beneficiaries
- formalization of the framework between participating parties
- road shows to enthuse participants

Components 2: Identification of transport needs

- socio-economic study, based on gender, with definition of indicators to be included.

Component 3 (Improving access to bicycles) was to be undertaken during the Afribike Training Mission of May 2001 - February 2002; its activities are:

- information, education, and communication campaign
- technical training of beneficiaries
- training of mechanics and installment of bicycle workshops
- furnishing of bicycles and spare parts
- implementation of micro-credit financing.

5.6. IMPLEMENTATION MATTERS

The starting point for this program was to roll out a million bicycles in ten years. To realize this goal, 11 *shova kalula* shops were established in six provinces: Limpopo, Gauteng, Free State, Western Cape, Mpumlanga and NorthWest to sell bicycles to the surrounding communities. Each shop has an accompanying workshop for servicing bicycles. A service provider was appointed to supply the shops with bicycles and spares. Each shop was assigned two managers selected from local communities through a process of interviews. This process is significant because the gender aspect was considered as it was reflected in the advertisement of the posts of managers. The managers were trained in technical skills in bicycle riding, bicycle safety, maintenance and repair. They were also given information and examples that would help the beneficiaries overcome cultural resistance to bicycle use and optimize the use of their bicycle to increase income and reduce poverty. The skills and knowledge base established in the community would enable both the sustainable ongoing use of bicycles and the transfer of skills to others in the future. Thus, the training was not only intended to reach the 10, 000 beneficiaries of bicycles, but also individuals with an interest in bicycles.

As Afribike proceeded in implementation, it was decided that a part of the project should focus exclusively on women. This decision was based on the experience of the work-bike pilot project, which was successful in that several ‘hawkers’ gained access to work-bikes but unsuccessful in that all of the participants were men.

It was also decided that women should be a focus given their particular transportation needs and that women disproportionately bear the burden of poverty, often fulfilling both the breadwinner and child-rearing roles and responsibilities. Afribike started to implement some best practices in its targeting women's groups, such as the Gauteng Self-Employed Women's Association (GASEWA) which wished to purchase Xtracycles for a cooperative recycle business venture. An advantage of Xtracycles, in addition to their large capacity and durability, is the ease in which a regular bicycle can be converted. Xtracycles bring quality load-carrying vehicles into the realm of affordability for more South Africans, women in particular.

A critical part of the Afribike project is fabrication and use of the work-bike. Through establishing a fabrication facility that includes a welder, drill press and metal benders, the Afribike workshop has obtained the capacity to fashion work-bikes by retrofitting regular bicycles with an Xtracycle rack. Such retrofits make a stretch-bike and the fold-down racks increase a bicycle's load carrying capacity significantly. An average Xtracycle can carry up to 100g. This is a reflection of gender being considered in the planning and implementation of other Afribike programs in South Africa, but not the *shova kalula* program. To date, the shop has produced 20 Xtracycles, all of which have been provided to local high-profile users such as postal delivery workers, newspaper delivery people and foodstuff sellers. Given the high demand that has already been generated, this component of Afribike will go a long way towards ensuring the long term financial sustainability of the project

Afribike notes that it has encountered considerable difficulties, primarily the overwhelming number of other ongoing priorities women must maintain. It has steps to equalize women's participation in the program in the long run. Women are involved in planning and running the project at the highest levels. For example, Karen Overton founded the project and its director based in South Africa is Lydia Pasajes.

5.7. STAKEHOLDER PARTICIPATION

A few facts about stakeholder participation may be pointed out. It was indicated that the first phase of the *shova kalula* program was a demonstration segment, in which it followed a centralized model with control in the hands of the partnership of the NDOT, National Roads Agency Limited and Afribike. This centralized model was tested in the first phase of the program. It is no wonder that stakeholder participation at local level was non-existent. Evidence in the site selection and scoping (task no.3) shows that stakeholder participation took place when the site was to be selected. Surely, this does not reflect good mechanisms of governance.

6. GENDER DIFFERENCES IN OUTCOMES

The analysis of gender differences in outcomes has been undertaken in relation to the four key dimensions of poverty defined by the World Bank's PRSP: economic opportunity, security, capability as well as empowerment. These were linked to both national and project level outcomes and their related impacts. The national level outcomes include the evaluation made by CSIR of the first phase because the program's major impacts were realized then. The reason was that, after completion of the first phase during the first half of 2002, the program did not run smoothly because of disputes which affected the delivery of bicycles. As a result an interim arrangement was instituted to keep the ship floating. Consequently, there are few different impacts to record. It is too soon to judge the second phase as it has not taken off.

6.1. MACRO LEVEL OUTCOMES

These, which have most to do with the description of intended impacts of the program on male and female beneficiaries, include mobilization of affordable bikes, skills training, job creation and awareness raising and poverty reduction.

6.1.1. Mobilization of Affordable Bikes

The lack of adequate transport continues to severely limit the ability of black South Africans to access opportunities and lift themselves out of poverty. Further, low cost mobility remains one of the key elements in addressing simultaneously poverty and health issues in Africa. Afribike recycled about 10,000 bicycles imported from its partners in the UK, USA, Canada, Ireland, the Netherlands and Germany. The recycling of used bicycles which would otherwise end up on landfills in the developed world had advantages for the many communities which could not afford means of transport in South Africa. The bicycles were sold at a subsidized price of SAR150, the affordability of which made many users very happy. The amount was initially meant to cover learners only. A letter was required from the school principal to procure a bicycle. But because they were affordable, the system was abused by parents who purchased bicycles in their children's names. The demand is a simple indication of the need for low cost mobility by everyone in the community. Bicycles gave parents the **opportunity** to own cheap means of transport and to access employment and earn a living. Being able to go to work affordably gave beneficiaries an opportunity to participate in the mainstream economy and become economically **secure**.

Many rural women cannot afford to purchase or hire means of transport, resulting in restriction on their mobility and introduction of affordable means of transport, as in *shova kalula*, has empowered them. "Women are empowered by greater mobility" (Starkey, 2002:2). Their gender roles might even change to the positive direction.

The Reitfontein bicycle project 2000 indicated some experiences of learners who live in the mountains on the way to Rustenburg. In this area, about 300 children walk to school and back, from 6-14 km, each day. These children leave home every morning to walk two hours to school and after school they walk two hours to get back home, sometimes in the dark and sometimes in the wind and rain, without being able to carry much other than their notebooks and lunch boxes. When they get to standard eight, they go to a school that is 25 km away. Such learners welcomed the opportunity *shova kalula* gave them. Worth noting is that there are females among these learners. Apart from being prey to rapists and smooth-talking motorists and hangers-on in luxury cars, black school girls

along these routes seem to fall pregnant and become reluctant child-mothers. Learners who traveled 5-10 km to access secondary education were able to reduce the distance traveled daily and to access educational facilities as simply as possible. Acquiring a bicycle gave them a chance to improve their quality of life and develop human capital further making them **capable** of good positions in life.

6.1.2. Skills Training

One of the mandates of Afribike was to teach basic and advanced mechanics and bicycle operation skills to beneficiaries. This was realized by training shop managers on bicycle repair, assembling of parts and management of the shop. The exercise was **empowering** to these shop managers as they have been exposed to running a small business. They were also given the **opportunity** to become future entrepreneurs.

6.1.3. Job Creation

Afribike's expectations were that the 11 shops established would be increased to 25. The goal was not only to make cycling an attractive option, but also to create jobs via a vibrant local bicycle economy and to convince governments of the importance of appropriate policy. This would have far reaching impacts on the number of jobs to be created. As it stands now, the project has employed 22 people, 11 males and 11 females, on equal footing. The project, by creating employment for them, has given the 22 the opportunity of a life time, given that jobs are scarce in South Africa. This suggests that the viability and sustainability of the *shova kalula* program is of utmost importance. No one would like to see the project collapse.

6.1.4. Poverty Reduction and Awareness Raising

Afribike has created awareness by recognizing that cycling is also a hobby and a sport for millions of South Africans. This venture will make the majority of people able to take advantage of the recreational aspect of cycling and promote a positive cycling culture that will carry over to increased popularity of cycling as a mode of transport. Women surely will take advantage of this and the stereotypes that cycling is for men and not women will die out.

Afribike has already shown that bicycles and training enable individuals to spend significantly less time and money on transport and improve their access to education, markets and services, including health services and ultimately cycle out of poverty. Poverty leaves us vulnerable. So, in trying to combat Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired immune Deficiency Syndrome (HIV/AIDS), poverty must also be eradicated simultaneously. HIV/AIDS volunteers are able to use bicycles from door to door helping those affected and infected. The significance of bicycles and HIV/AIDS is that volunteers, who are in most cases women, are given the opportunity to prove to themselves that they also are worth something, unlike when they remain at home watching people suffer without any form of comfort. It also proves that they are capable of doing something for the country.

6.2. MICRO LEVEL OUTCOMES

The outcomes at “macro level” deal with the impacts of the project on female and male beneficiaries. Afribike, together with NDOT and SANRAL, has shown that men, women and children can improve their access to education, jobs, markets and health-care, increase household

income, improve their quality of life and increase their time spent with family. All these impacts were realized through a range of outcomes such as those identified by CSIR and those coming from the interim arrangement.

6.2.1. CSIR perspective (first phase)

CSIR Transportek was contracted by NDOT to undertake a quick assessment of Phase one of the Shova Kalula National Bicycle Partnership Programme, as a requirement for approval of the second phase. The intention was to get a handle on whether the program was considered beneficial by beneficiary communities, i.e. its impact on the ground. Monetary considerations were the subject of a different financial forensic audit. The assessment indeed justified the second phase as there was a groundswell of support for the program from beneficiary and other community members.

Impact of the Project in the Communities

All interviewees had a common say regarding the impact of the project. The impact of the project was positive in more than one aspect. Most of the intended beneficiaries who bought bicycles use them to get to school, shops and even visit friends and family and just to play with them. On the other hand, elders who bought the bikes use them to get to work. Those who are self employed indicated that they can now visit their clients more frequently and some are able to get to the market for business. It also came from the interviews that, in most of the villages, women were seen cycling to and from the market to buy and sell fruit and vegetables.

Impact of the Project on Shop Managers

All shop managers indicated that the project has instilled a sense of entrepreneurship among them. In one shop, brand name condoms were sold. They also indicated that they received training in Johannesburg at the inception of the project. The training was on bicycle mechanics and business skill. However, they further pointed that they needed more training in other aspects of the project such as finance management. Except for one, all shop managers believed that their future lies with the bicycle shop.

Extent to which Learners Received Bicycles

At least 60% of the sales in each shop were to learners and the average was 80%. Some shop managers cautioned that these figures could be deceiving. They argued that not all learners who acquire bicycles do so for their use. Some could have been bought by elders who wanted to benefit from the discounted prices for their own gain.

The records kept by shop managers show that 4,283 bicycles were sold through the project. The shop in Bakkenberg (Limpopo Province) registered the highest sales at 1,120. It was followed by Witpoort also in Limpoo at 1,111 and Hammanskraal at 810. The remaining shops sold an average of 126 bikes.

The reason why Bakkenberg has more sales could be that the area has a strong history of cycling for both men and women. Many commuters cycle to town in Potgietersrus. The community there is familiar with bicycles and when the opportunity of extremely cheap bikes presented itself, obviously they took it. The project bikes are extremely cheap, at SAR 150-300 compared to the normal price of about SAR R800. That is a bargain for a community that is known for cycling.

Problems Encountered

Generally, shop managers are upset about the service from the service provider. All cited that they were frustrated with the way their salaries were handled. They say they were never paid on time. The issue of salaries still remains a problem because even in the interim arrangement the same issue appeared in almost all the ten responses of shop managers. They recommended that they be paid reasonable salaries for the projects to be sustainable. Further, they say the supplier was not meeting the demand for bicycles in the communities. This was also true with the bicycle spare parts.

Some of the beneficiaries felt they were sold disposable bicycles, in a sense that once a bicycle part was damaged it could not be replaced. This rendered such bicycles useless. One reason for this short supply of parts could be that they are no longer available from where they were imported, since the bikes are old models. It could also be that the process of importing has become expensive for the service provider. This point proved to be true because when the service provider was asked about the kind of lessons learned, he mentioned that:

- people are able and willing to pay for a bike if it is subsidized;
- people use their bikes;
- more capacity needs to be built locally;
- used bikes are more expensive than it seems in the long run;
- initial supplies of bicycles were sold at discounted prices to learners with subsequent supply sold at full price, creating tension between shop managers and the community as the community accused the shop managers of dishonesty; and
- the bicycles played a role in stimulating small enterprises with special reference to women.

The indication was that the bicycles have improved efficiency of the small entrepreneurs who use them. There has been a noticeable increase in the number of women who are small entrepreneurs who rely on the bicycles to conduct their business.

General Perception of Men on Women who Ride Bicycles

It appears that men are still split on this issue. The indication is that the elder men still viewed women who ride bicycles strangely. Younger men accept that women can also ride bicycles. Few women ride bicycles because men do not support the idea.

Safety issues

Safety was a concern for the majority of people. There has been no initiative in communities to improve the safety of cyclists. Suggestions were made with regard to safety paths and gear. There was a wish for more traffic officials to ensure the safety of officials. Lastly, learners could be taught at school to ride safely.

The aspect of safety was taken further with an official of the provincial department of transport in Limpopo Province. He indicated that the department was about to introduce cycling safety lessons in schools when the program started to show signs of falling apart. A small booklet with the title "*Cycling Book*" stands as proof of this. Some traffic officials were also preparing to teach the best way of cycling, as soon as the process of learning and mapping the way forward is complete.

Recommendations

Recommendations made were:

- A logical process needs to be followed whereby the current status of Phase 1 is to be carefully detailed to the provincial coordinators and shop managers, who are currently in the dark. As soon as this is cleared, the process for Phase 2 could then be outlined.
- The findings of this assessment and any other information that might present itself should be used to develop a strategy that would overcome the operational and institutional hurdles encountered in Phase 1.
- The process of selecting the service provider needs to be revisited.
- The current method of one national supplier results in logistical problems in getting supplies to shops. Alternatively, the national supplier should partner with local entrepreneurs to ensure regular supply. Local communities should benefit in the supply chain of the bicycles.
- The project should, as much as possible, dovetail with local structures and initiatives.
- A committee is required to intervene between the service provider and the shop managers, to ensure accountability from both parties.
- Shop managers should be taught entrepreneurial skill to ensure that existing shops are used optimally and developed to business entities.
- Increase awareness in men to accept that women can equally ride bicycles should be pursued, to increase the number of women who ride bicycles as men may encourage women to ride.
- The project needs to be placed in the Integrated Development Plans of the local municipalities as well as those of the district municipalities as they should form part of the Local Economic Development strategies of these spheres of government.

6.2.2. Micro Level Outcomes (Interim Arrangement)

The outcomes at “micro level” with reference to the interim arrangement had more to do with the impacts articulated by users and non users in the communities where *shova kalula* shops are located. Consequently, anecdotal evidence was used to show the differential impacts on men and women. Although it must be put on record that the most direct targets of the program were learners, no distinction was made between men and women. Therefore, the impacts indicated in this case study are those that directly affect learners, while female potential users indicated how bicycles could change their lives, particularly looking at their multiple roles at home and in society.

Field investigation among users and non-users showed that there is a great need for bicycles. Communities are beginning to appreciate that government is doing something particularly for the rural people. They believed that government was for the urban communities not the rural ones. Government, by introducing the *shova kalula*, has made a promise which must be fulfilled and under pressure to deliver because from the electorate through councilors who have been very boastful about this project - boastful because they have realized the role that bicycles play in giving people access to education, markets and services, including health services and ultimately help “cycling” out of poverty. Women in the villages where *shova kalula* shops are located have realized the significant role which the bicycles play. The *shova kalula* has given them the courage to ride bicycles which they did not previously have.

Focus group discussions revealed that very few women have bought bicycles. Those who have an opportunity to use them depend on one that used by either their male partner or a learner. Learners

usually use bicycles bought for them to help reduce the tasks that women have to do. For example, children are sent to do shopping, to inform relatives of any event that must take place, be it a case of death or celebration. All these tasks have to be performed by women in the absence of children's help. Women indicated that they are prepared to ride bicycles, particularly those with carriers to help transport goods to market places. The only concern with the current mountain bikes is their structure which is male-made. Women suggested the supply of a female bike without cross-bars, as this would allow them to ride at any time without any restriction on the type of clothes. Given that some men are not happy to see their wives and daughters putting on trousers, a female bike will be most suitable. These women showed excitement about the day they manage to purchase a bicycle. Although there was no gender focus in the design of the *shova kalula*, it made quite an impression on the communities, particularly those that never thought bicycles can be used to reduce distance and to relieve the workload.

School teachers at Morwatshehla High School had this to say regarding the impact on the ground of the project:

Even though we cannot measure the impact quantitatively, the impact of shova kalula has been tremendous. Schooling has been improved in that learners no longer arrive late at school due to long distance traveled; absenteeism has also been reduced because learners are not tired when they arrive at school. The only concern we have is lack of spare parts which forces some learners, particularly female learners to leave their bicycles at home. They cannot stand the risk of using bikes that can be broken at any given time. Because of this problem the number of bicycles is decreasing. The school used to be full of bicycles for both boys and girls.

That 60% of the bicycles were sold to scholars is testimony that they have indeed benefited from the program. However, when one visits some of the schools claiming higher than 60%, there are no signs of bicycles. The learners indicated that the reason why they no longer ride bicycles to school is because they get punctures easily and are therefore costly to repair, particularly as they were not informed that they can take their bicycles to the shop managers to fix free of charge. Instead, they pay for repairs which they feel they no longer afford. Hence the bicycles remain at home. This further suggests the need for a local service provider to handle all cases.

Remarkable progress has been made in benefiting women. About 50% of the shop managers employed are women. The emphasis is on not only the quantity but also the quality of women's benefit. This means that women were not only equal to men in terms of numbers, but also in positions they occupy and the type of jobs they perform. Whether or not women play an active role is left for time to tell. It was not easy to determine that, given the short time to gather data about the projects.

Women shop managers were trained to become bicycle mechanics. That they were allowed to be part of the training in a male dominated sector is an indication that they were also given the **opportunity** to social and economic development. In addition, women were given the same positions with men as shop managers, so they can develop a sense of self-worth - they can believe in themselves that they can also be able to secure the desired changes in life. This venture has been more empowering to these female shop managers. The equal opportunity afforded to the female store managers shows that empowerment of women is achievable, although gender stereotypes still prevail among women themselves who think that bicycles are not for them. Most clear was that many women did not know how to ride a bicycle and had to be trained.

The *shova kalula* shops were also recognized by shopkeepers in the villages around them who indicated that they were not aware of the role that bicycles could play in solving the problems of transport, particularly in remote rural villages. The projects were an eye-opener in that they too could start stocking bicycles to bridge the gap, especially when the shops are out of stock. This also makes the issue of a local supplier significant. Some shopkeepers who can afford so may be roped in to supply the shops instead of a service provider from Johannesburg. In areas such as Bakkenberg people feel one shop is not enough, particularly in an area known for cycling. Women there do not have any barrier whatsoever in riding bicycles. They indicated that:

Our village is more of an urban area, where there is no body who will tell you what to do and not to do. We do not mind driving the bikes with cross-bars because we can put on trousers and many of us are used to riding bicycles. The only problem is these bikes are not enough to cater for all the surrounding areas. We need more shops such as this one with cheap bicycles because in town we pay double or even triple the amount.

7. CONCLUSION AND LESSONS LEARNED

Evidence has shown that the *shova kalula* program has been widely accepted, particularly in the rural areas, as an affordable low cost means of transport. However, gender was not one of the specified conditions for the program and as a result gender impacts are unclear even though bicycle use has increased. Nevertheless, there were administrative constraints at national level that were experienced. These constraints created problems that affect the opportunities for beneficiaries. In reality, unresolved problems lead to denied opportunities and threaten the survival of the project. Examples of such factors that affected the differential impacts of the project include external factors, institutional factors and contextual factors.

7.1. EXTERNALITIES

The recycled post office bikes that were brought to South Africa from Europe were affordable but their users did not have access to repair services and spare parts locally and bicycles fell into disuse. This has a tendency of discouraging future buyers, be they male or female, learner or worker. The problem of imported bikes was not realized in the project's design and implementation.

The alleged dispute over the final outcomes took months to be resolved and had an impact on the focus of the program. Instead of concentrating on gender aspects of the program when supplying bikes, the department was forced to recover the venture by supplying any form of bike it could find. Hence, the bikes were not suitable for use by women because they had cross-bars. Given that African women culturally are expected to wear dresses, bicycles with cross-bars are not appropriate for their use. If the purpose is to change their mind-set, then the correct bicycles should be provided.

7.2. INSTITUTIONAL FACTORS

The *shova kalula* was managed by the South African National Road Agency on behalf of NDOT. The arrangement was not strategic as both NDOT and SANRAL are far from the projects, while the provincial departments that are more local did not have any power to make decisions. As a result *shova kalula* shops are experiencing problems of shortage of stock and the provincial departments cannot do anything to help. There is no policy guiding them except for the discussions that often take place regarding the *shova kalula* shops. So, the sooner NDOT decentralizes power to the provincial departments, the better for the survival of these projects. This will help provinces to start with their tendering system to contract a local supplier and to get the projects going. Further, the process of decentralization makes it possible to address poverty at the local level, allowing resources to be identified and mobilized at district and lower levels. Decentralisation enables the poor themselves to identify their needs and priorities (Sibanda, 2001).

7.3. CONTEXTUAL FACTORS

Logistical issues are critical to programs such as this. For example, that there was just one service provider, situated in Johannesburg, to service a country the size of South Africa meant logistical nightmares. The service provider, Afribike, had only a few staff members to attend to logistical problems. Some shops that they had to visit were in very remote areas. In reality, Afribike set itself

up for failure by agreeing to such contractual obligations. Even a well-oiled, fully staffed distribution enterprise would be hard-pressed to do well.

As it turned out, Afribike could not supply enough bicycles to shops when they needed them, most especially at holiday times. This frustrated both the community and the shop managers. Communities felt it was the shop managers' incompetence that resulted in no bicycle orders.

What is of interest is that at almost every shop, the managers were male and female. Conversely, if there was no conscious effort to do the same in bicycle sales. Anyone with money could buy the bicycles. There lies one of the weaknesses of the model employed in the first phase of the program - it was not an inclusive model. Given the poverty that pervades the target groups, an inclusive model, possibly using the school system would have been preferable. An inclusive system would provide some sort of revolving fund for those that cannot pay the cash price at once - this would have meant that most learners would have had the opportunity to participate in the program - i.e. girls and boys - thereby mainstreaming gender.

The *shova kalula* project being nation-wide, the sustainability of bikes should have been realized. For example, the Western Cape differs from Limpopo in terms of logistics of getting the bikes to the shops because the former is located in a more urban environment while the latter is more rural. So, it will be easy to supply the Western Cape as compared to Limpopo - hence the need to decentralize control to provinces to enable them to obtain a local supplier for bikes. The local supplier would understand the local environment and needs and then supply bikes accordingly. Mountain bikes that are currently given to the beneficiaries are not relevant in many rural environments, particularly if they have to be used for reducing the load carried by women and even carrying books to school by learners.

7.4. REPLICABILITY

In essence the *shova kalula* project can be replicated in other parts of the country and elsewhere in Sub-Saharan Africa. Nonetheless, there are lessons that could be learned from this project.

Communication is critical in programs such as the *shova kalula* - between the NDOT which is the funding agency, the National Roads Agency which administers the program, the provinces which oversees projects in their jurisdiction, the local authority in which the projects are resident (to include it in its Integrated Development Plans (IDP) list of projects), the shop managers and the beneficiary communities. Without adequate communication, community-based programs of this type are less likely to be effective. Communication is also related to transparency, particularly with regard to budgets.

Replication of the concept of recycling bicycles from Europe to elsewhere in the world is a good idea, but the execution of the project is a problem.

Participation at all levels of the planning, design and implementation of the project should be recognized. The beneficiaries need to identify what their mobility needs are so that the correct intervention is supplied.

Importing bikes without spare parts is a deterrent to potential buyers and users because when the bicycles need to be repaired, no parts are available. Then the bicycle becomes obsolete and the project turns into a white elephant and therefore unsustainable.

The provision of backward and forward linkages (local spare parts manufacturers, suppliers and repairers) will help generate a critical mass of bicycle riders in rural communities.

Recipients of bicycles should be trained to ride them and be given road safety lessons and proficiency tests as this would give women the opportunity to learn just like any other person. This is important because some school girls indicated that they were not taught to ride bicycles at the *shova kalula* shop, but by their brothers at home. Those who do not have brothers are put at a disadvantage. This aspect must be made known during road shows to attract more and more females to ride.

Raising awareness should be promoted amongst the women to remove any taboos that exist regarding their riding bicycles.

Above all, the centralized model should not be the choice in such massive programs. The decentralized model was the logical choice, where provinces would have their own service provider closer to where the action is. The service provider would then source bicycles from its own supplier and most of these would be new bicycles. Necessarily, they would be a little more expensive than those in the first phase but they would also have a longer life.

There are lessons that could be learned from similar projects in other countries for the benefit of the *shova kalula* project in South Africa, for example from the First African Bicycle Information Office (FABIO).

7.5. DISSEMINATION

This research was undertaken not just as a token of gender and transport but as a means to make policy makers and planners and even those who are interested in transport, particularly rural transport, aware of the importance of integrating gender into transport projects. Therefore, it is important to disseminate this piece of work to relevant stakeholders such as NDOT and provincial departments, municipalities and NGOs for their perusal. This may be done by organizing workshops about gender and transport, conference presentations or simple submission of the results to the stakeholders.

7.6. CONCLUSION

There is no doubt that mainstreaming gender in policies, programs and projects leads not only to the empowerment of women but also gives them an opportunity in life. This has been the case with female shop managers in the *shova kalula* shops, though the impacts for the other beneficiaries were general. It was made clear that over 60% of bikes were sold to learners, but there was no specific indication that male learners and female learners bought so much. What is actually visible in this project is that the program was more empowering on both the male and female shop managers. As for the rest of the communities, much still has to be done.

The *shova kalula* program has yet to demonstrate good practices, particularly with regard to incorporating gender. This has much to do with the institutional environment in which the program was conceived. NDOT has failed actively to mainstream gender into its programs. It is important that institutions develop the capacity to mainstream gender and create an enabling environment for it to be successful. If the *shova kalula* is implemented effectively with sustainable outcomes, then it should be a catalyst for provincial and local authorities to consider bicycle transport planning in the policy framework.

REFERENCES

- Department of Transport, 2001. National Transport Planning Guidelines and Requirements for the Implementation of the National Land Transport Act: TPR 9-Public Participation. South African Department of Transport Pretoria.
- <http://www.transport.gov.za/legislation/nlttaguide/index.html>
- Department of Transport, 2002. Written Parliamentary Questions - National Assembly, No. 1765 and 1766 to ask the Minister of Transport.
- Khosa, M.M.,1997. Sisters on the Wheel: Gender Relations in the Taxi Industry in Durban. Centre for African Research and Transformation. Innovation Centre Suit 236, University of Natal, Umbilo.
- NTPF, 1994. Transport Policy, fifth draft. National Transport Policy Forum, Johannesburg.
- Northern Province, 1997. White Paper on Provincial Transport Policy, Department of Transport, Pietersburg.
- Sibanda, A., 2001. Rural Transport and Empowerment of Women: Policy Guidelines on Best Practices. UNECA, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.
- Silverman, D. 2000. Doing Qualitative Research: A Practical Handbook. Sage, London.
- South Africa, 1994. White Paper on Reconstruction and Development, Government Gazette No. 16085, Pretoria.
- South Africa, 1996. Rural Development Strategy, 1996. Department of Land Affairs, Pretoria.
- South Africa, 1996. White Paper on National Transport Policy, Department of Transport, Pretoria.
- South Africa, 1997. Public Works Towards the 21st Century, White Paper. <http://publicworks.gov.za/docs/policy/wp97.html>
- South Africa, 1999. South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality, prepared by the Office on the Status of Women.
- South Africa, 1999. The Integrated Sustainable Rural Transport Development Strategy (ISRDS), IDT, Pretoria.
- South Africa, 2000. Shova Luka (Ride Easy), National Bicycle Transport Partnership. National Department of Transport, Pretoria.

- South Africa, 2002. Budget Speech by Abdullah Mohamed Omar MP, Minister of Transport in the National Assembly, Cape Town.
- South Africa, 2002. Shova Kalula National Bicycle Project: Assessment of Phase 1. Prepared by CSIR Transportek for the National Department of Transport, Pretoria.
- South African Government, 1998. Moving South Africa: A Transport Strategy for 2020 Report and Strategy Recommendations produced for the South African Government Department of Transport
<http://www.transport.gov.za/projects/msa.html>
- Starkey, P., Ellis, S., Hine, J and Ternell, A. 2002. Improving Rural Mobility, Options for Developing Motorized and Non-motorised Transport in Rural Areas. World Bank Technical Paper No. 525, Washington DC.

APPENDIX 1-A: LIST OF PERSONS INTERVIEWED

Name	Organisation
Angy Nchabeleng	NDOT
Morgan Malatji	Limpopo Provincial Dept. Transport (Coordinator Shova kalula Project)
Rose Papola Gender Desk	(Limpopo Dept. transport)
Mac Mashiri	CSIR Transportek
Maikel Lieuw Kie Sung	Afribike
Makhuvha, M.A.A.	Greater Letaba Municipality
Naledi Masipa	Gender Desk (Public Works Limpopo)
Zakuthini Ndleyathini	Khayelitsha (Western Cape shova kalula shop)
Joseph Ngobeni	Temba (Gauteng shova kalula shop)
Mosioa Padi	Theunissen (Free State shova kalula shop)
Likeledi Phara	Theunissen (Free State shova kalula shop)
Prisca Tlokana	Bakkenberg (Limpopo shova kalula shop)
Johannes Mojela	Bakkenberg (Limpopo shova kalula shop)
Gerson Metshituni	Dzanani (Limpopo shova kalula shop)
Yvonne Netshifhefhe	Dzanani (Limpopo shova kalula shop)
Lucas Mathipa	Mokwakwaila (Limpopo shova kalula shop)
Gladdys Mokomene	Mokwakwaila (Limpopo Shova kalula shop)
Sizakhele Mchunu	Mbazwana (KZN Shova kalula shop)
Motlhatlhane	Dept. Education (Limpopo)
Teachers and learners	Morwatshehle High School
Koos Stander	Hatfield Cycles
Bakkenberg Women's Group	Bakkenberg
Mokwakwaila Self-Employed Women	Mokwakwaila
Mr Shiluvhane	Councillor Mokwakwaila

APPENDIX 1-B: LIST OF STAKEHOLDERS

Macro level	Meso-level	Micro-level
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. National Dept. of Transport (NDOT) 2. Provincial Dept. of Transport (Limpopo) 3. National Dept. of Public Works 4. Provincial Dept. of Public Works (Limpopo) 5. Afribike 6. Hatfield Cycles 7. Dept. of Education (Limpopo) 8. SANRAL 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Women's groups in Limpopo 2. Gender Commission 3. Capricorn District Council 4. Local Government Limpopo 5. Makhado Municipality 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Store Managers 2. Bicycle users and non-users 3. School Teachers 4. Local Shopkeepers 5. Councillors

APPENDIX 2: CASE STUDY ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK

Poverty attribute	Transport issues (with respect to gender disparities)	Interventions impacting on the gendered use of transport			Expected outcomes/targets	Differential impacts/differential user perceptions
		National gender policy (cross-sector) /1.	Transport sector policy and programs /2.	Transport operations and planning		
Opportunity	1. Access to employment 2. Access to education and training 3. Employment within transport sector 4. Affordability of transport 5. Time use / time poverty 6. Access to market credit 7. Opportunity to own transport 8. Access to resources	AFFIRMATIVE ACTION - Employment Equity - Gender Equality and equity - PDI's	Need for low cost mobility solutions - NLTSP - ISRDP - IDP SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMMES	Shova Kalula (Pedal Easy)	- Sustainable bicycle transport - Viable micro business development - Increased awareness of bicycle potential - Enhanced understanding of bicycle potential	- Affordable bikes - Job creation - Skills training - Increased awareness on women - gender stereotypes reduced - poverty reduction
Capability	1. Access to health and social services 2. Incidence HIV/AIDS 3. Access to education and training		-Poverty alleviation programme - CBPWP - LED		Enhanced human capital and quality of life	- Affordable bikes

Poverty attribute	Transport issues (with respect to gender disparities)	Interventions impacting on the gendered use of transport			Expected outcomes/targets	Differential impacts/differential user perceptions
		National gender policy (cross-sector) /1.	Transport sector policy and programs /2.	Transport operations and planning		
Security	1. Personal security 2. Road safety / safety in operation 3. Time use / time poverty		- RISF - PLTF	Shova kalula	Greater economic and physical security	Safety measures not yet implemented
Empowerment	1. Participation in planning/ policy-making/ management 2. Knowledge/ information – user involvement 3. Development of social capital / social networks 4. Access to education and training	Affirmative action	Low cost means of transport	Shova kalula	Increased political participation and gender equality	- Poverty reduction - Same job - Same position - Same training (shop managers)