

**INTEGRATING GENDER INTO WORLD BANK FINANCED  
TRANSPORT PROGRAMS**

**COMPONENT 1**

**CASE STUDY SUMMARY & FINAL REPORT**

**PREPARED BY IC NET**

**JUNE 2004**

# Table of Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Case Study Summary and Recommendations .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>Rationale for the World Bank to Invest in Gender Mainstreaming in Transport Projects .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>3</b>	<b>Methodology .....</b>	<b>5</b>
	3.1 Framework for Country and Case Study Selection.....	5
	3.2 Literature Review.....	6
	3.3 The Study.....	7
<b>4</b>	<b>Lessons Learned .....</b>	<b>12</b>
	4.1 Major Findings of the Case Studies .....	12
	4.2 Country-Specific Actions Taken .....	13
<b>5</b>	<b>Institutional Analysis.....</b>	<b>15</b>
	5.1 The Gap between National Gender Policy and the Transport Sector.....	15
	5.2 Gender in the Labor-Based Rural Roads Sub-Sector.....	16
<b>6</b>	<b>Project-Level Analysis.....</b>	<b>18</b>
	6.1 Project Preparation and Design: Labor-Based Construction Projects.....	18
	6.2 Project Preparation and Design: Other Projects .....	19
	6.3 Problems in Project Implementation .....	20
	6.4 Common Features in Project Implementation Success and Failure.....	22
<b>7</b>	<b>Gender Outcomes .....</b>	<b>23</b>
	7.1 Labor-Based Construction and Maintenance .....	23
	7.2 Gender Outcomes in Other Projects.....	26
	7.3 Other Issues.....	26
<b>8</b>	<b>Conclusions and Recommendations.....</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>Box 1</b>	<b>Feminization of the Police in Peru .....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>Box 2</b>	<b>A Rural Bangladesh Success Story.....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>Box 3</b>	<b>The Shova Kalula National Bicycle Program in South Africa --- A Case of Enhancement in Safety and Mobility .....</b>	<b>27</b>

# 1 Case Study Summary and Recommendations

The World Bank in November 2001 commissioned IC Net Limited of Japan to carry out a study titled “Integrating Gender into World Bank Financed Transport Programs” in accord with the terms of reference (TOR) issued in June 2001. The study was financed by a grant from the Japanese Large Studies Trust Fund. The contract came into effect on 15 December 2001 and covers the period to 15 June 2004. IC Net was to work in association with TRL Limited and the International Forum for Rural Transport and Development, both of the United Kingdom.

The TOR defines the overall objective of the study as follows: “to assist the World Bank and other international development agencies, developing country governments and NGOs, to improve the efficiency and equity of transport policies and programs through ensuring that projects respond to the needs of both women and men”.

This objective was pursued through two streams of activities:

“(a) a world-wide survey to review and document transport and gender initiatives promoted by the World Bank and other agencies to identify best practice in the identification, design, implementation and evaluation of these initiatives” and

“(b) developing training material and reference documentation which will make the findings and recommendations of the studies easily accessible to transport project managers, planners and policy makers around the world. The training material will be disseminated through websites and printed media, supported where appropriate by other electronic media such as CD ROM and video, to ensure world-wide dissemination and use of the findings”.

The TOR divided the work into two sequential components matching the two streams of activities:

- Component 1: An international survey of experiences and promising approaches in the integration of gender into transport policies and programs
- Component 2: Preparation of training material based on findings and lessons learned from the survey.

This report brings together the findings of ten case studies from nine countries (China, Laos, Vietnam, Bangladesh [two studies], Senegal, Lesotho, South Africa, Uganda and Peru) for Component 1. A common analytical framework for all the case studies was developed to:

- See transport projects as part of a transport sector that takes gender issues into consideration, or is “gendered”.
- Understand and examine transport projects in the framework of national gender policy, governmental resource allocation to gender activities and gendered social structure.
- Capture the gender characteristics of the households and individuals that projects were intended to impact upon.

The case studies found a gap between the national gender framework and inclusion of gender in the transport sector. In other words, a gender-enabling environment, e.g. reference to gender in the constitution and gender focal points in many of the case study countries, did not necessarily result in concrete gender practice across the transport sector.

The growing recognition of gender as a development priority worldwide may encourage developing countries to include it in their policy frameworks. However, countries will not necessarily integrate gender into the transport sector in a systematic fashion. Some did incorporate general statements on gender in transport policy frameworks or project planning documents, but in many cases, the use of such language was a result of interaction with international donor agencies to attract funding. Rarely were these statements translated into action.

Auditing to the lowest levels of the implementation hierarchy is thus imperative in projects funded on gender rationales. To undertake such auditing, projects need a network of experts from across the developing world who are drawn in-country, not ones parachuted in from outside. The network of consultants for the case studies would be a good place to start. It could also provide tools and indicators to enable the identification of needs and effective auditing processes.

Gender frequently disappears as a reason for action within the life of a project. Causes of this phenomenon include a lack of a government's capacity to implement gender actions and monitoring indicators and resistance to change. Auditing would help prevent such phenomenon in the future.

In the long run, it is necessary to substantially change the integration of gender into transport policy by the following means:

- Institutional processes that allow better linkages between a country's transport policy and its gender policy.
- Clearer, more transparent linkages between a transport policy and the projects that arise from it.
- Stronger links between initial project plans and actual approved projects as well as between their planning and implementation.
- A monitoring and evaluation culture that fosters gender awareness.

## 2 Rationale for the World Bank to Invest in Gender Mainstreaming in Transport Projects

Based on the findings of the case studies, the following are the rationale for the World Bank to invest in gender mainstreaming in transport projects. The reasons can be classified into social inclusion, empowerment and security.

- **Social inclusion:** It is important that all groups in society, including women, share equally in benefits of transport projects. Women and men may experience the development of transportation differently, and it is essential to integrate women's consideration into transportation projects so that they reap the maximum benefit from these projects and infrastructure. Gender mainstreaming helps improve the productivity of labor and the efficiency of labor allocation in households, transport sector and the economy as whole, encouraging a more equal distribution of resources.<sup>1</sup> It also helps transport projects utilize human resources and capabilities in a more efficient fashion by tapping the potential of women who make up 50 % or more of the population in most countries. For instance, the increase of female police officers in Peru not only made it possible for the traffic police to regain trust of the public but also helped women attain respect in society that enabled them to challenge male stereotypes.<sup>2</sup>
- **Empowerment:** In most countries, women do not have the same level of decision-making power as men. Gender mainstreaming in transport projects helps women attain the capacity to determine their own destiny through improved access to transportation and roads. A good example is the Rural Infrastructure Development Project in Bangladesh that helped women rise above poverty through the provision of labor on road projects.<sup>3</sup>
- **Security:** Gender mainstreaming helps increase social cohesion through a greater extent of active involvement of women in all aspects of life. With more gender consideration taken into account in transport projects, women will have better access to transportation which often leads to productive assets and resources such as land, financial services and employment in the formal sector.<sup>4</sup> South Africa's National Bicycle Program trained women to be shop managers helped them achieve a more equal economic status with men in an otherwise largely male-dominated sector.<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> "Gender Equality & The Millennium Development Goals" (Gender and Development Group, World Bank, 4 April 2003), p. 1. <http://www.worldbank.org/gender/resources/gendermdg.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> See Box 1.

<sup>3</sup> See Box 2.

<sup>4</sup> "Gender Equality & The Millennium Development Goals", p. 7.

<sup>5</sup> See Box 3.

### **3 Methodology**

#### **3.1 Framework for Country and Case Study Selection**

The case studies tried to capture the range of gender issues in the transport sector and the contextual factors that affect both outcomes and the ways in which transport interventions are conceptualized, designed and implemented.

The case studies included the following:

- National or sectoral policies designed to promote women’s mobility and access to transport
- Large scale urban projects which potentially benefit large numbers of women
- Rural transport projects which could potentially benefit large numbers of women
- Small scale urban and rural transport projects.

The TOR further stated that the sample of case studies should “ideally” include a combination of public sector and NGO projects and those involving the private sector. The sample was also to include projects supported by development agencies other than the World Bank.

##### **3.1.1. The Sampling Framework**

It was not possible to draw a statistically valid sample because the global population of policy, program and project interventions was not easily identified and there were a very wide range of variables affecting their selection, design and outcomes.

The national gender and sector policy and institutional context are key factors influencing the integration of gender into even small-scale transport interventions. Two approaches were proposed to take account of these critical factors:

- The selection of case studies should be based upon differing national policy contexts, e.g. countries with supportive or unsupportive national policies, including constitutions, towards gender mainstreaming.
- The sector policy/institutional contexts should be divided into those supporting and those not supporting national policy gender mainstreaming.

##### **3.1.2. Additional Factors Influencing Case Study Selection**

Factors related to the nature of interventions, their design and outcomes were also considered in selecting countries and projects. The following factors, among others, were considered:

- Type of intervention: Infrastructure construction or service provision
- Mode: Road, rail, water, air
- Scope: Policy, program, project
- Level of operation: Local, regional, national
- Geographic area: Urban or rural
- Implementing institution: Government, private sector, informal sector, community
- Magnitude of investment: Capital cost

- Major financier: Government, private sector, multi- or bilateral concessional loan or grant
- Design context: Whole, component, or element of intervention - whether the intervention is a “stand-alone” or part (component or element) of a wider intervention (e.g. area-based development projects, some social funds)
- Sphere of influence: Staff of institutions, owners and operators, users, employees in construction and maintenance.

It was decided that the studies should consider what approaches had been taken in introducing gender to transport, how they have been applied and what the outcomes have been, both favorable and unfavorable.

### 3.1.3. Selection of Case Studies

The consultants found that, while there are plenty of research papers and various forms of advocacy concerned with gender in transport, there are very few interventions with specific focus on gender. The consultations with donor agencies failed to specify particular projects classified “gender in transport” as a distinct field. Most agencies treat gender in transport through their general gender policies and practices. The World Bank is a notable exception, having made a substantial start in defining sector-specific issues in gender for the transport sector.

The consultants selected the interventions that appeared to offer the best prospects to give a set of 19 candidates from which the short list of 10 was drawn. They recommended in the 10 countries listed in Table 1.

## 3.2 Literature Review

The World Bank’s Strategy on Gender makes a compelling case for integrating gender into all of its practices, emphasizing that gender inequality impedes economic growth, poverty reduction and the effectiveness of Bank-supported programs. The consultants’ literature review concurs.

There are very few works on the role of institutions and national policy on gender inequality in transport. Accordingly, the review sought to extrapolate lessons from the few institutional level project reports and work on other sectors, and formulate a case for understanding a gendered transport sector.

The consultants tried to understand the transport sector as a “gendered structure” consisting of national, institutional and individual unit levels of practice that produces gender inequality. They then turned to projects for alleviating gender inequality. Finally, they explored the literature on gender mainstreaming in other sectors.

The consultations with donors and NGOs clearly demonstrated that gender mainstreaming had not reached their infrastructure and transport sections. To advance gender mainstreaming, it is clear that the policy must reach out beyond so-called equal opportunity advocates in national government. Here are a few suggestions for better gender mainstreaming in government:

- Provision of key officials in charge of overall mainstreaming strategy
- Training in gender issues for other officials whose substantive experience lies elsewhere

- Collection of statistics and other data disaggregated by sex
- Planning, monitoring and evaluating the effects of policy on gender inequality
- Use of other specialized techniques such as “gender proofing” and “gender impact assessments”.

Other work suggests that any entity seeking to improve its implementation of gender policy should ask itself:

- How does policy context influence gender inequality?
- Who decides what should be done?
- What is to be done?
- Who is to do it?
- What can be done to improve the gender component?

In short, to tackle gender inequality in transport, literature highlights understanding of the entire sector as a gendered structure. However, such understanding is incomplete and is mostly focused on targeting gender inequality at the individual and household level.

### **3.3 The Study**

#### **3.3.1 Phases**

The contract between the World Bank and IC Net specified the work in four phases. The Advisory Group formed by the Bank reviewed progress, provided guidance on the scope of the work and the development of analytical techniques. The following is an outline of the scheduled phases.

##### **Phase I**

Phase I involved two groups of work: (1) a review of literature and consultations with donor agencies and NGOs to document gender difficulties in the transport sector and the range of approaches to solve them; (2) preparation of a methodology for case studies. Phase I was to commence in mid January and end on 15 May 2002.

##### **Phase II**

Phase II would provide the background information for the location, nature and content of the case studies, then finalize the methodology, decide the studies to be done and arrange subcontractors to undertake them. Phase II was to be completed by 15 September 2002.

##### **Phase III**

Phase III would involve (1) testing of the methodologies before the completion of the case studies; and (2) analysis of the results and prepare the draft report on findings and recommendations of Component 1. As the findings became available, preparations for Phase IV would begin, with the formulation of the training framework. Phase III was to be completed in November 2003.

## **Phase IV**

Phase IV, corresponding largely to Component 2 of the TOR, was to commence with identification of the training requirements and review of the available materials. Subsequently, training materials and a communications strategy would be prepared with the findings from Phases II and III. The result would be reviewed by the Bank and the Advisory Group. The communications strategy and training materials were to be tested in a few countries with findings to be incorporated into the final project report. Phase IV was to be completed on 15 June 2004.

### **3.3.2 Revisions to Schedules**

Subsequent events led to considerable changes in the work. Changes in emphasis and approach emerged from the early work in Phases I and II and discussions with the Advisory Group. The Bank later made major revisions to the scope of the work, reporting and schedules.

Discussions with the Advisory Group at the end of Phase I led to two significant changes in the work of Phases II and III. First, considerable further definition of methodologies for the case studies was required. Since this was not completed and agreed with the Bank until December 2002, the overall study program was likely to be significantly delayed. Second, the Advisory Group and the consultants dealt with the possibility of delay by agreeing to omit the “pilot phase” of the case studies and to proceed directly to commissioning all ten. Except for these two changes, the study schedule was, by and large, as originally planned.

At a workshop in March 2003, the Bank advised the consultants that the study program was to be concluded by 30 June 2003 and proposed that the case studies be completed within the revised time frame. It was subsequently agreed that the outputs of the study would be varied, to become:

- ten case study reports, as drafted by sub-contracted consultants and without editing, to be delivered by 20 June 2002
- final draft project report, to be delivered by 30 June 2003
- outline training program, to be delivered by 30 June 2003.

### **3.3.3 Study Activities**

The consultants began work on the study in December 2001 and submitted the draft Inception Report in mid January 2002. They then proceeded with the following Phase I activities: (i) the literature review; (ii) consultation with multi- and bilateral agencies and NGOs; (iii) preparation of methodology for the case studies; and (iv) preparation of the procedures for executing them.

The consultants at the end of May 2002 submitted a draft on these activities. The consultants and the Advisory Group met in July 2002 to discuss the draft, review progress and consider the subsequent activities. In the meeting, the Bank requested further work to define the case study methodology and the previously proposed “pilot phase” case studies were abandoned.

In August 2002, the consultants submitted further material on case study methodology, especially on the criteria for selection of case studies. The Bank then requested the consultants to select the ten

countries in which case studies would be conducted as well as interventions suitable for case studies.

The consultants submitted in December 2002 a framework for selection of countries and identified ten interventions which they recommended as apt. The Bank approved the lists of case studies and countries, thus paving the way for Phase III.

The consultants then put Phase III into action, identifying and retaining subcontractors to undertake the case studies. The selected subcontractors were invited to a workshop in London in March 2003, where their TOR was amplified and common approaches to the case studies were formulated.

Meanwhile, the Bank requested to curtail the duration of the study program by one year due to a reform in its Consultant Trust Fund. The consultants and the subcontractors agreed to amend their previous agreements so that the case studies in draft would be completed by 15 June 2003.

The case studies proceeded almost to schedule except the one for China, which was delayed by the SARS epidemic. The draft case studies were submitted electronically to the Bank on 20 June 2003. Bank comments were integrated through a long revision process, resubmitted to the Bank for web dissemination after a workshop in March 2004.

## List of the Case Studies

The ten case studies were carried out by consultants from the nine countries selected. The consultants and the projects which they considered are as follows:

<b>Country</b>	<b>Consultant</b>	<b>Project Name</b>	<b>Main Beneficiaries</b>	<b>Was a Gender Component in the Project Plan Implemented?</b>
Bangladesh	H. Khatun	Rural Infrastructure Development Project	Rural residents, women in particular	Yes
Bangladesh	S. C. Zohir	Dhaka Urban Transport Project	Residents of the Dhakka Metropolitan Area	No
China	Jie Du and J. Kurz	Comprehensive Transport Management Training Project	Rural residents and women who were trained in transport management practices	Yes
Lao	C. Phengkhay	East-West Corridor Project	Rural residents	No
Vietnam	N. Uyen	Rural Waterway Project	Rural residents	Yes
Lesotho	M. Ntho and T. Tsikoane	Rural Roads and Access Programme	Rural residents	Yes
South Africa	S. Mahapa	Shova Kalula National Bicycle Programme	Rural and suburban residents	No (There was no explicit gender component)
Senegal	C. Bop	National Rural Infrastructure Project	Rural communities	No
Uganda	N. Tanzarn	Road Sector Programme Support	Rural and urban residents	Yes
Peru	M. Gutierrez	Transport Rehabilitation Project	Rural and urban residents	Yes

**Table 1. Selected Case Studies**

<b>Level and Category of Intervention</b>	<b>Policy Context</b>		
	<b>National gender policy environment</b>		
	Unsupportive	Supportive	Supportive
	<b>Transport sector policy environment</b>		
	Unsupportive	Unsupportive	Supportive
National	<b>Lao:</b> East-West Corridor Project	<b>Senegal:</b> National Rural Infrastructure Project  <b>China:</b> Comprehensive Transport Management Training Project	<b>Vietnam:</b> Rural Infrastructure Inland Waterway Project
Urban		<b>Bangladesh:</b> Dhaka Urban Transport Project	<b>Peru:</b> Transport Rehabilitation Project
Rural transport infrastructure		<b>Bangladesh:</b> Third Rural Infrastructure Project  <b>Lesotho:</b> Rural Road and Access Program	<b>Uganda:</b> Road Sector Programme Support
Urban and rural transport services			<b>RSA:</b> Shova KaLula

## **4 Lessons Learned**

### **4.1 Major Findings of the Case Studies**

The case studies were analyzed under the following three themes: the enabling environment plus institutional analysis, project-level analysis and actual gender outcomes.

#### **The Enabling Environment / Institutional Analysis**

The enabling environment refers to a collection of positive external forces and factors surrounding gender mainstreaming in transport projects. If the transport sector is to be changed holistically, an enabling national policy environment is a crucial initial element for the integration of gender into this sector. The case studies reported examples of an enabling environment and positive initiatives to promote gender equality in the national policy framework.

In many case studies, enabling gender environments are lost in translation from integration of gender into national transport policy. A lack of auditable targets to verify the path from policy to implementation and the presence of gender-biased structures also undercut the impact of any progress on stakeholders.

An area that has seen some positive change is that of labor-based construction methods. In Uganda, the use of external agencies such as DANIDA, easily auditable labor-force participation targets, and implementation by a subsidiary transport ministry appear to be significant in allowing gender integration in the transport sector.

#### **Project-level Analysis**

The case studies found many projects that include gender to varying degrees. Most notable are projects that feature labor-based road construction elements. Focused actions have been clearly identified in those projects. One is a labor-construction team in Lesotho in which nearly 30% of the members are women. However, there were examples of gaps between planned and actual outcomes. In an urban Bangladesh project, the concept of gender disappeared in the path from the initial project idea to the final plan. It seems important to examine the cause of such loss of gender in a project.

#### **Actual Gender Outcomes**

The case studies highlight a range of positive outcomes for women. In particular, once again a number of labor-based construction projects appear to have noticeable positive impacts on women's opportunity and empowerment. In rural Bangladesh, for instance, a transport project provided space in markets for women business owners, and sheds for women along roads. However, positive outcomes from such facilities are undercut unless there are follow-up actions to help women find employment in the transport sector and encourage them to use transport.<sup>6</sup> In other words, it takes more than just a one-time improvement in infrastructure to address gender issues.

---

<sup>6</sup> Rural Bangladesh, p. 29.

## 4.2 Country-Specific Actions Taken

Many of the case study countries have a national context in which women's action plans have been developed. Some countries even have gender-sensitive constitutional provisions. Uganda, for example, has ratified the Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) and its 1995 constitution that committed itself to gender equality is one of the most gender-responsive in the region. Gender equality, as in Uganda, can be entrenched in the constitution through provisions that affirm the equality of all persons and prohibit discrimination based on, among other things, sex, establish the rights of the disadvantaged, and require the state to take active measures including affirmative action to redress the situation.<sup>7</sup> The South African Bill of Rights also recognizes the rights of women as equally important to those of men.<sup>8</sup> China, the host of the 1995 UN Conference for Women, has made significant progress in having gender equality as a state policy.<sup>9</sup>

For gender mainstreaming, many countries have promoted the establishment of gender focal points in line ministries. In Lesotho, gender focal points in line ministries and institutions have been charged with proposing appropriate and effective gender mechanisms within their institutions and providing support for taking gender concerns into account in all aspects of planning and programming.<sup>10</sup> In Vietnam, the National Committee for the Advancement of Women (NCFAW) was established in 1993. Its mandate was to promote the status of women and to advise the Prime Minister's Office on development and implementation of the five-year National Plans of Action for Women's Advancement. The NCFAW has sub-branches (CFAW) in 50 ministries and departments and all 61 provinces and cities of Vietnam.<sup>11</sup>

However, such institutions are often under-resourced and tend to have other 'mainstream' responsibilities that constrain their ability to address gender issues. In Vietnam, the CFAWs had neither a budget nor full-time staff. They were de jure independent from the Women's Union but de facto mixed with it. In addition, senior CFAW members had other responsible posts such as Vice-Chairs or Vice Ministers of the provincial People's Committees. They were often too busy to fulfill CFAW functions.<sup>12</sup>

Furthermore, gender focal points are often ineffective due to their positioning within government and the qualifications of individuals assigned to them. The Uganda case study found that the Gender Focal Points either had other "mainstream" responsibilities, were too far up the hierarchy to devote time and energy to gender, or too low down the hierarchy to be listened to.

In addition, many people at Uganda's Gender Focal Points at both central and local government level were given no training on gender considerations.<sup>13</sup>

In many case studies there is no explicit connection between the gender-enabling environment and the transport sector. In China, for example, the national gender machinery includes 24 ministries and 5 civil society organizations, but does not include the Ministry of Transport.<sup>14</sup> In Lesotho, the

---

<sup>7</sup> Uganda, p.11.

<sup>8</sup> South Africa, p.5.

<sup>9</sup> China, p.7.

<sup>10</sup> Lesotho, p.11.

<sup>11</sup> Vietnam, p.2.

<sup>12</sup> Ibid., p.3.

<sup>13</sup> Uganda, p.32.

<sup>14</sup> China, p.6.

gender and development policy documents do not explicitly refer to measures to incorporate transport considerations into gender policy. They fail to address even the area of women's employment in the construction industry.<sup>15</sup>

A notable exception is Uganda whose gender policy frameworks do mention transport as a priority in their action plans. Uganda's Social Development Strategic Investment Plan, which seeks to build the capacity of decision-makers and planning officers in gender mainstreaming, is targeting the five key sectors of education, health, water, agriculture and roads.<sup>16</sup>

Quotas are an increasingly important element in the development of an enabling gender environment. A few of the case studies reported that central governments have begun to address the issue of gender balance among political decision makers. They have begun to increase the number of women in local and regional decision-making assemblies by setting minimum levels of women representatives. Uganda, Senegal and Peru have legislation that states that women shall make up at least one third of all local councils. In Bangladesh, urban municipal authorities have one third of the seats reserved for women.<sup>17</sup> In Peru, there are policy measures to raise the profile of women in public office.<sup>18</sup> In Senegal, there are targets for women's participation in local democracy.<sup>19</sup>

However, even national-level legislative measures, policy frameworks or quotas are not without problems. In urban Bangladesh, the status of women ward commissioners are undermined because they lack clearly defined responsibilities. In Senegal, while national requirements state that at least 25 % of all decision-making positions should be reserved for women, the case study found that only two out of the 320 Rural Councils had elected a woman as president and only 9 % of councilors were women.<sup>20</sup>

---

<sup>15</sup> Lesotho, p.11.

<sup>16</sup> Uganda, p.12.

<sup>17</sup> Urban Bangladesh, p. 7.

<sup>18</sup> Peru, p. 8; see also Box 1.

<sup>19</sup> Senegal, p. 8.

<sup>20</sup> Senegal, p. 9.

## 5 Institutional Analysis

This section looks at the role of sector-wide transport policy on development of gender equality in the sector, i.e. what role national transport policy has played in setting a gendered environment for particular transport projects, and the influence of the national transport policy on the studied transport projects and vice versa.

### 5.1 The Gap between National Gender Policy and the Transport Sector

The case studies highlight other elements of the gap between the enabling environment and transport policy such as a lack of explicit incorporation of gender into transport policy documents, treating gender as a cross-cutting issue and targeting women as a specific disadvantaged group.

In Uganda, for example, a gender-enlightened constitution does not transfer to road policy. It fails to explicitly state gender in its objectives and strategies and thus does not reflect the national commitment to gender-responsive development.<sup>21</sup>

The South Africa case study revealed a substantial gap between the enabling national environment and transport policy.<sup>22</sup> The good intentions of South Africa's constitution have been lost in translation to the national transport policy. The planning guidelines in the National Land Transport Act 2000 do not articulate the main objectives of the constitution, although the Act does include some women in "special categories", "vulnerable and disadvantaged" and "passengers with physical disabilities".<sup>23</sup>

China also has a gap between its gender policy and its national transport policy. This is because the transport sector is seen as economically and technologically driven, with inadequate attention to social impacts. It is also because gender policy is implemented through women-centered organizations, not through integration of gender across all policy areas.<sup>24</sup>

There are, on the other hand, national transport policies taking gender issues into account. Senegal provides a prime example. The country's National Strategy on Rural Transport states that the strategy will be "implemented following a global, integrated and participative process that takes gender issues, local contexts, capacities of groups and individuals into consideration".<sup>25</sup> Senegal's transport policies also identify in some cases the involvement of the necessary stakeholders to promote gender equality. They include the Ministry of Family, Social Action and National Solidarity, as well as the National Federation of Women's Associations to be represented in the bodies in charge of planning and implementation. In addition, women and vulnerable groups will be part of the government task forces to oversee policy coordination.<sup>26</sup> However, some of these policy statements pay little more than lip service to integrating gender, as they may not be acted upon. They may also be directed toward external audiences such as donor agencies as a question has been raised whether gender and transport line ministries have actually been involved.

---

<sup>21</sup> Uganda, p.14.

<sup>22</sup> South Africa, p.10.

<sup>23</sup> Ibid., p. 11.

<sup>24</sup> China, p. 17.

<sup>25</sup> Senegal, p. 10.

<sup>26</sup> Senegal, p. 10.

Furthermore, institutional structures may already be gender-biased and policy statements may not lead to concrete measures in addressing gender inequalities. For example, the Senegal case study suggests that the division of the responsibilities among the state and the rural communities for funding the establishment of roads may undermine women's needs for infrastructure. In the National Strategy for Rural Transport, the government will not fund the community roads, which, in practice, are used more by women than by men. Instead, funding of the community roads is left to the rural communities which clearly cannot afford it.<sup>27</sup> This is reinforced by some of the evidence from the China case study that points to some of the gender-biased assumptions in the country's transport sector. The study found that most transport sector professionals did not think that there were gender issues in transport. Of those who did, more men than women saw women's role in the sector as wives and mothers who could train their children and husbands in road safety and as a potential workforce.<sup>28</sup>

Gender considerations can be integrated into transport policy. However, this makes no difference without robust auditing procedures such as mechanisms for setting targets and ensuring the policy's implementation. In Laos, the Strategic Directions for the Development of the Road Sector by the Lao Ministry of Communications does acknowledge the importance of gender issues with respect to the improvement of rural road access. It includes goals and objectives to support wider national policy objectives of food security and poverty alleviation. Nevertheless, there are no performance indicators for gender integration in the transport sector.<sup>29</sup>

## **5.2 Gender in the Labor-Based Rural Roads Sub-Sector**

While the inclusion of gender in transport sector policy was not widespread and often not leading to clear action, there were certain sub-sector areas of transport, such as rural roads maintenance and construction, where gender was more prevalent.

Labor-based construction in particular appears to be an area where awareness of gender issues is expanding. The choice of technology for labor-based construction is seen as providing room to promote the participation of, and benefits to, women. It is an area where government departments are addressing internal and external factors which influence the development of women. The South Africa case study indicates that, in contrast to lack of gender awareness in mainstream transport policy, statements by a subsidiary agency involved in rural road management appear to be more enlightened. This agency, the Department of Public Works, acknowledges that there are internal and external factors that affect the development of women. These include redressing the imbalances in staffing and maintaining an equitable representation of women at all levels within the organization. External factors include the application of measures and policies that promote optimal distribution of benefits to women, e.g. through reform of procurement policies. In addition, the Department cites the promotion of labor-based construction methods that target employment and training of women. The Department has translated such policy into action in the Community Based Public Works Programme in which women are encouraged to set up small construction businesses through training and networking.<sup>30</sup>

Sometimes a split in the transport authority may work to the advantage of gender. There are countries where transport policy is implemented by more than one ministry, and that may present an

---

<sup>27</sup> Ibid., p. 8.

<sup>28</sup> China, p. 19.

<sup>29</sup> Lao, p. 8.

<sup>30</sup> South Africa, p. 14.

opportunity for gender integration without the outright opposition often faced in traditionally male-dominated transport policy. In Uganda, the district, urban, and community roads policy seems a contrast with the national-level policy described earlier. Here the White Paper on Sustainable Maintenance of District, Urban and Community Access Roads might be a watershed in an otherwise male-dominated transport sector. The paper calls for gender and women-specific provisions to be implemented, ensuring and strengthening women's participation in decision-making on district, urban and community roads. It is significant that this White Paper deals with the secondary roads that are largely used by the majority of poor people, including women, to secure their livelihoods.

Outside the area of labor-based construction, the case studies found few examples of gender-aware transport policy and practice. A notable exception is that of the policy of 'feminization' of the traditionally male-dominated traffic police in Peru, as seen in the Box below. The police force recruited women and gained a new and improved image.<sup>31</sup>

### **Box 1 Feminization of the Police in Peru**

In Lima, Peru, a significant number of female police officers were employed to improve the image of its police department. This scheme proved largely successful. The Traffic Police in Lima recruited female officers who had proven themselves capable. In 1999, the Traffic Police in Lima had three thousand officers, and three hundred among them were women. In December of the same year, the first group of female candidates --- 1,500 in total --- finished their nine-month training at the Police Academy. They were subsequently deployed in the Traffic Police.

The objective of the deployment was to improve the image of the police which was suffering greatly. The public tended to see the male-dominated police workforce as corrupt and ineffective. The female police officers boosted approval ratings of the police to nearly 70 % of the respondents in a survey in Lima. People began to respect the regulations more.

Evidence suggests that male stereotypes on women were prevalent in Peru. Men tended to object to receiving orders from women and give them little credit for their work and abilities. A survey in the city of Huancayo, for instance, revealed that 68 % of the men there thought that women should belong only in offices or work only as secretaries, and 32 % thought that women would prove incompetent in any field of work. The deployment of the female police officers was a challenge to such stereotypes.

The deployment also made it necessary to change some physical infrastructure in the police community. It became necessary to construct a number of facilities such as toilets for women and places for them to care for their children. In addition, special care had to be taken in their treatment. For instance, pregnant female officers had to be assigned to work in offices rather than in the streets directing traffic. Family planning support was also given to many female officers through conferences, consultations with psychologists, and the distribution of condoms.

---

<sup>31</sup> Peru, p.17; also see Box 1.

## 6 Project-Level Analysis

The case studies examined two groups of projects: (1) rural projects applying labor-based methods and (2) others.

### 6.1 Project Preparation and Design: Labor-Based Construction Projects

The case studies on labor-based construction projects in Uganda and rural Bangladesh found good practice in integrating gender into transport sector projects.

In Uganda, concrete action was taken to mainstream gender in a major transport project. The first phase of the Road Sector Programme Support (RSPS) Project had a gender specialist to address gender issues in implementation. The specific measures taken by the specialist were as follows: (1) informing women of potential employment opportunities in road works; (2) ensuring that women had employment opportunities in the transport sector; (3) ensuring that women were represented in the workers' welfare committees; (4) hosting quarterly meetings with women workers; (5) visits to sites to observe the working environment; and (6) collecting gender-disaggregated performance indicators of work sites. Due to the specialist's work, the contractor that handled road works instituted a three-month maternity leave for female workers and made available family planning services at the company clinic.<sup>32</sup>

Drawing upon the lessons of the first phase of RSPS, the second phase, i.e. RSPS2, explicitly stated a commitment to active promotion of women's participation as contractors and workers. The project was developed through a participatory process involving the government, DANIDA, and stakeholders at all levels. The process included gender reviews of the previous road projects and appraisal of proposed measures in the new project. The result was the following gender strategies for RSPS2: (1) building capacity at national and district levels to address gender in the transport sector; (2) incorporation of the transport needs of both women and men in district and sub-country development plans; (3) participation of women in planning transport interventions; (4) providing women with information on employment opportunities in road works; (5) equal recruitment opportunities for women and men in labor-based road works; and (6) creation of awareness among men to allow their wives to participate in road works.<sup>33</sup>

In rural Bangladesh, communities were involved in the design of projects as well as in road construction and maintenance. Taking their views into account, the project built women-only sections in local markets and formed labor contracts with landless or destitute women for routine maintenance and tree plantation along the project roads. It also appointed a sociologist to supervise and monitor all gender-related activities.<sup>34</sup>

It is worth going back to the institutional level to see what agencies were responsible for the design and implementation of the projects with good practice. In some cases, design and implementation were the responsibility of the public works ministry of national government or a local government department, often with remote assistance from an external funding agency in monitoring and evaluation capacity. Rarely was a mainstream transport ministry the responsible agency.

---

<sup>32</sup> Uganda, p. 20.

<sup>33</sup> Uganda, p. 23.

<sup>34</sup> Rural Bangladesh, p. 9.

Gender integrated projects may be easier to implement in subsidiary areas of a bureaucracy. That is where projects may be less of a challenge to institutionalized gender bias than at higher levels. In Lesotho, the national Department of Rural Roads (DRR) encouraged participation of local councils in identifying access needs and constraints. Although the DRR at the time was not the ministry responsible for transport policy, it asked the District Secretaries to prioritize requests for funding infrastructure projects in the districts, then requested funding from donors for particular interventions.<sup>35</sup>

The key role of external agencies in pushing gender issues forward is also worth noting. For example, DANIDA was instrumental in including gender issues in the design stage of the Road Sector Program Support program in Uganda.<sup>36</sup>

## 6.2 Project Preparation and Design: Other Projects

A few other case studies indicated that the concept of gender tended to evaporate first between the initial project idea and planning documents, and then between project planning and implementation.

The second group includes the Urban Bangladesh case study. The development of the Dhaka Urban Transport Project (DUTP) emerged from studies by the Planning Commission and UNDP in 1994. The studies clearly saw gender as an important element and recognized that women in Dhaka City were caught between conflicting pressures: traditional values compelled them to stay at home and refrain from contact with male strangers, while economic hardship and the export-led industrialization and intervention by the government and NGOs were encouraging women to seek work and enter education. Women were a docile and largely non-unionized workforce, and their mobility remained a cause for concern as the rise of the ready-made garment industries provided formal employment to women in Dhaka and Chittagong City.<sup>37</sup>

However, DUTP had no gender component. The reason is unclear. The case study reports that DUTP completely failed to address any of the gender issues identified in project preparation. Instead, the project concentrated on the traditional elements of urban transport planning: developing road infrastructure, bus terminals and routes, constructing flyovers, and improving traffic flow management across the road network. Discussions with the Dhaka Transport Coordination Board suggested that the DUTP ignored the social aspect of the 1994 UNDP study. Moreover, the findings of a gender study by a local NGO were not disseminated among the different stakeholders.<sup>38</sup> Despite the loss of gender, the project was funded and is still ongoing --- a project funded on gender rationales but from which gender disappears as an issue or ground for action within its life.

A similar tale of gender loss during a project's design comes from the Transport Rehabilitation Project in Peru. The project did not explicitly address gender issues although gender was one of the World Bank's primary concerns in Peru.<sup>39</sup>

It is not clear from these two cases how widespread the loss of gender is between initial project preparation and implementation. As such loss affects the enthusiasm and commitment of donor

---

<sup>35</sup> Lesotho, p. 20.

<sup>36</sup> Uganda, p. 4.

<sup>37</sup> Urban Bangladesh, p. 17.

<sup>38</sup> Ibid.

<sup>39</sup> Peru, p. 7.

agencies, there should be clear mechanisms to integrate gender in national transport policy and to ensure it is carried out by the implementing bodies.

In other projects, gender was pushed forward by outside actors. In Vietnam, the ownership of the gender element of the Rural Infrastructure Inland Waterway Project came from external actors rather than national agencies. While gender equality was not explicit in the objectives of the project, it was addressed in accordance with the CIDA policy throughout project design, implementation and evaluation. International gender specialists were assigned to the project and gender mainstreaming was made an explicit function of the project manager.<sup>40</sup>

CIDA has also enforced gender in its projects in China. These projects sought to build capacity in the transport sector planning and included quotas and targets for training women. The results were mixed. Attitudes among Chinese project staff varied and the effect of a quota system on gender equality may be limited. The China case study states as follows: (1) Training of senior personnel in gender awareness may have a significant effect; (2) It is important to set realistic targets for gender equality; and (3) Qualitative indicators are as useful for measuring outcomes as quantitative indicators.<sup>41</sup>

### **6.3 Problems in Project Implementation**

The projects that manage to maintain gender elements beyond the planning stage often have the following difficulties in implementation:

- Lack of capacity to deliver effectively the gender elements of the project
- Differences in the emphasis on prioritizing the gender element between external donors and internal project implementers
- Difficulty in implementing gender projects in a male-dominated transport sector
- Failure to set robust audit and monitoring mechanisms at the project design stage to ensure compliance throughout implementation
- Allocation of resources to gender issues.

#### **Lack of capacity to deliver effectively the gender elements of the project**

The case studies reported that failures in project systems such as recruitment processes led to the involvement of consultants who were not qualified. That caused significant degradation of gender elements in a project. The Senegal case study project held training on transport and gender as well as on participatory approaches. Several managers who were involved in the training stated that the consultants who provided the training were not competent. The managers argued that in Senegal, many people did not understand the significance and purpose of an approach to analyze, understand and transform gender relations.<sup>42</sup>

There are other examples of limited technical capacity to provide gender support for project implementation. In the Lao case, there was a general lack of capacity on the part of government to identify, design and implement the project components targeting women. This case study found that

---

<sup>40</sup> Vietnam, p. 7.

<sup>41</sup> China, p. 36.

<sup>42</sup> Senegal, p. 23.

substantial efforts would be needed to build and improve the technical capacity, managerial and administrative skills of executing and implementing agencies.<sup>43</sup>

### **Differences in the emphasis on prioritizing the gender element between external donors and internal project implementers**

Across the board, the case studies found that external agencies had strong influence on the integration of gender into projects. However, without sufficient monitoring, gender components may not be properly implemented by internal agencies. An example is the Vietnam case study. National government agencies in Vietnam were reluctant to confirm whether they had any noteworthy contribution to or participation in gender equality activities. The gender strategy in the project description was developed by international consultants. Vietnam Inland Waterway Administration (VIWA) counterparts played the passive role of informants and workshop participants: none had seen the gender equality action plan in Vietnamese. This apparent lack of the government agency's ownership of the gender strategy limited the impacts and jeopardized sustainability of the gender activities.<sup>44</sup>

### **Difficulty in implementing gender projects in a male-dominated transport sector**

Many of the case studies highlighted resistance to change in the male-dominated transport sector. This is clearly demonstrated in the Vietnam case study where it was realized that a number of gender activities depended on an unconnected institutional restructuring process and could face resistance. It was therefore decided to concentrate on the gender activities that targeted individuals such as training on professional skills for women. This scaling-down helped implement the gender action plan. The number of female participants in training courses was 21% higher than those of the labor force in general. Project advocacy resulted in VIWA appointing two women to lead the management information system and financial sections. The majority of management staff of VIWA received gender-awareness training and knew that CIDA had a policy on gender equality. Explicit gender criteria were promoted in implementation of the Community Level Infrastructure Fund, a CIDA initiative. However, even these results were far below the initial goal in the project's gender strategy. The semi-annual project reports had a section on the progress of gender activities taken out, and the draft final report had no such section at all at the time of the case study.<sup>45</sup>

### **Failure to set robust audit and monitoring mechanisms at the project design stage to ensure compliance throughout implementation**

Several case studies showed the importance of having compliance structures. In the Uganda case, due to the inadequacy of mechanisms to ensure contractor compliance with the contract, the majority of the contractors neither adopted flexible working hours nor provided separate facilities for women on most sites. The contractors said that road works were within the range of the workers' own homes. For the one contract executed away from residential areas, a road camp with separate facilities was constructed but no shelters were provided for breastfeeding mothers. In addition, the gender sensitivity of the recruitment process varied. The majority of contractors provided equal employment opportunities for women and men by advertising on market days and through community and local government administrative structures. Other contractors, however,

---

<sup>43</sup> Lao, p. 27.

<sup>44</sup> Vietnam, p. 10.

<sup>45</sup> Vietnam, p.10.

announced work opportunities through their mostly male staff, often limiting women's participation.<sup>46</sup>

The Lesotho case showed that it is difficult to maintain gender compliance by contractors. The study found that compliance is higher in works by the Rural Roads Department's own labor force than in those contracted out. The case study argues that, as a government agency, the Department must be seen in the forefront of implementing its policies. However, the outlooks of private contractors were different. One male private-sector contractor was resistant to the idea of gender mainstreaming: he "wouldn't like to see more women involved in road construction because they affect productivity, deadlines and task duties".<sup>47</sup> In addition, the China case study makes a case for using both qualitative and quantitative monitoring as numbers alone do not give a comprehensive indication of how successful a project has been in gender terms.<sup>48</sup>

## 6.4 Common Features in Project Implementation Success and Failure

The case studies found that many projects included gender to varying degrees. The most notable were those with labor-based road construction elements. The projects with good practice (Uganda, Rural Bangladesh and Lesotho) appeared to have the following common features:

- Project design with components that clearly address gender.
- Concrete actions that comply with a gender focus.
- Measurable objectives that project teams can strive for, e.g. the use of ILO standards that approximately 30% of labor should be provided by women.

However, there also appear to be common features in failing to integrate gender consideration or where it disappeared from plan to outcome. Some projects started to include gender issues in project preparation but omitted them from final project design. Some incorporated gender components in planning documents but had difficulty implementing them. Some have been able to recognize such shortfalls and rectify them, whereas others have found recovery to be difficult. As described in the previous section, failed projects seem to share the following characteristics:

- Lack of capacity or skills to effectively deliver the gender elements of the project
- Differences in the emphasis on prioritizing the gender component between external project designers and internal project implementers
- Difficulty in implementing gender projects in a male-dominated transport sector
- Failure to put in place robust audit and monitoring mechanisms to ensure compliance in implementation
- Allocation of resources within projects and the priorities set within project documents, particularly the gender priorities and focus set by the project plans.

---

<sup>46</sup> Uganda, p. 29.

<sup>47</sup> Lesotho, p. 17.

<sup>48</sup> China, p. 36.

## 7 Gender Outcomes

### 7.1 Labor-Based Construction and Maintenance

Significant positive outcomes at project level were seen in the labor-based road construction projects. In most case study countries, women and men now have roughly equal rights as laborers, in working hours and income. However, this was not always the case. For example, women laborers in Lesotho were until 1999-2000 employed only on food-for-work schemes, while their male counterparts were paid cash. This imbalance has been rectified since the establishment of the Department of Rural Roads. In Uganda, contractors on the Road Sector Program Support project were encouraged to use task rates instead of daily fee rates to ensure equitable remuneration of women compared to men.

The physical work for women in labor-based construction projects varied considerably among the case studies. In Lesotho, women were involved in excavating to level, ditching, spreading of gravel and routine maintenance. Their counterparts in Bangladesh were mainly responsible for the periodic maintenance of roads and structures including earthen embankments and trees.

The Rural Infrastructure Development Project in Bangladesh has components designed specifically for women, including:

- Provision of an exclusive area for women vendors in growth center markets.
- A passenger shed for women including separate latrines and garbage pits at the rural ghats.
- Provision for women's emergency needs at flash flood refuges.

The rural Bangladesh case study reported positive impacts for women, particularly in terms of opportunity and empowerment. The project allowed women to acquire income and build social capital through trust and respect that came with employment. One vignette of success is shown below. However, questions over long-term sustainability remain.

## **Box 2 A Rural Bangladesh Success Story**

Julekha Begum, 28, is from Panchagarh. She has the education level of grade five. Julekha got married at the age of 15. She had a son within a year, then a daughter in five years. However, her husband had left her before the birth of the daughter. She then had to move to her father's house. Now she is living there with her son and daughter. She became destitute as her husband left her with the children. She survived by working as a maid for neighbors and villagers.

Julekha joined the Rural Development Project 21 (RDP 21) in late 2000. She was selected as a Labor Contracting Society member of RDP 21 through a lottery system. She maintains the roadside and looks after the plantation provided by the project. She received training upon joining the project.

After joining RDP 21 she has become independent with reasonable earnings. After the Income Generating Activities training, she mortgaged some land with the money she saved when she was working in the project. She spent Tk 2,500 to mortgage this piece of land. In addition to that, she invested Tk 1,000 in a money lending business from her own savings. Now Julekha earns Tk 80 and Tk 75 per month from the land and credit from the lent money.

Julekha believes that RDP 21 should employ women for two more years. This would help them become totally independent. Right now some of the women cannot stand on their own feet after their contract runs out at the end of two years.

Right now Julekha is no longer destitute. She has honor in the society. She has decision making power as well as some money and does not have to depend on anybody anymore.

Julekha plans to buy a cow with the money that was compulsory saving in RDP 21. She kept that money in the bank. She is also thinking of buying land. She wants to give good life to her children. She wishes to work in another Local Government Engineering Department project if there is any chance.<sup>49</sup>

---

<sup>49</sup> Rural Bangladesh, p. 17.

Another labor-based construction project in Uganda saw a noticeable impact on people's economic opportunities and social capital levels, particularly those of women.

It was observed that, as a result of the project, Ugandan women viewed employment as a means to an end, rather than a career opportunity in itself. Other outcomes of this project include:

- Increased access to employment.
- Access to education and training.
- Access to transport services and greater affordability of transport.
- Enhanced self-confidence, trust, respect and some empowerment.

However, from a gender perspective, negative impacts of the Uganda project, particularly in reduced security for women, were also reported:

- Increased road accidents.
- Spread of HIV/AIDS.
- Increased teenage pregnancy.

In Lesotho, the studied project observed positive impacts on opportunities, capability, and security through the use of tracks and paths. Women were able to cross rivers easily and more frequently; to transport more goods using carts and bicycles than by head-loading; had more income generation opportunities; and to transport the sick and access a range of services more easily.<sup>50</sup>

However, lack of consultation with communities, particularly women, can often erode other positive outcomes of labor-based construction projects. For example, in Lesotho, communities failed to take advantage of the improved infrastructure for the following reasons:

- There were afraid of heights (in the case of footbridges) – thus reducing security.
- Roads were located in the wrong place – thus affecting opportunity.
- There was, in some cases, no means of transport, even after public works improvements – having no impact on opportunity.
- Even with improved infrastructure, the transport services available to women were too costly – thus little impact on opportunity.

Other negative impacts of the infrastructure improvement in Lesotho were lack of security for women due to the following:

- Rise in crime caused degradation in security.
- Loss of lives due to working conditions led to less security.
- Loss of customers to big businesses in towns meant fewer opportunities for small businesses in rural areas.
- Accidents due to vehicles which are not road-worthy caused degradation in security.

---

<sup>50</sup> Lesotho, p. 25.

## 7.2 Gender Outcomes in Other Projects

### Roles of bicycles in stimulating small enterprises, especially for women

Other non-labor-based methods projects, such as the one in South Africa where a national bicycle promotion project was established, report positive outcomes in opportunity, capability and empowerment. Through the bicycle promotion scheme, men, women and children had gained better access to education, jobs, markets and health care, improved quality of life and reduced travel time.<sup>51</sup> The project had particularly positive outcomes on economic opportunity for women through an increase in women-owned small enterprises.

The South Africa case study indicated that bicycles improved the efficiency of the small entrepreneurs who use them. There was a noticeable increase in the number of small entrepreneur women who rely on the bicycles to conduct their business.<sup>52</sup> The project may also, by influencing perceptions, lead to a longer-term increase in opportunity if women can access a wider range of income-generating opportunities.

It must be noted, however, that not everyone was enthusiastic about the bicycle promotion program. While younger men accepted the idea of women riding bicycles, older men were not receptive to it. The limited support from men kept low the number of female bicycle users.<sup>53</sup>

Problems in implementation could also reduce economic opportunity for some groups. Women shop owners in particular faced increasing uncertainty over income streams. Payments from bicycle buyers were proving unreliable and the supply of bikes was unable to meet the demand. Such phenomena may have significant impacts on the survival strategies of women shopkeepers and their households and may increase the chances of project failure.

## 7.3 Other Issues

It appears that a number of projects, while having noticeable impacts on opportunity, capability and empowerment, have not been designed to address the security element. While the South Africa case study<sup>54</sup> identified safety as a major concern for the majority of the people in the country, no concrete initiative was taken to improve the safety of cyclists.

There were a few small attempts to address the issue. Traffic officials requested an increase in the number of safety paths and gear. Schools were asked to teach the general public to ride safely. The Department of Transport was about to introduce cycling safety lessons in schools and some traffic officials were preparing to teach the best way to cycle. The officials would start teaching as soon as the necessary logistical arrangement was complete.<sup>55</sup> A small booklet titled *Cycling Book* was distributed.

The following example presents a mixed picture on the National Bicycle Program in South Africa.

---

<sup>51</sup> South Africa, p. 22.

<sup>52</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 24; see also Box 3.

<sup>53</sup> South Africa, p. 24.

<sup>54</sup> See Box 3.

<sup>55</sup> South Africa, p. 24.

### **Box 3 The Shova Kalula National Bicycle Program in South Africa --- A Case of Enhancement in Safety and Mobility**

The Shova Kalula National Bicycle Program is a ministerial initiative of the National Department of Transport targeting rural and underdeveloped suburban areas. The Department has taken up the challenge to meet the need for low-cost mobility solutions in rural and suburban areas by developing the Shova Kalula (Ride Easy) National Bicycle Transport Partnership.

The purpose was to promote the use of bicycles as means of transport. The partnership was facilitated by the Department and targeted partners such as local and provincial government, business, non-profit organizations, foreign governments and international organizations.

The overall aim was to implement one million bicycle transport packages in South Africa over ten years. A bicycle transport package was to include most of the following:

- An inexpensive new or used bicycle
- A training course in riding, maintenance and transport uses
- Access to service and support from local/regional micro businesses
- Special attention to empowering female users
- An Edu-bike Africa learner's workbook (where relevant)
- The option of earning a bike through working in a micro business
- An infrastructure review of the area's potential for safe bicycle transport
- Periodic visits by a mobile bicycle transport clinic.

Anecdotal evidence showed the differential impacts of the program on men and women. Potential users of bicycles who happened to be female indicated how bicycles could change their lives in light of their multiple roles at home and in society.

Field investigation among users and non-users of bicycles showed that there was a great need for them. Communities were beginning to appreciate that the government was doing something for the rural people. They had believed that government was for the urban communities and neglected the rural ones. Women in the villages where *shova kalula* shops were set up realized the usefulness of bicycles and found the courage to ride them, as the following opinion indicates:

*Our village is more of an urban area where nobody will tell you what to do and not to*

*do. We do not mind driving the bikes with cross-bars because we can put on trousers and many of us are used to riding bicycles. The only problem is these bikes are not enough to cater for all the surrounding areas. We need more shops such as this one with cheap bicycles because in town we pay double or even triple the amount.*

However, focus group discussions revealed that very few women had bought bicycles. Those who had an opportunity to use them depended on bicycles obtained by either their male partner or children as students. Learners usually used bicycles bought for them. For example, children are sent to do shopping and inform relatives of any event they must take part in, be it a funeral or celebration. All of these tasks have to be performed by women in the absence of children's help. Women indicated that they were prepared to ride bicycles, particularly those with carriers to help transport goods to market places. The only concern with the current mountain bikes is they are designed for men. Women suggested the supply of a female bike without cross-bars, as this would allow them to ride at any time without any restriction on the type of clothing. Given that some men are not happy to see their wives and daughters putting on trousers, a female bike will be most suitable. These women were cheerful on the day they managed to purchase a bicycle. Although there was no gender focus in the design of the *shova kalula*, it made quite an impression on the communities, particularly those who never thought bicycles could be used to reduce distance and to relieve their workload.

School teachers at Morwatshehla High School offered a different opinion on the impact of the program:

*Even though we cannot measure the impact quantitatively, the impact of shova kalula has been tremendous. Schooling has improved because students who ride bicycles no longer arrive late due to long distance traveled; absenteeism has also decreased because they are not tired when they arrive at school. The only concern we have is lack of spare parts which forces some students, particularly female students, to leave their bicycles at home. They cannot stand the risk of using bikes that can be broken at any given time. Because of this problem the number of bicycles is decreasing. The school used to be full of bicycles for both boys and girls.*

That 60 % of the bicycles was sold to students is proof that students have indeed benefited from the program. However, some of the schools that claim more than 60 % of their students bought bicycles showed no signs of them. The students said they no longer rode bicycles to school because they got punctures easily and were therefore

costly to repair, particularly as they were not informed that they could take their bicycles to the shop managers to fix them free of charge. Instead, they would pay for repairs which they felt they could no longer afford. Hence the bicycles remained at home. This suggests the need for a local service provider to handle all cases.

All in all, women reaped much benefit from the program:

- About 50 % of the shop managers were women. They were not only equal to men in terms of numbers, but also in positions they occupied and the types of work they performed. They were trained to be bicycle mechanics. Most importantly, they developed a sense of self-worth and overcame their own gender stereotypes that bicycles were not for them.
- In addition, women gained increased mobility through the use of bicycles.

## 8 Conclusions and Recommendations

The findings depicted efforts to integrate gender into transport policies, programs and projects as having substantial gaps and inconsistencies. A literature review and donor consultation<sup>56</sup> found very little gender consideration in transport. The subsequent case studies found a number of positive developments in gender mainstreaming in transport projects. However, gender-enabling environments in many of the case study countries were consistently not translated into practice across the transport sector.

Some case studies reported failures in project design that led to the differences between planned and actual outcomes. Projects in these case studies were focused on infrastructure maintenance or construction without measures to promote better transport services to go with the infrastructure. Such lack of measures seem to be due to a failure in having the community participate in the project preparation, implementation and monitoring. One example from Senegal states that while community roads may be provided as part of a project, communities, particularly women, reiterate the need for transport services to be provided along this infrastructure.<sup>57</sup>

The following are recommendations for ameliorating the gender situations in transport projects.

- **A thorough gender investigation at the beginning**

A thorough investigation on gender aspects is necessary before a transport project is planned so that it can carry out gender mainstreaming in a concrete fashion.

- **Increase gender capacity in institutions**

A commitment at the level of national government by itself is not sufficient for addressing gender issues. Institutions at all levels --- regional and local government, businesses and academia, for instance --- need to increase their gender awareness and put that into practice. Only commitment from the top combined with enthusiasm from the grassroots and individual level will stand a good chance of success.

---

<sup>56</sup> See Appendix 2 and 3.

<sup>57</sup> Senegal, p. 12.

- **Participatory and gender responsive approach throughout the project cycle**

The project cycle, i.e. the process from the country strategy through evaluation, needs to be gender-sensitive. It also needs to employ a participatory approach that encourages a greater involvement of women at all stages of the project cycle.

- **Flexibility and management**

While transport projects, like any other development project, are meant to be managed in the way they were originally designed, they need to have a certain degree of flexibility so that further gender consideration, if necessary, can be taken into account at some point.

- **Develop monitoring and evaluation indicators**

In the monitoring and evaluation of future transport projects, clear gender-sensitive monitoring indicators are important, e.g. the number of women who have better access to an important destination such as a market due to improved transportation, roads or bridges. It is also important to measure achievement of transport projects in a qualitative as well as quantitative way as not all progress can be measured in numbers. This can be done through interviews and group discussions, for instance, to see how women perceive a transport project differently from men.