

**Integrating Gender into World Bank Financed  
Transport Programs**

**SYNTHESIS**

**DRAFT**

**Prepared By Jeff Turner  
TRL**

**NOVEMBER 2003**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>ENABLING ENVIRONMENT .....</b>	<b>2</b>
2.1	Aim .....	2
2.2	Argument .....	2
2.3	Summary.....	5
<b>3</b>	<b>INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS .....</b>	<b>6</b>
3.1	Aim .....	6
3.2	Argument .....	6
3.3	Summary.....	9
<b>4</b>	<b>PROJECT-LEVEL ANALYSIS.....</b>	<b>11</b>
4.1	Aim .....	11
4.2	Argument .....	11
4.2.1	Project Preparation and Design: Labour-based construction projects .....	11
4.2.2	Project Preparation and Design: Other projects.....	14
4.3	Project implementation.....	16
4.4	Project learning .....	19
4.5	Summary.....	20
<b>5</b>	<b>GENDER OUTCOMES .....</b>	<b>22</b>
5.1	Aim .....	22
5.2	Argument .....	22
5.2.1	Labour-based construction and maintenance projects .....	22
5.2.2	Non-labour-based method projects.....	25
5.2.3	Safety issues .....	26
5.3	Summary.....	26
<b>7</b>	<b>REFERENCES.....</b>	<b>30</b>

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This synthesis is constructed as part of the World Bank-funded ‘Integrating Gender into World Bank Financed Transport Programs’ project. The work is financed by the Japan Staff and Consultant Trust Fund (JSCTF), and is being undertaken by a consortium that is led by IC Net Limited and includes TRL Ltd and IFRTD. The overall objective of the study was ‘to assist the World Bank [and other agencies] to improve the efficiency and equity of transport policies and programs through ensuring that projects respond to the needs of both women and men’.

The aim of the synthesis is to:

- Draw out the salient points and common themes from the various case studies
- Identify elements of good practice
- Identify common weaknesses
- Identify areas for further policy development or training

This report synthesises the findings of 10 separate case study report from 9 different countries across the developing world. The countries are:

- China
- Lao
- Vietnam
- Bangladesh
- Senegal
- Lesotho
- South Africa
- Uganda
- Peru

Even within the best gender practice case study, that of Uganda, the research revealed a gap between the national gender framework and the consistent inclusion of gender in the transport sector. The bulk of the other cases reveal substantial gaps. The gender-enabling environment found in many of the case study countries is consistently not translated into practice across the transport sector. Given the strength and explicitness of the commitment to gender in the national frameworks, its absence as a measurable aspect of transport policy can be viewed as a deficit. This deficit is currently visible across the board.

Thus, although the international policy discourse environment is likely to result in developing countries including gender in their policy frameworks, it does not necessarily lead to systematic integration of gender into the transport sector. Some countries were found to incorporate general statements on the consideration of gender in transport policy frameworks or project planning documents. However, in many cases this use of gendered language is likely to be as a result of the interaction with international donor agencies and is done in order to get funds. Rarely were these statements being translated in action.

Auditing is, therefore, necessary to ensure the integration of gender at the meso level. For example, national and regional transport policy institutions had no clear process

of identification of the gendered nature of the transport sector, how many men and women were working in the transport sector, who was planning the transport sector, what were women and men's transport needs and how were they met. That there was little understanding demonstrated of transport's role in maternal mortality, water management or in household survival strategies, for example, is an obvious and visible failure. There were, equally, no clear examples of processes by which women's and men's needs are incorporated into project design. It should also be borne in mind that auditing is a revenue expenditure item rather than a capital expenditure item. The bias towards capital expenditure items rather than revenue items favours external actors in the policy discourse and share of development resources: one-off construction contracts for roads on the basis of gender rationales with no follow up evaluation of actual beneficiaries is a not uncommon experience within the field of gender and transport.

The importance of auditing to the very lowest levels of the implementation hierarchy is clearly seen in the examples of projects which are funded on gender rationales but from which gender disappears as an issue or ground for action within the life of the project. Factors such as lack of capacity to implement gender actions, lack of monitoring indicators and resistance to change all feature in this disappearance. The case studies report such disappearances to be commonplace. There is no systematic database available on how often gender is 'lost' in this way, but it is something that requires further research and there is a need to fund a pilot project which scopes this dynamic.

This synthesis recommends that retrofitting is required to promote the integration of gender into transport policy in order to overcome institutional resistance to change within transport organisations. Externally-funded retrofitting is necessary to be able to undertake the identification of gendered transport needs, the auditing of policies and projects and the development of gender policy into transport action.

## **1 Introduction**

This synthesis is constructed from 10 case studies reports submitted as part of the World Bank-funded 'Integrating gender into transport investment programmes' project. The aim of the synthesis is to:

- Draw out the salient points and common themes from the various case studies
- Identify elements of good practice
- Identify common weaknesses
- Identify areas for further policy development or training

Each of the case studies followed a common analytical framework, detailed in earlier reports, that concentrated on looking at the case study project as part of the whole transport sector and looking at this sector as a gendered structure.

It is clear from the case study reports that a significant degree of consistency and comparability has been achieved across the case studies. This allows a substantial degree of confidence to be attached to the conclusions drawn from the synthesis of the collective case study reports.

The synthesis is constructed by comparing the range of projects described in the case study reports. The comparisons are made at different levels of enquiry, namely: the enabling environment; the institutions involved in the transport sector; the project level; and the gender outcomes (of the project's interventions).

The synthesis highlights a series of common threads and issues identified in all of the case study reports. Distinct differences are also identified and examples of good practice flagged for further attention. Overall conclusions are drawn from the collective findings of the case studies and pointers are identified for future action and research.

## **2 Enabling Environment**

### **2.1 Aim**

This section identifies the role of the overarching national constitutional, social and legal frameworks in creating an environment that promotes and enables (or constrains) gender equality in each case-study society.

### **2.2 Argument**

The argument set out in the literature review and in the case study methodology is of a need for a holistic understanding of the gendered nature of the transport sector within the wider context of a society's institutions, laws and social structures. For example, many countries have civil society institutions increasingly promoting greater gender equality. Many countries also have legislative frameworks and policy actions such as the development of National Women's Action Plans that promote greater gender equality. These all work to raise the awareness of gender equality and provide a field of action on gender. It is necessary to understand the macro policy and societal environment, as well as exploring its link to the integration of gender into transport policy. A positive enabling gender environment is a key first step to the integration of gender into transport.

Each case study therefore reports on a wide range of national gender policy issues in order to provide a context and a description of linkages between transport project components and the institutional and policy process in which they occur. Many of the case studies describe a national context in which National Women's Action Plans have been developed. Some case study countries, even have gender sensitive constitutional structures. Uganda, for example, has ratified the Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) and its 1995 constitution, which translated the obligation to gender equality into a commitment, is regarded as one of the most gender responsive in the region. Gender equality, as the Uganda case study describes, is entrenched in the constitution through a number of provisions that affirm the equality of all persons; it prohibits discrimination based on, amongst other things, sex and establishing the rights of disadvantaged, and requires the state to take active measures including affirmative action to redress the situation (Uganda, p.11). The South African Bill of Rights, as the South Africa case study describes, also recognizes the rights of women as being of equal importance to those of men (South Africa, p.4). China, the host of the 1995 UN Conference for Women, has also made significant progress in having gender equality as a major state policy. (China p5.)

Furthermore, in line with current good practice around gender mainstreaming, many nations' National Women's Action Plans have promoted the establishment of gender 'focal points' in line-ministries. In the Lesotho, for example, Gender Focal Points have been created in various line-ministries and institutions. These have been charged with the task of proposing appropriate and effective gender mechanisms within their institutions and providing support and direction for taking gender concerns into account in all aspects of planning and programming (Lesotho, p9)

In other case study countries there has been the creation of specialised institutional structures with specific mandates to promote gender issues. In Vietnam, the National

Committee for the Advancement of Women (NCFAW) was established in 1993. Its mandate was to promote the status of women and to provide advice to the Prime Minister's office on the development and implementation of the 5-yearly National Plans of Action for Women's Advancement (POA). The NCFAW has sub-branches (CFAWs) in 50 ministries and sectors and all 61 provinces and cities of Vietnam. (Vietnam, p2). In China, there has been created a National Working Committee on Women and Children (China, p6.)

These positive actions of establishing focal points and other supportive structures, as the studies have found, is not without problems. Such structures, are often reported as being under-resourced and tend to have other 'mainstream' responsibilities that constrain their ability to pay adequate attention to gender issues. In Vietnam, the established structures promoting gender equality (NCFAW and CFAW) had no budget or full-time members and staff that were separate from the Women's Union, and so whilst legally independent, was in fact part of the Women's Union. In addition, senior members of the Committee for the Advancement of Women also had other responsible posts, such as Vice-Chairs of provincial People's Committees or Vice Minister, and hence were often too busy to fulfil CFAW functions as well (Vietnam p2).

The position of newly-established gender equality structures, such as Gender Focal Points, in hierarchical, bureaucratic structures of government were also seen to have a significant impact on their effectiveness. In the case of Uganda, the Gender Focal Points either had other more "mainstream" sectoral responsibilities, and were either too high-up the hierarchy to devote time and energy to gender, or were too low down the hierarchy to be listened to. In addition, individuals at both central and local government level who were assigned to be the Gender Focal Point were often given no training in gender (Uganda p32).

Other gender policy frameworks can also act as a barrier to integrating gender into some sectors. Whilst in one case study, Uganda, it was reported that gender policy frameworks do mention transport as a priority in their action plans, in many of the other case studies there is a disconnection between the gender enabling environment and the transport sector. The Uganda study reported that the Social Development Strategic Investment Plan, which seeks to build the capacity of decision-makers and planning officers to mainstream gender equality, is targeting resources in 5 key sectors, namely: education, health, water, agriculture and roads (Uganda, p12). However, there are a number of case study countries where Action Plans or measures, such as establishing gender focal points, do not address transport policy or the transport sector. In China for example, the national gender machinery includes 24 ministries and 5 civil society organisations, but does not include the Ministry for Transport (China, p6). These discontinuities immediately establish a gap between gender and transport policy at the highest level. A failure of national transport sector professionals to engage in an international discourse about the integration of gender in the sector must play a part in this mismatch. In Lesotho, for example, the gender and development policy documents do not explicitly refer to measures to incorporate transport considerations into gender policy. They fail to address the issue even in the area of women's employment in the construction industry. This oversight to the transport sector is exacerbated by the fact that priority program areas identified in

such policy documents often cover most sectoral priority areas and strategies except the transport sector (Lesotho, p10).

Even within a positive enabling environment, there are examples presented by the case studies of inconsistencies in approach between different actors involved in national gender policy processes. In the Uganda case study, it was reported earlier that roads were seen as a priority area for the Gender Action Plan. However, it would appear that the lack of an interactive road sector SWAp process means donors are not able to back up the National Government priorities for gender action with respect to roads. (Uganda p16). (The mechanism adopted for providing donor agency involvement in the policy process involves having a Donor Co-ordination Group on gender, open to representatives from bilateral and multi-lateral donor organisations, that co-ordinates work on promoting gender equality and allows donor agencies to influence development policies by working through the Sector Wide Approach - SWAp),

Other policies also influence the development of an enabling gender environment. A number of the case study countries report the fact that central governments have begun to address the issue of gender-balance amongst political decision-makers. They have begun to implement policies, allied to decentralisation of governance, to increase the number of women who should be involved in local and regional decision-making assemblies by setting minimum levels of women representatives in a variety of fora. Uganda, Senegal and Peru reported having legislation that states that women shall form at least one third of all local councils. In the case of Uganda, affirmative action has also been taken in the higher education sector by awarding extra marks on entry grades to girls applying for places in university. This, it is hoped, will increase the available pool of women for professional posts and public office (Uganda, p13).

In Bangladesh, the case study argues that the discourse at national level around gender equality within democratic representative bodies, has yet only influenced urban areas, with urban municipal authorities having one-third of the seats reserved for women. (Urban Bangladesh, p7). In Peru, also, there is a policy measure to increase the profile of women within public office (Peru, p31). In Senegal there are targets set for women's participation in local democracy. Even in China, where since 1987 there has been a long-established and widespread practice of self-governance in rural areas, women are to be found in a minor role in village management, with women making up only 20% of village committee members in 2003 (China, p13).

In South Africa, these affirmative action policies are also extended to other elements of civil society. Legislation provides for special treatment for people who have been discriminated in the past. This is particularly noticeable in the workplace where many businesses and government have affirmative action policies in place. There is also a highly-visible approach within the government's procurement policies which indicate that the type of candidates required have to be either Black, female or disabled (South Africa, p5).

Interestingly, many of the measures outlined appear to set targets of participation that can be monitored. This greater involvement of women at local decision-making levels may lead to an increase in tackling women's practical needs in a bottom-up approach.



However, macro-level legislative measures and policy frameworks alone are rarely the only necessary driver for changes, and some case study reports highlight the fact that measures that attempt to achieve women's participation by quota are not without problems. In urban Bangladesh the status of women commissioners are undermined because of the lack of clearly defined responsibilities for women ward commissioners. Gender and power barriers in rural areas are also not immediately overcome by macro-level policy. In Senegal this has significantly affected efforts to promote women in local decision-making structures. Whilst national requirements state that at least 25% of all decision-making positions should be reserved for women, the case study found that within the 320 Rural Councils only 2 had elected a woman as president and there only 9% of the councillors were women (Senegal, p9). In South Africa also, progress in gender equality within decision-making arenas at national level will not automatically lead to progress at the meso, rural level, despite being the biggest consumers of resources and the hardest hit by the lack of facilities in rural areas (South Africa, p5).

### **2.3 Summary**

If one is to view change in the transport sector in a holistic manner, then an enabling policy environment at a macro-level that promotes gender equality is a crucial initial element for the integration of gender into this sector. Without such an enabling environment, it is likely to be very difficult to integrate gender effectively into the transport sector. Conversely, however, a macro constitutional, legal and social environment that promotes and enables gender equality will not, alone, be sufficient for the integration of gender into the transport sector.

The case studies reported a number of examples, such as Uganda, Senegal and South Africa, where an enabling environment is being created and where positive initiatives are being developed that promote gender equality in the national policy framework. These have influence at the macro policy development level and at a decentralised level as well. However, the case studies highlight the inadequacy of merely an enabling environment for the integration of gender into the transport sector. For whilst it is clear that these national-level initiatives are not always successful, it would appear that there is consistently a gap between the developing gender policy of a nation and its influence on that nation's transport policy. There is a consistent failing within the transport sector to translate or incorporate changes in the policy dialogue around gender equality into dialogue within the sector.

The Uganda case study provides perhaps the best example of a positive approach to translating national macro-level gender equity priorities into action within the transport sector. However, even here, the translation has not occurred across all of the transport sector, being restricted instead to the rural roads sector. Senegal, provides a much more typical example where national macro-level priorities appear not to have been translated to the meso, transport sector level in recognisable fashion.

Perhaps as significantly, several case studies (Senegal, Bangladesh and South Africa) outline changes to local governance structures to increase the relative gender balance of men and women in local government decision-making. These changes may have the effect of raising the profile of gender issues in transport and many other sectors from the bottom-up.

### **3 Institutional Analysis**

#### **3.1 Aim**

This section looks at the role of sector-wide transport policy on development of gender equality in the sector. It explores what role national transport policy has played in setting the gendered environment for particular transport projects. It also explores the extent of influence of the national transport policy on the case study transport project and vice versa.

#### **3.2 Argument**

*The gap between macro gender policy and the transport sector*

The case studies show significant gaps in the process of policy development between the developing gender policy framework in many countries and the transport sector policy. In Uganda, for example, an enlightened gender environment at the constitutional level does not transfer to roads policy. Road policy fails to explicitly state gender in its objectives and strategies and thus does not reflect the national commitment to gender-responsive development (Uganda, p14).

Even more remarkable is the case of South Africa where a substantial gap is documented between the enabling macro environment and transport policy. Despite the fact that the country has a gender-sensitive constitution and is in the vanguard of efforts to develop macro, gender-sensitive budget processes, this has not been translated into a gender sensitive national transport policy. The planning guidelines as set out in the National Land Transport Act 2000 do not articulate the main objectives of the constitution. The only way, the case study reports, that the rhetoric of the constitution has been accommodated is in the inclusion within the National Land Transport policy of some women termed 'special categories' or 'vulnerable and disadvantaged' and passengers with physical disabilities. It is one thing, the South African case study argues, to talk about gender-needs and it is something else to come up with strategies that would address those gender-needs. The South African constitution has good intentions that did not filter down to the national transport policy. The argument is that there is a gap between the macro-policy environment and the national transport policy. Consequently gender-needs are not adequately addressed (South Africa, p10).

China also exhibits a gap between the national transport policy and gender policy. This is, the case study argues, because the perception of the transport sector is one of an economic and technological driven sector, that has insufficiently addressed social impacts. It is also because the mechanism of implementation of gender policy is through women-centred organisations and not through integration of gender across all policy areas (China, p12).

The case studies do find some examples of where national transport policies have included an integration of gender issues. The Senegalese National Strategy on Rural Transport for instance, states that:

*...the strategy will be “implemented following a global, integrated and participative process, that takes gender issues, local contexts, capacities of groups and individuals into consideration.” (Senegal, p9).*

The Senegalese transport policies also identify in some cases the involvement of the necessary stakeholders to promote gender equality in the transport policy. These include the Ministry of Family, Social Action and National Solidarity, as well as the National Federation of Women's Association to be represented in the different bodies in charge of planning and the implementation. In addition, women and vulnerable groups will be part of the task forces set up by the Government for to oversee policy coordination (Senegal, p 9).

However, the Senegalese case study argues that some of these policy statements may be paying little more than lip-service to the idea of integrating gender, as what is written in policy documents may not be acted upon. Some policy statements may also be seen as necessary for external audiences such as donor agencies as evidence suggests that ministries that should be included in this process have not been involved (Senegal, p20).

Furthermore, institutional structures may already be gender bias, such that such policy statements will not lead to concrete measures that address gender inequalities. For example, the Senegal case study suggests that the distribution of the responsibilities among the institutions (State/Rural communities), as to who will provide funding for the establishment of the different roads, may negatively impact in the meeting of women's need as far as infrastructures are concerned. In the National Strategy for Rural Transport, the State will not allocate money for the funding of community roads, which in practice are more used by women than by men. Instead, the funding of the community roads is left to the rural communities, whose budget, the case study argues, clearly cannot afford it (Senegal, p12).

This is reinforced by some of the evidence from the China case study, which highlights some of the gender-bias assumptions that drive that country's transport sector. The study found that amongst transport sector professionals, many more men than women saw no gender issues in transport in China. Of those that did, more men than women saw the women's role in the sector as wives and mothers who could train their children and husbands road safety and as a potential workforce (China, p15).

Furthermore, as shown in the Lao case study, gender considerations may be integrated into policy but without robust auditing procedures such as mechanisms for setting targets, there may be no robust mechanisms for ensuring that policy is put into practice. The Strategic Directions for the Development of the Road Sector issued by the Lao Ministry of Communications, does acknowledge the importance of gender issues with respect to the improvement of rural road access. It includes goals and objectives to support wider national policy objectives of food security and poverty alleviation. It even includes objectives related to the establishment of more accountable management through the measurement and reporting of output-based key performance indicators. However, there are no key performance indicators for gender integration in the transport sector, which may undermine the efforts to promote gender integration and relegate such activities to secondary importance compared to those activities for which there are performance indicators to meet (Lao, p13).

The case studies also highlight other elements of the discontinuity between the enabling environment and transport policy. These include a lack of explicit incorporation of gender into transport policy documents, not treating gender as a cross-cutting issue and not targeting women as a specific disadvantaged group. All of these elements can reduce the effectiveness of integrating gender into the transport sector and of developing practical strategies for addressing gender issues.

We have seen that the transport sector policy in Uganda does not explicitly state gender as an objective, and that the road sector policy does not reflect national commitments to gender responsive development, posing a real challenge to overall development:

*Gender is regarded as a cross cutting concern and most SWAs indicate that it will be mainstreamed during the identification, design, implementation and monitoring of development interventions under the respective sector. However, considering gender as a crosscutting issue many times results into its invisibility in the sector overall and specific objectives, activities, indicators as well as the investment plans. This implies that unless special measures are taken, gender may be inadequately during implementation (Uganda, p9).*

Perhaps of equal interest, whilst the inclusion of gender in sector-wide transport policy was not found to be widespread and often not leading to clear action, there were certain sub-sector areas of transport policy, such as rural roads maintenance and construction, where it was more prevalent.

In particular, labor-based construction methods appears to be an area where awareness of gender issues is becoming more widespread. It is an area where the choice of technology is seen as providing a space to promote the participation of, and benefits to, women. It is also an area where government departments can be seen to be clearly addressing internal and external factors which have a bearing on the development of women. These include redressing the imbalances in staffing, maintaining an equitable representation of women at all levels, looking at procurement policies, and the promotion of construction methods that target the employment and training of women.

In Uganda, for example, the District, Urban, and Community Roads policy appears to be in contrast with the wider policy described earlier. Here the White Paper on Sustainable Maintenance of District, Urban and Community Access Roads could be seen as a watershed in an otherwise male-dominated transport sector. The paper allows for gender and women-specific provisions to be implemented which ensure as well as strengthen women's participation in decision-making around district, urban and community roads. It is all the more significant as this White Paper deals with those secondary roads that are largely used by the majority of poor people, including women, to secure their livelihoods.

In South Africa also, in contrast to lack of gender issues in the mainstream of South African transport policy, the case study highlights the fact that policy statements issued by a subsidiary ministry connected to rural road management appear to be more enlightened. The agencies responsible, the Department of Public Works,

acknowledges in its policy documents that there are a number of internal and external factors that have a bearing on the development of women. These include redressing the imbalances in staffing and maintaining an equitable representation of women at all levels within the organisation. External environmental factors include the application of measures and policies that promote optimal distribution of benefits to women, for example through the procurement reform policies. In addition, they cite the promotion of utilization of labor intensive construction methods that target the employment and training of women. In addition, the Department has translated such policy into action in the Community Based Public Works Program. Here, the department has introduced the Emerging Female contractors Development Program which identifies women with potential to establish businesses within the construction industry, who are then encouraged to establish and own their businesses through training workshops and networking (South Africa, p14).

It appears that some of this policy development may be happening in areas where transport sector policy is not as well integrated, as is desirable, or where responsibility for the implementation of transport policy is spread across several different ministries. This lack of integration may present an opportunity for positions in support of gender integration; it may be easier to support without the outright opposition often faced in the male-dominated spaces traditionally associated with mainstream transport policy.

In addition, the role of a well-established international discussion around the involvement of women in labor-based construction methods may also mean national policy-makers in this area (who are likely to interact with donor agencies) are used to using such language in policy statements. Much of the discussion connected with the incorporation of women into road maintenance focuses on an easily measurable target of participation. The fact that there is an auditable yardstick of achievement must have an impact on how readily this approach can be adopted as policy. However, all of this does not necessarily translate to action. Furthermore, this fragmented transport policy landscape also means that a policy discussion incorporating gender in one sub-sector will not transfer to action connected with the integration of gender in other transport sectors, such as road safety, public transport and freight transport.

At other sub-sector levels, outside the area of labor-based construction, there are few examples within the case studies of gender-aware transport policy. One notable exception, perhaps, is that of the creation of the policy of ‘feminisation’ of the traditional male preserve of the traffic police in Peru. Due to high levels of corruption in the traditional male-dominated Traffic Police force, many were replaced by police women. This was received with high levels of acceptance (around 70% in one survey) and also gives a different image of the police. As the Peru case study highlights through a series of interviews, the inclusion of women into the traffic police appears to have had a significant social and cultural impact on the Peruvian transport sector (Peru, p16). It appears to have changed overnight the public image of the traffic police, as well as recovered some of the credibility and confidence in their work.

### **3.3 Summary**

Enabling gender environments are not translating into an integration of gender into national transport policy within the case studies. Transport policy, in many of the case study countries, is resistant to an integration of gender issues. This is in stark contrast

to some significant progress in promoting gender equality at the macro level within these same countries. In the few cases where gender is included in a transport policy framework, as in Vietnam, it may be included for an external audience or for the purposes of securing external funds, and is certainly not translating into measures that are implemented. A lack of auditable targets that allow verification of the path from policy to implementation, and the presence of unchallenged gender-bias structures that prevent measures having concrete impacts on micro gender-equality, also minimise the impact on real lives of any progress made.

One area where some positive change is present is in the area of rural roads infrastructure and labor-based construction methods. A best practice example, amongst the case studies described, can be identified as Uganda, which is making change in the otherwise male-dominated sector. It is setting a clear route from policy to action. The use of external agencies, such as DANIDA, to act as a catalysts through additional and external resources, and to present a strong voice in the policy discourse, as well as easily auditable labor-force participation targets and the concentration of action in a subsidiary area of the transport sector may be significant in allowing progress in this sector. However, the long-term sustainability of an approach that involves significant involvement from outside agencies, also has to be questioned. Why this sub-sector should show greater progress at integrating gender into its investment projects, compared to other sub-sectors is also worthy of further study.

## **4 Project-level analysis**

### **4.1 Aim**

This section describes the experiences of the case study projects in their efforts to integrate gender into implementable measures and actions. It attempts to set out experiences around project preparation and design as well actual implementation.

### **4.2 Argument**

Here again there are two clear groupings around rural labor-based methods projects and others. It is useful to look first at projects connected to labor-based construction methods as a grouping. These projects present evidence of good practice on the incorporation of gender into projects.

#### *4.2.1 Project Preparation and Design: Labor-based construction projects*

The labor-based construction project case studies (Uganda, Lesotho and Bangladesh) represent a group of good practice in terms of integrating gender into the design of transport sector investments. They provide examples of integration of gender that influence project practice. The Second Road Sector Programme Support (RSPS2) project in Uganda, in particular, demonstrated good practice by explicitly stating a commitment to an active promotion of women's participation that filters down to project level, where equitable participation is factored in to project design. The RSPS2 project is intended to address the gender-balance within the roads sector by promoting women's participation as contractors and workers. The development of the RSPS2 project was a participatory process involving the Government of Uganda and the Danish Government agency, DANIDA as well as a variety of stakeholders at macro, meso and micro levels. The process also included gender reviews of the previous road sector projects (RSPS1) as well as an appraisal of measures proposed in the new project. These reviews highlighted the viability of mainstreaming in road sector work as well as gains and shortcomings of the earlier project that need to be considered in the new project. The Uganda case study highlights that based on this process, the following gender strategies were proposed for RSPS2

- i) building capacity at both national and district levels to address gender within the transport sector
- ii) incorporation of the transport needs of both women and men in the district and sub-country development plans
- iii) participation of women in the planning of transport interventions
- iv) providing information to women about employment opportunities in road works
- v) equal recruitment opportunities for women and men in labour-based road works
- vi) awareness creation of men to allow their spouses to participate in road works (Uganda, p21).

These programme level principals and processes translated into practical actions that were carried out, such as the design of the socio-economic component of a national trunk-road and a gender analysis into such traditionally-technical areas as the District management and works process (Uganda, p19).

In the design for projects in rural Bangladesh, communities appear to be clearly involved in the local priority setting stage as well as delivering road construction and maintenance. As a result, the project included building of women-only sections in local markets and involvement of community organizers within the project to form labor contracting societies with landless or destitute women for routine maintenance and tree plantation along the project roads. In addition, the implementation process was also influenced, resulting in the appointment of a project sociologist to supervise and monitor all gender and related activities (Rural Bangladesh, p5). The elements included also lend themselves to be easily measured and checked to ensure implementation has been achieved.

In the Lesotho case, government encouraged participation of local councils in the identification of access needs and constraints. In practice, it was reported that the actual technical design of micro level projects does not include local communities. For Lesotho, there appears an obvious gap between participation of community representatives *identifying* access problems, and the Department of Rural Roads prioritising and designing interventions without their consultation, which leads to projects that become 'white elephants' and are ineffective for community's needs.

Amongst this group of good practice projects, it is noteworthy to see what agencies were responsible for the design and implementation of projects. In some cases the responsibility for the design and implementation of the *programmes* under review was given to the public works department of government or a local government ministry, often with remote assistance (financial and in a monitoring and evaluation capacity) from the external funding agency.

In Lesotho, the demand for the programme came from the Department of Rural Roads (DRR), which at the time was different from the ministry responsible for transport policy. The DRR actively request the District Secretaries (of which there are ten) to compile and prioritise requests for funding infrastructure projects in the district, drawing on local councils comprising male and female village representatives. Subsequently, the DRR requests funding from a variety of donors for particular interventions. In the case of Ireland Aid, these are funded under their Rural Roads and Access Programme.

Rarely was a mainstream transport ministry the responsible agencies. It is perhaps reasonable to expect more gender integrated projects in subsidiary areas of a bureaucracy where projects may be less of a challenge to institutionalised gender bias.

However, even in the best practice example, the Road Sector Programme Support (RSPS) in Uganda, the role of external agencies is key. The inclusion of gender issues at the design stage of the program principally originated with DANIDA who commissioned a study that further elaborated gender concerns, alongside government actions that included women's participation in project preparation and design.

The external agencies also played a key role in monitoring progress towards the stated policy ends. It is also notable that as part of good practice, projects were able to audit



their performance and alter their implementation accordingly. It is also notable that even initial good practice design had not set robust indicators and measures that could be enforced.

In another example from the Uganda case study, the effectiveness of a review by a gender specialist highlighted a series of constraints including: coming on board late (when recruitment of the workers had already been completed); an initial lack of clarity about the functions and roles of the specialist; lack of a dedicated budget for gender-related activities resulted. This resulted in missed opportunities for incorporation of gender during the early implementation stages. As a result of this review it was recommended that i) future tender documents outline ToR for the specialist including objectives, outputs and activities; ii) the specialist is mobilised at the beginning of the project; iii) future contract documents make a provision for an operational budget for the specialist. As a result of this review, a model is now beginning to be developed that could be replicated across other road sector programmes (Uganda, p23).

Furthermore, in some projects at the local Ugandan level there are still issues that need addressing connected with the fact that the road construction, rehabilitation and maintenance sector is predominantly male-biased, and in Uganda the mindset of some labor based stakeholders (particularly contractors) is such that women are marginalised from the industry:

*“...the attitude that women cannot manage the work in road construction resulting into a male dominated labour force at all skill levels; the inadequacy of the labour camps to meet women's specific interests related to privacy and the necessity to practice subsistence farming to supplement their wages.” (Uganda, p18).*

#### **Community Perspectives**

*Culture dictates against women earning money. As such, most men will not allow their wives to work.*

*Husbands grab their wives' earnings from road works rationalising that since the women abandoned garden work, their wages should be used for the purchase of food. In addition, men often threaten to report their “transgressing” spouses to the clan heads and/or even divorce them. Consequently, many women have left the road project work for fear of losing their marriages.*

*The gender division of labour in the community also dictates that labour intensive work should be for men. Women are only supposed to engage in domestic work.*

*Some women are not comfortable working on the road for fear of negative public opinion. “I am a cook on the road project but female friends say they are ashamed to be seen doing men's work.”*

#### **Female Contractor Views**

*Men are erratic and impatient, they slow down the work. Women on the other hand, are more understanding. They concentrate more in labour based work and they produce quality work.*

*Labour-based work is energy demanding and sometimes the women fail to meet their targets.*

*Women often turn up late for work because of domestic chores and some work with their babies strapped on their backs thus reducing their output.*

*The rainy season comes along with a lot garden work and this affects work – women are affected more because they do the gardening.*

*Some of the women have not changed their attitudes and often want to do work that is related to their reproductive roles like cooking and collecting water other than break the ground on the road. Others only want to perform half tasks. (Uganda, p17).*

#### *4.2.2 Project Preparation and Design: Other projects*

Other case studies present a more varied analysis. The inclusion of gender in these projects is largely characterised by its failure to influence implementation. In particular, ‘gender’ goes missing between the initial project idea and the project planning documents, and between project planning documents and actual implementation.

For example, in this second group there appears the Urban Bangladesh case. The development of Dhaka Urban Transport Project (DUTP) emerged as a result of recommendations from studies conducted under the Planning Commission and UNDP, “Greater Dhaka Integrated Transport” study (DITS1994) that clearly included gender as quite an important component in a working paper “Mobility of Women”. Also there were a series of World Bank-funded preparation projects such as the “Gender Dimensions in Transport in the Dhaka Metropolitan Area” (NUK 1997). However, when the World Bank implementation project, Dhaka Urban Transport Project (DUTP) was established, even though a direct result of recommendations from DITS, there was no gender component within it. As the urban Bangladesh case study highlights, the earlier study (DITS) recognised that the women in Dhaka city are caught between conflicting pressures: traditional and religious values urge them to stay at home and refrain from contact with male strangers, while increasing economic hardship and the export led industrialization and intervention by the government and the NGOs are forcing women seek work and enter education. Furthermore, DITS recognised that the Bangladesh government has taken several steps to encourage participation of women in economic and educational activities and the success of these policies greatly depends upon women’s ability to access these opportunities. The rise of the ready-made garment industries has provided formal sector employment to women in Dhaka and Chittagong city, as women are a docile and largely non-unionized workforce. Transport, the DITS study acknowledged, is a male dominated sector and hence women’s mobility remains a cause for concern (Urban Bangladesh, p18).

Despite the identification of gender as an issue in the project preparation stages within the DITS study, the case study reports that the implementation measures that were funded fail completely to address any gender issues identified in project preparation. Instead they concentrate on the traditional elements of urban transport planning: that of developing road infrastructure, constructing flyovers, developing bus terminals and

bus routes and improving traffic flow management at intersections and across the road network.

Despite the loss of gender issues from the project, it was funded and is still ongoing. Here, it would appear, is a good example of a project funded on gender rationales but from which gender disappears as an issue or ground for action within the life of the project. Furthermore, the case study reported that:

*Discussions with the Dhaka Transport Coordination Board (DTCB) suggests that the DUTP has ignored the social aspect of DITS. Moreover the gender study (NUK 1997) carried out under the preparatory phase of DUTP project was not disseminated among the different stakeholders. (Urban Bangladesh, p19)*

A similar tale of losing gender between stages of a project's design, forms the background to the Lima Urban Transport Project, which has been flagged as an exemplar project to study from its good practice project design stages. However, the Peru case study concludes that gender issues were not clearly explicit in the Transport Rehabilitation Project, despite gender being clearly part of other World Bank work within the same country.

How widespread is the loss of gender in transport investment programmes between initial project preparation and approval is not clear from just these two cases. There is however, a clear need for systematic database that can provide evidence of the scale of loss as it may be a significant factor in the enthusiasm and commitment of both donor agency and national transport policy to integrate gender in future transport investments if gender is lost before a project is approved. Such a database will also support a case being made to improve and upgrade auditing and monitoring processes, as without the tools to help measure the scale of the problem, it will be difficult to support further action.

The role (both positive and negative) of external agencies in the promotion of integrating gender is also key in non-labor-based projects also. The Vietnam case study, describes the 'ownership' of a project's gender component as originating from the external actors, rather than the national agencies. It highlights the fact that the initiative for the first attempt to mainstream gender in the Waterways Authority through the Inland Waterways Project came from external donors and consultants. It was clear that whilst gender equality was not explicitly included in the objectives of the Project, in keeping with the Canadian CIDA policy on gender equality, gender was addressed as a cross-cutting issue throughout the project design, implementation and evaluation phases. In addition, international gender specialists and trainers were assigned to the project and mainstreaming gender was made an explicit function of the Project Manager (Vietnam, p7).

CIDA projects in China have also developed gender as a cross-cutting issue. These projects sought to build capacity to plan the transport sector and have included quotas and targets for training of women within the projects. It was found that such approaches to redress gender balances within the institutions met with mixed results. Attitudes amongst Chinese project staff were mixed and the case study concludes that a quota system may have limited effect on gender equality in the short term. It suggests that more training of senior personnel in gender awareness may have a

significant effect. It also suggests that it is important to set realistic targets for meeting gender equality and that qualitative indicators are as useful for measuring outcomes as quantitative targets. This case study also raises the issue of the mismatch between national and donor agency agenda's and as raises the question of whether it is reasonable to 'ask developing countries to jump to a higher quota of female participation in the transport sector than the Western world has traditionally and continues to have....in this field.' (China, p30).

Without the constant 'driving' of gender integration by external agencies, which is ultimately unsustainable, it would appear that there need to be clear mechanisms in place that will ensure integration is carried out by the implementing bodies.

### **4.3 Project implementation**

Those projects where gender is still integrated once the project has been approved were often reported to have difficulties in implementing the gender components. These problems can be characterised in the following ways and occur for a variety of reasons. These include:

- Lack of capacity or skills necessary to effectively deliver the gender components of the project,
- Differences in the emphasis put on prioritising the gender component between external project designs and internal project implementers.
- The difficulty of implementing gender projects in the male-dominated transport sector.
- Failure to put in place robust audit and monitoring mechanisms to ensure compliance in implementation,
- Allocation of resources within projects and the priorities set within project documents, particularly the gender priorities and focus set by the project plans.

#### **4.3.1 Lack of capacity or skills necessary to effectively deliver the gender components of the project,**

Case studies reported failures in project systems, such as recruitment processes, that led to the involvement of consultants who were not sufficiently technically qualified. The example of Senegal suggests such failures could lead to the significant degradation of gender components within a project. In the Senegal case study, training was held on gender and transport and participatory approaches. According to several managers who were involved in the course, "the consultants who provided the training were not competent". They argued that gender as an approach to analyse, understand and transform power relations within Senegalese society is not yet understood (Senegal, p21).

Further examples were given of where there existed limited technical capacity to provide some of the gender specialist support for project implementation. For example in the Lao case, the project assumed a level of institutional capacity that did

not appear to exist. There was a general lack of capacity to identify, design, and implement the project components targeting women. In addition, substantial efforts would be needed to build and improve the technical capacity, managerial and administrative skills of executing and implementing agencies (Lao, p28).

#### 4.3.2 Differences in the emphasis put on prioritising the gender component between external project designs and internal project implementers.

The case studies found that, the leading role of the external agency in the integration of gender into a project or program, might mean that without sufficient monitoring gender components of projects may not properly implemented by internal agencies. One example is the Vietnam case study, where a national government agency was reluctant to confirm whether they had any noteworthy contribution or participation in gender equality activities. In fact in their description of the project, the Gender Strategy was developed by the international consultants and VIWA counterparts played a passive role of informants and workshop participants. Nobody even had seen the Gender Equity Action Plan in Vietnamese. Furthermore, poor communication limited the opportunity for many women and men to contribute to the process. This apparent lack of the government agency's ownership of the Gender Strategy could potentially limit the impacts and sustainability of the gender activities (Vietnam, p 11).

In the case of South Africa, the service provider responsible for parts of the project implementation was an external agency which promoted a gender-view being integrated into the project as it was being implemented. In the project design, gender was not specified as a consideration and it was only after the service provider had realised the impact that the programme implementation could have on self-employed women that it was included. This highlights the role that could be provided by external agencies in retrofitting gender into projects, though here again for success, auditing processes that allow internal and external agencies to check against demonstrable progress are key (South Africa, p6).

#### 4.3.3 The difficulty of implementing gender projects in the male-dominated transport sector.

Many of the case study examples clearly highlight resistance to change within the male-dominated sector. Integration of gender in transport programs will encounter many such occurrences, and a transparent process of auditing sectoral approaches to gender equality is necessary if gender integration is not to be diluted. This is demonstrated clearly in the Vietnam case study. Within the Vietnamese waterways project it was realized that a number of gender activities were dependent upon an unconnected institutional restructuring process, against which there could be resistance. It was therefore decided to concentrate on those gender activities that targeted individuals. This scaling-down had significant effects on the outcome of the gender activities within the project. The case study report describes gender activities as busy in the first half of the project implementation, and based on the Reports, the gender Action Plan was physically fulfilled. With the training and study tour criteria explicitly encouraging women's participation, the female participation rate on training courses was 21%, higher than the general proportion of females in the labor force. Under the project advocacy, VIWA appointed two more women to lead MIS and financial sections, increasing the number of women in the management team to 3. The

majority of management staff of VIWA received gender awareness training and knew that CIDA had a policy on gender equality. Gender criteria were explicitly included and practically promoted in implementation of CLIF. Even these results, however, were far below the initial expectation of the Gender Strategy of the Project. By contrast, the case study reports that the scaling down of gender activities has resulted in gender activities calming down. The section on the progress of gender activities has even been removed from the Semi-annual Reports of the project since the 4<sup>th</sup> (in total 7 Reports). And in the Project Final Report Draft, the report on gender activities within the project, was missing at the time of reporting (Vietnam, p10).

#### 4.3.4 Failure to put in place robust mechanisms to ensure compliance by external contractors,

Several of the case studies show the importance of having compliance structures in place. The Uganda best practice case clearly shows that effective monitoring is necessary to ensure success in all stages of process. In this case it was found that as a result of the inadequacy of mechanisms to ensure contractor compliance with the conditions laid out in the contract, the majority of the contractors did not adopt flexible working hours and neither were separate facilities provided for women on most sites; the argument being that road works were within the range of the workers' own homes. For the one contract executed away from residential areas, however, a road camp with separate facilities was constructed. However, no shelters were provided for breastfeeding mothers. In addition, the gender sensitivity of the recruitment process varied. The majority of the contractors provided equal employment opportunities for both women and men through advertising on market days and through community as well as local government administrative structures. Others, however, pass information of potential work opportunities to communities through their mostly male staff, thus often limiting women's participation (Uganda, p28).

The enforcement of such monitoring is also necessary and the Lesotho example illustrates that private sector compliance is more difficult to manage. Here it was found that the compliance rate is higher in works carried out through the Rural Roads Department's (DRR) own labor force compared to those works contracted out. The reason for this, the case study argues, is obvious. Being a Government department, DRR has to be seen to be in the forefront of implementing government policies. On the contrary, the private contractors' outlook is different. In fact, one male private-sector contractor interviewed was resistant to the idea of complying with the spirit of the gender mainstreaming initiative. In his view "he wouldn't like to see more women involved in road construction because they affect productivity, deadlines and task duties." (Lesotho, p15).

The China case study makes a case for using both qualitative and quantitative monitoring. It claims that numbers alone do not give a comprehensive indication of how successful a project has been in gender terms. Monitoring in qualitative terms, the case study argues is also useful and can give invaluable lessons to be learnt in developing gender equality (China, p30).

#### 4.3.5 Allocation of resources within projects and the priorities set within project documents, particularly the gender priorities and focus set by the project plans.

Examples provided by the case studies show that resource allocation is also a key factor to successful implementation. Gendered financial monitoring is also a necessary tool in ensuring project success, as well as other more output oriented systems. For example, in the Senegal case study, available budget data is not gender disaggregated and so it is not possible to see to what amount of money has been spent on activities targeted at women compared to men (Senegal, p24).

### **4.4 Project learning**

Monitoring and evaluation is key to the development of project knowledge. It ensures that projects maintain a direction towards their planned objectives and it also ensures that the lessons from a project are learned and best practice is fostered across the development sector as a whole. Monitoring and evaluation was also clearly highlighted in the case study reports as an area where gaps appeared. There appears a mismatch between the desire to show a project had met its planned gender-focussed outcomes and through lack of gender-sensitive monitoring indicators, its ability to do so or to rectify any divergence from the desired outcome before the project-end. Examples were cited by the case study reports where the reality of monitoring and evaluation, appeared not to reflect the gender priorities set out in the project design. In Vietnam, for example, the case study reports several levels of monitoring during the project implementation, and the higher the level of monitoring the more powerful it was (both in terms of decision making and money control power). Conversely, the local voice was less important, and women's participation was almost unnecessary. Furthermore, the Project Fund Management and the provincial officials had much better technical expertise than commune staff. As a result, albeit with some variation, projects often achieved a very high quality of construction and contract management, because what the monitoring thought important and allied with the technical skills available, at the expense of its achievement in building beneficiaries management capacity and communication between waterway inspectors and population (Vietnam, p14).

Another example of a project unable to show it has met its intended impacts on meeting the transport needs of low-income households and women in particular, is the Peru case study. Here the case study reports that the person responsible for the handling of the 'bike' element of the project, pointed out that the requirements specified to be able to apply to the Plan Bike were very restrictive; but in spite of this a good quantity of people benefited with this Plan. However, the project mechanisms were not able to target particular social groups and so it was likely that vulnerable and socially excluded groups were not impacted by this intervention in any convincing way (Peru, p23).

In the project-level analysis, some case study reports showed that some projects had, through effective monitoring and auditing progress, become aware of disparities and shortfalls within projects and were able to be rectified either within a project's lifetime or in subsequent projects. For example, with the benefit of hindsight, the Ugandan RSPS has been able to learn from its weaknesses, but also demonstrating the viability

of mainstreaming gender in road works. Hence, RSPS2 was born, and although in its infancy, the new programme seeks to strengthen areas that were previously inadequate. The program seeks to:

- i) build capacity at both national and district levels to address gender within the transport sector
  - ii) incorporate the transport needs of both women and men in the district and sub-country development plans
  - iii) the participation of women in the planning of transport interventions
  - iv) provide information to women about employment opportunities in road works
  - v) provide equal recruitment opportunities for women and men in labour-based road works
  - vi) create awareness amongst men to allow their spouses to participate in road works.
- (Uganda, p21).

RSPS2 has introduced 'gender capacity development plans' that have very specific proposed (gendered) actions for each component of the programme (these being road sector institutions, labor-based training, national gravel roads, district roads and community access).

Similarly, the Bangladesh Rural Integrated Development Plan is the third to take place since the Asian Development Bank financed the first project, beginning in 1988. The Local Government Engineering Department have given special attention to gender issues in RIDP3, with a sociologist supervising gender issues from LGED headquarters, and a Gender Action Plan was prepared to address gender issues highlighting objectives, target groups, indicators, activities and targets.

In contrast, Ireland Aid's Lesotho rural roads and access programme is a revolving three year program, and whilst it is implemented in exactly the same process, it does benefit from policy level improvements, such as the Lesotho gender and development policy, and internal Ireland Aid documents that seek to implement gender policies in all their programs. As a result, whilst the project is ongoing the government, together with Ireland Aid, are making strides to improve the M&E process with Ireland Aid insisting that DRR carry out full impact assessments, six months after project completion (Lesotho, p18).

However, the degree to which other projects are able to rectify the gaps and inconsistencies identified is a potential cause for concern. Thought should be given to consider ways in which projects could have good gender practice 'retrofitted' on to them.

#### **4.5 Summary**

Many examples have been found by the case studies of projects that include gender to varying degrees. Most notable of these examples are projects that feature labor-based road construction elements. There is a cluster of good practice (Uganda, Rural Bangladesh and Lesotho) within this group of case study reports. Projects appear to have common features:



- They appear to be designed with clear elements within project that address gender issues
- They clearly identify actions that comply with such a gender focus
- They appear, through the use of ILO standards around 30% of labor-construction teams being composed of women, to achieve clearly measurable objectives that project teams can work to.

However, there are many examples of gaps between planned and actual outcomes. Some projects started to include gender issues in project preparation and then failed to include them in final project design. Some projects incorporated gender components into project planning documents but then have had difficulty achieving these aims in implementation. Other projects have also been able to recognise such shortfalls and rectify them over time whereas some projects find this recovery much more difficult. Here again there appear to be common features to failure and these are:

- Lack of capacity or skills necessary to effectively deliver the gender elements of the project
- Differences in the emphasis put on prioritising the gender component between external project designers and internal project implementers
- The difficulty of implementing gender projects in the male-dominated transport sector
- Failure to put in place robust audit and monitoring mechanisms to ensure compliance in implementation
- Allocation of resources within projects and the priorities set within project documents, particularly the gender priorities and focus set by the project plans.

However, the degree to which other projects are able to rectify the gaps and inconsistencies identified is a potential cause for concern. Thought should be given to consider ways in which projects could have good gender practice ‘retrofitted’ on to them.

## 5 Gender outcomes

### 5.1 Aim

This section synthesises the variety of individual and community experiences reported in each of the case studies. This section does not begin to do justice to the richness of data presented in the case study reports. However, key issues will be highlighted.

### 5.2 Argument

#### 5.2.1 *Labor-based construction and maintenance projects*

In terms of most of the significantly positive outcomes at the micro level, are again the labor-based road construction and rural infrastructure projects

In terms of actual implementation, the conditions for women working on labor-based construction projects varied among case studies. The physical activities and ‘task grades’ of female labor also varied considerably, with women being tasked with excavating to level, ditching, spreading of gravel and routine maintenance in Lesotho. In Bangladesh, women are principally involved in the periodic maintenance of roads and structures including maintenance of earthen embankments, care of trees and cleaning of structures.

In the most part, women and men are now being given equal rights as laborers, with regard to working hours and income. This was not always the case, for example, until 1999/2000, women laborers in Lesotho were only employed on a food-for-work basis, whilst their male counterparts were paid cash. However, since the Department of Rural Roads was formed, this imbalance has been rectified. By contrast, in Bangladesh, women are receiving lower wage rates than men, and accept the situation because of the skills they have earned and the fact they are more employable, not to mention their bargaining position for fee rates on future projects (Rural Bangladesh, p15). Interestingly, contractors on the RSPS in Uganda were encouraged to use task fee rates instead of daily fee rates to ensure equitable remuneration of women, relative to men (i.e. based on the physical accomplishment of tasks) (Uganda, p.24)

An area that was reviewed except in the Lesotho case study, was that of physical working conditions and facilities available to women on site. However, these proved difficult to influence. A recommendation, for example, for separate toilet and shower facilities to be provided in labor camps to facilitate women’s participation by the Uganda RSPS was not realised (Uganda, p28).

With regard to actual outcomes of projects on women in the community, the projects under the Rural Infrastructure Development Project (RDIP) in Bangladesh have components designed specifically for women e.g.:

- Provision of an exclusive area for women vendors in growth centre markets
- A passenger shed for women including separate latrines and garbage pits at the rural ghats
- Separate provision for women’s emergency need at flash flood refuges

This case study reported positive impacts for women, particularly in terms of opportunity and empowerment. The project allowed women to access income and through it build social capital, through trust and the respect that comes with employment, that would not have been possible before. There still remain however, questions over the long-term sustainability that needs addressing. One ‘vignette’ is set out below:

*Julekha Begum is from Panchagarh. She is 28 years old. She has education level of grade five. Julekha got married at the age of 15. Her son was born after one year of her marriage. After five years she gave birth of one daughter but her husband left her and went to some other place before the birth of her daughter. At that time she had to move to her father's house. Now she is living with 12 years old son Bashir and 7 years old daughter Beena in her father's house. She became destitute as her husband left her with children. She survived by working in neighbours/villagers house as maid.*

*Julekha joined RDP-21 late 2000. She got selection as LCS member of RDP-21 through lottery system. She maintains the road side and look after the plantation provided by the project. She received one day training after joining the project. According to her two years time is very short to make the plants/trees sustainable. She mentioned that project should provide the supporting bamboo or stick for the plants. In rainy season she faces problem to collect soil to maintain the road.*

*After joining RDP-21 she has become independent with reasonable earning. After having IGA training she mortgaged in some land with the money she saved when she was working in the project. She spent Tk 2,500 to mortgage in this piece of land. In addition to that she invested Tk 1,000 in money lending business from her own savings. Now Julekha earns Tk 80 and Tk 75 per month from the land and credit from the lent money.*

*Julekha believes that RDP-21 should employ them for two more years. This additional year would help these women to become totally independent. At present condition at the end of 2<sup>nd</sup> year they start to become independent. So this support should continue for two more years. Right now some of the women cannot stand on their own foot after their termination from the job.*

*Right now Julekha is no more destitute she has honor in the society. She is empowered with decision making power as well as some amount of money. She does not have to depend on any body any more. She earned the skill to accommodate and establish her own right in the society.*

*Before joining RDP-21 Julekha did not have any savings. Now she has invested some money on land and credit business and earning Tk 155 per month. Right now she is again working in peoples' house and getting food from there.*

*Julekha is planning to buy a cow with the RDP-21 forced saved money. She kept that money in the bank. In addition to that she is also thinking to buy land. She wants to give good life to her children. Her economic condition was better when she was working in RDP-21. After the termination her condition has deteriorated again. She wishes to join any other LGED project work again if there is any scope. (Rural Bangladesh, p.18).*

It is interesting to note that employment is viewed as a means to an end, not as a career opportunity in itself. Other impacts within this project include:

- Increased access to employment and other opportunities
- Access to education and training and thus greater capability
- Access to transport services and greater affordability of transport, thus also increasing opportunity
- Access to social capital (enhanced self-confidence, trust and respect) increasing empowerment

However, negative impacts of the project were reported, particularly around reduced security and capability. Also cited, however, were:

- Increased road accidents, thus decreasing security
- Spread of HIV/AIDS decreasing capability
- Teenage pregnancy decreasing capability

In the Uganda project a noticeable impact on people's economic opportunities and social capital levels, particularly that of women, was reported. The story of one woman who became involved in the program can be used as an example:

*I am a 55-year-old married woman. I live at the cultural centre, the home to the war-displaced persons in Lira district. The rebel Lord's Resistance Army (LRA) forced me and my family to flee our home in Otwal sub-county, Apac district. I escaped with my husband, a traditional healer, and my 8 war-orphaned grandchildren, leaving my farmland. We were all dependent on my husband's meagre earnings until the Managing Director of Gender Enterprises Uganda Limited came to our camp to recruit workers. I was one of the few lucky ones. My husband allowed me to sign up for the road works since he realised that we were fighting for survival. Although we still experience shortages, the income from the road--Sh2500/= (US\$ 1.25)-- has been very helpful. I can now buy clothes and food for my grandchildren. At my age, the work is quite hard and in many cases I am too weak to work due to hunger. There is scarcity of food in the camp. Lucy Amenya, female labourer, Ereda-Boroboro road, Lira district. (Uganda, p.28).*

The Uganda project is also notable for its promotion of women contractors.

In the Lesotho project, here again positive impacts on opportunities, capability and in this case security when using tracks and paths were recorded. Impacts included the ability to cross rivers easily and more frequently, the ability to transport more goods using carts and bicycles than by head-loading, the ability to increase income generated and the ability to transport the sick and the dead and access a range of services and social needs more easily (Lesotho, p24).

However, in terms of labor-based construction projects, a lack of consultation with communities, particularly of women, can often erode other positive outcomes. For example, projects in Lesotho were found to become obsolete because communities fail to use them for the following reasons:

- Afraid of heights (in cases of footbridges) – thus reducing security
- Roads located in the wrong place – thus not impacting on opportunity
- There being no means of transport on which to travel, even after public works improvements – having no actual impact on opportunity
- Even with improved infrastructure the transport services available to women are too costly – they are a luxury, so there has been little impact on opportunity

Other negative impacts of the infrastructure projects revolved largely around reduced security, including:

- Incidences of increased crime – leading to a reduction in security
- Loss of lives due to working conditions – leading to a reduction in security
- Loss of customers to big business in towns – leading to a reduction in opportunity
- Incidences of accidents due to vehicles that are not road-worthy – leading to a reduction in security

#### *5.2.2 Non-labor-based method projects*

Other non-labor-based methods projects, such as the one in South Africa where a national bike promotion project was established, do report positive outcomes in opportunity, capability and empowerment. They report that men, women and children had improved access, from the bicycle promotion scheme, to education, jobs, markets and health-care, improved quality of life and reduced time spent travelling (South Africa, p22).

The project has particular positive outcomes in terms of economic opportunity for women through the increase in small enterprise owned by women, as expressed below:

#### *Roles the bicycles played in stimulating small enterprises with special reference to women.*

The indication from the South Africa case study was that the presence of the bicycles has improved the level of efficiency of the small entrepreneurs who use them. Also, there has been a noticeable increase in the number of women who are small entrepreneurs who rely on the bicycles to conduct their business. (South Africa, p.24).

The project may also, in influencing perceptions, lead to a longer-term increase in opportunity if women can access a wider range of income-generating opportunities.

#### *General perception of men on women who ride bicycles*

The indication from the South Africa case study is that the older men still viewed women who ride bicycles in a strange way. Younger men accepted the fact that women can also ride bicycles. Few women appeared to ride bicycles because men do not support the idea of women who ride bicycles (South Africa, p24).

However, due to failures in implementation, it currently has the potential, unless it is rectified, of also reducing economic opportunity for some groups, particularly for

women shop owners, by introducing increased uncertainty over income streams. Payment was proving unreliable as well as the supply of bikes being unable to meet demand. Such risks may have significant impacts on the survival strategies of women shopkeepers and their households and may increase the chances of project failure.

Furthermore, in terms of the impact on security, the project has the potential of reducing security especially for women, through the use of bicycles on roads not adapted for successful bicycle use, unless it is rectified.

### 5.2.3 Safety issues

Safety was a concern for the majority of the people in the South Africa case study. But no initiative has been taken to improve the level of safety for cyclists in the communities. Suggestions were made with regard to safety paths and gear. There was a wish for more traffic officials to ensure the safety of officials. Lastly, learners could be taught at school to ride safely.

A provincial department of transport official in Limpopo province indicated that they were about to introduce cycling safety lessons in schools when the program started to show signs of falling apart. A small booklet with the title 'Cycling Book' stands proof of this. In addition, some traffic officials were also preparing to teach the best way to cycle. This stage is yet to be reached but will continue as soon as the process of learning and mapping the way forward is complete (South Africa, p24).

*Some case studies also report failures project design in terms of the difference in outcomes between the planned and reality. Several case study reports highlight the fact that projects are focused on infrastructure maintenance or construction without measures to promote the provision of transport services to use the improved infrastructure. This is largely due to a failure in procedures to allow participation in the project process and lack of monitoring to allow community participation as the project is implemented. One example, from Senegal, states that whilst community roads may be provided, as part of the National Rural Infrastructure Project, communities particularly the women within those communities reiterate the need for transport services to be provided along this infrastructure. Without available, affordable and safe transport services the infrastructure is of little direct benefit to the communities. (Senegal, p19)*

Such an approach will lead to a significant gap between the project activities and gender outcomes. In addition, a further gap is in the area of security. It would appear that a number of projects whilst having noticeable impacts on opportunity, capability and empowerment have not been designed to address the security element of the poverty framework. A number of projects as set out above highlight negative outcomes over security to set against positive outcomes in other poverty reduction elements.

## 5.3 Summary

This section has sought to assess the nature of gendered outcomes from the projects examined. Case study reports highlight a range of positive outcomes from projects. In particular, a number of labor-based construction (Uganda and Lesotho) and rural

infrastructure projects (Bangladesh) appear to have noticeable positive impacts on gendered outcomes of opportunity and empowerment. Other projects also have positive impacts on gendered opportunity outcomes. However, here again gaps and inconsistencies appear. Many of the case studies report negative impacts on gendered outcomes around security. It appears that very few of the case studies explicitly design for the impact projects may have on gendered security. Furthermore, there appear to be inconsistencies in the understanding of the effect that project activities will have on outcomes. A number of projects seek to improve infrastructure, yet communities are clear that positive outcomes from such activities will be much reduced unless enhanced transport services follow such infrastructure improvements.

## 6. Conclusions and recommendations

This report has synthesised the findings of 10 separate case study report from 9 countries across the developing world and highlight common factors. The use of a common analytical framework has succeeded in developing a dataset across all the case studies that allows comparisons to be made. The analytical framework was developed explicitly to view transport projects as part of a gendered transport sector. It was designed to understand project action in the context of the macro framework of national gender policy, gendered nature of governmental resource allocation and gendered social structure. It was also designed to explore a project action in the context of the institutions involved, at the meso-level, in developing and implementing a project, the gendered nature of these institutions, their policies and processes. Finally it was designed to capture the more widely-reported gender characteristic of the households and individuals that, at the micro-level, projects were intended to impact upon.

As a result of this framework, the synthesis has also succeeded in constructing a different interpretation to that of many previous analyses of donor-promoted gender and transport research projects. It has done this by developing a coherent understanding of 10 projects within their respective macro gender and transport policy frameworks and their meso level institutional contexts, as well as providing a commentary on their micro level impacts.

The findings depict efforts to integrate gender into transport policies, programmes and projects as full of gaps, inconsistencies and mismatches.

The best practice example of Uganda found within the case studies reveals a gap between the national gender framework and gender's consistent inclusion in the transport sector.

The bulk of the other cases reveal substantial gaps. A gender-enabling environment found in many of the case study countries is consistently not translated into practice across the transport sector.

The international policy discourse environment is likely to result in developing countries including gender in their policy frameworks - this does not necessarily lead to systematic integration of gender into the transport sector. Some countries were found to incorporate general statements on the consideration of gender in transport policy frameworks or project planning documents. In many cases this use of gendered language is likely to be as a result of the interaction with international donor agencies and is done in order to get funds. Rarely were these statements being translated in action.

**Recommendation 1. Auditing is, therefore, necessary to ensure the integration of gender at the meso level.** For example, national and regional transport policy institutions had no clear process of identification of the gendered nature of the transport sector, how many men and women were working in the transport sector who was planning the transport sector, what were women and men's transport needs and how were they met. That there was little understanding demonstrated of transport's role in maternal mortality or in household survival strategies, for example, is an



obvious and visible failure. Equally, there were, no clear examples of processes by which women's and men's needs are incorporated into project design. It should also be borne in mind that auditing is a revenue expenditure item rather than a capital expenditure item. The bias towards capital expenditure items rather than revenue items favours external actors.

The importance of auditing to the very lowest levels of the implementation hierarchy is clearly seen in the examples of projects which are funded on gender rationales but from which gender disappears as an issue or ground for action within the life of the project. Factors such as lack of capacity to implement gender actions, lack of monitoring indicators and resistance to change all feature in this disappearance. The case studies report such disappearances to be commonplace.

**Recommendation 2. A database needs to be created of how often gender that is included in the project preparation fails to make it into implementation.** There is no systematic database available on how often gender disappears in this way, but it is something that requires further research and there is a need to fund a pilot project which scopes this dynamic.

**Recommendation 3. There is, in the short-term therefore, a need for the World Bank and other donors to develop a 'retrofit' capability for projects.** There is a need for policies, programmes and projects to be able to set up processes to identify gendered transport needs. There is a need for them to be able to develop gendered auditing procedures to ensure that once included in project preparation, gender components are carried to project approval and then implemented successfully.

**Recommendation 4. There is a need to provide a resource for projects to allow them to undertake such auditing.** This should be a resource composed of a network of experts from across the developing world (not parachuted in from Washington but drawn upon in-country). The network of Case Study consultants, we have established for this project could be a start to it - or even establishing face-to-face talking and learning opportunities with other projects such as labour-based methods that appear further along the road to integration. It could also provide tools and indicators to enable the identification of needs and effective auditing processes. Without this 'retrofit' capability any amount of training for future projects will not save the ongoing projects and their failure will damage the overall cause of integrating gender.

**Recommendation 5. In the longer-term, there needs to be substantial future change to how gender is integrated in transport policy.** Efforts need to be expended to change institutional processes to allow better linkages between country's transport policy and ongoing gender policy activity. There needs to be more open gender-balanced processes around the development of policy. There needs to be clearer, more transparent linkages from a transport policy and the programmes, measures and projects that arise from that policy. There also needs to be clearer links between initial project plans and actual approved projects and there also needs to be much tighter links between what is planned and actually implemented, together with the creation of a gender-aware monitoring and evaluation culture that allows initiatives to learn.

**Recommendation 6. In addition, there is a need for further research.** It would be most productive to research further the reasons and factors behind the rise in take-up of practice around women's greater involvement in labour-based construction methods with a view to seeking lessons for take-up in other transport sub-sectors (e.g. urban transport, rail, etc) of efforts to integrate gender into investment programmes.

## **7 References**

- Bop, C. (2003) Senegal Case Study: National Rural Infrastructure Project  
Gutierrez, M (2003) Peru Case Study: Transport Rehabilitation Project  
Khatun, H (2003) Bangladesh Case Study Report: Rural Infrastructure Development Project  
Jie Du and Kurz, J (2003) China Case Study: Comprehensive Transport Management Training Project.  
Mahapa, S. (2003) South Africa Case Study: Shova Kalula Project  
Ntho, M and Tsikoane, T. (2003) Lesotho Case Study: Rural Roads and Access Programme  
Phengkhay, C (2003) Lao Case Study: East-West Corridor Project  
Tanzarn, N. (2003) Uganda Case Study Report: Road Sector Programme Support  
Uyen, N. (2003) Vietnam Case Study Report: Rural Infrastructure Rural Waterway Project  
Zohir, S C (2003) Bangladesh Case Study Report: Dhaka Urban Transport Project