

Improving Civil Registration and Vital Statistics: mortality from road crashes in Africa

Workshop
Tunis, 3 – 5 April 2019

World Health Organization

Workshop report

Background

The first African Road Safety Forum was held in Marrakesh in November 2018 with 1200 participants representing 75 countries of which 47 were in Africa. The African region not only has the highest road traffic death rates per 100,000 population (i.e. 26.6 per 100,000 population), but it is also where the largest discrepancies exist on the number of deaths from road crashes between the official figures reported by the countries government and estimates generated by the World Health Organization (WHO). The Forum brought together a myriad of actors to discuss ways to improve road safety in Africa through a series of workshops. One of the side workshops was organized by WHO to raise the awareness of the need to strengthen countries civil registration and vital statistics (CRVS) systems in order to improve mortality data from road crashes. The opportunity for this workshop raised in the context of ongoing collaboration between WHO and the road safety regional observatory collaboration that the World Bank, International Transportation Forum and Federation International de l'Automobile are currently developing. It was during the November meeting in Marrakech that African countries agreed on the proposed governance arrangement and the initial work plan of setting up the African Road Safety Observatory, which is to seek out endorsement by the African Union Commission. This work plan includes improvements in vital registration systems in the continent.

The forum concluded with a Declaration (Marrakesh Declaration) by all participating member States that encourage countries to prioritize the development of their CRVS system with the involvement of all stakeholders and international partners.

Based on the success of the first Forum and continuing interest and commitment from the African region in seeking support to improve their data systems, the WHO in collaboration with international partners such as FIA, WB and ITF organized the second multi-country workshop in Tunis, Tunisia, 3-5 April 2019.

The FIA had been instrumental in facilitating the organization of the WHO workshop in Marrakech. Consequently, FIA requested FIA Foundation to financially sponsor the organization of this second workshop in Tunis. This was signed through a memorandum of understanding between FIA Foundation and WHO,

Objectives of the workshop

The purpose of this workshop was to guide countries in formulating an action plan for improving data on road traffic deaths in Africa that included the following activities:

- Explore with participants the quality of their data as well as strengths and weaknesses of their data systems integrate mortality data from different data sources.
- develop protocols to identify gaps within existing systems and assess the extent of under-reporting at the national level by conducting business process mapping.

Participants

A total of 28 participants from 10 low – and -middle-income countries namely, Botswana, Cameroon, Ghana, Kenya, Morocco, Nigeria, Senegal, Tanzania, Uganda and Tunisia. Country delegations consisted of a mix of people from ministries of health, statistical offices, civil registries, police and institutions for road safety. The workshop was attended by 36 participants, including the facilitators. A complete list of participants is included in Annex A.

Structure and content

During each of the 3 days, the workshop was structured with sessions in plenary and group work. In the group sessions country delegations discussed among themselves guided by the facilitators. The results were presented at the end of each group session to the entire audience for comments.

The course of the workshop was organized with distinct goals: the first day was to review data sources and the data quality, the second day to identify gaps and bottlenecks in the flow of the data systems and the last day was to define a national strategy with action plan for improving data in the short, medium and long-term period.

The agenda of the workshop is found in Annex B.

A copy of all the presentations was shared with the participants.

Summary of sessions

Mrs. Doris Ma fat and Dr. Kacem laych chaired the sessions and gave presentations during the 3 days of the workshop. Dr. Daniel Cobos from the Swiss Tropical and Public Health Institute also facilitated the workshop.

Day 1

The workshop was opened by the WHO representative in Tunisia, Dr. Yves SOUTEYRAND, and a representative from the Ministry of Health of Tunisia who participated in all sessions during the three days. The WHO representative expressed his support to Tunisia in improving the quality of its data.

After the opening session, Mr. Benacer Boulaajoul, the chair of the Steering Committee of the African

Road Safety Observatory spoke on the importance of good data for developing and supporting policies and the crucial need to improve road traffic data systems in Africa.

The next presentation was given by Dr. Phathai Singkham from the Ministry of Public Health of Thailand on reconciling data from various sources. Dr. Phathai was fully involved in the data reconciliation exercise and he shared his experience on the method, challenges and the way in which his country was planning to implement such exercise on a regular basis soon.

The method used in Thailand was appealing to the audience as the sequence of steps are logical and the method is replicable in another setting.

All the countries were interested in this approach to arrive at a relevant and representative set of data of road traffic deaths.

In the afternoon of the first day the participants were given an exercise of 17 questions to help them think through should they use Thailand's example by linking data from various sources, the type of challenges they would face, the timeline needed to complete the matching exercise and which sectors should be involved in the exercise. As a result of this exercise each country presented their answers to the questions.

Day 2

The second day of this workshop was focused on Business Process Mapping. Dr. Daniel Cobos started the day by giving a presentation of how to use a Business Process Mapping (BPM) and what was the purpose of using this tool in improving data particularly on road traffic deaths. In the afternoon the countries had the opportunity to use the free software to create their own process mapping to show each step of the process from the road crash to the inclusion of the fact of death in the data systems. Though each country was represented by a maximum of 3 stakeholders, it was recommended to the participants to share the results of this BPM exercise with other sectors in particular the high-level officials not present in this workshop and to encourage them to join in this exercise at the national level.

Given the time limit, 3 countries were chosen to present the result of this exercise and discussed with the other countries about the gaps showed of missing data and linkage of the different sectors.

Day 3

The third day was focused on Civil Registration and Vital Statistics (CRVS) systems and its importance in generating data on road traffic deaths on a routine and continuous basis. Countries should consider investing in their CRVS system in the long run for providing legal documents to the individuals as well as contributing to vital statistics including causes of death. Ghana and Tunisia presented their experience in improving their CRVS system. In the last group sessions, countries were required to prepare their short-term, medium-term and long-term plans with the goal to improve data on road traffic deaths based on what they had learned during the entire workshop

Recommendations and next steps

Feedback from workshop participants was highly positive. The workshop had raised the awareness of the countries on the need to define their short, medium and long-term objectives in improving data on road traffic deaths. The presentations and group work had stimulated interest among the participants in pursuing the project further once they went back to their country. The workshop also highlighted the importance of multi-sectoral involvement: health, police, transports, civil registration, insurance and other sectors in the improvement of road traffic data systems.

WHO team would follow up closely with the countries and provide support as needed. Each country would need to define the scope of their project with goals and timeline as well as the type of support needed. Support would be determined case by case depending on each country situation.

WHO also recognizes the benefit of this workshop and would undertake further workshops in the future where funding can be made available.

Annex A

List of participants:

Dr Yves Philippe Henry Souteyrand

WHO Representative
World Health Organization

Tunisia

souteyrandy@who.int

Dr Clotilde Minster

Research Assistant
World Bank

United States of America

cminster@worldbank.org

Dr Kacem Iaych

Technical Officer

World Health Organization

Switzerland

iaychk@who.int

Dr Daniel Eduardo Cobos

Senior Scientific Collaborator
Swiss Tropical and Public Health
Institute

Spain/Switzerland

daniel.cobos@swisstph.ch

Mrs Doris Ma Fat

Statistician

World Health Organization

Switzerland

mafatd@who.int

Mr Mohamed Amine Souguir

Statistician

National Road Safety Observatory

Tunisia

mohamed.amine.souguir@gmail.com

Ms Chaima Essid

Logistics Assistant

World Health Organization

Tunisia

Essidc@who.int

Ms Maryam Tavakkoli

PHD Student

Swiss Tropical and Public Health
Institute

Switzerland

maryam.tavakkoli@swisstph.ch

Dr Soumia Jannan

Head of road Information service

Direction Des Routes

Morocco

jannan@mtpnet.gov.ma

Mr Peter Odwar

Data Analyst

Police Service Headquarters

Kenya

peter.odwar@kenyapolice.go.ke

Dr Hind Wadifi

Medical officer
Ministry of Health

Morocco

wadifhind@yahoo.fr

Ms Adaku Obodo

Chief Vital Registration Officer

Nigeria

ad_obodo@yahoo.co.uk

Dr Farida Babnou

Public Health Specialist
Hospitals and Ambulatory Care
Ministry of Health

Morocco

dr.b.fari@gmail.com

Dr Sydney Ibeanusi

Focal Person
UN Decade of Action of Road
Safety & Injury Prevention

Nigeria

sydney_ibe@hotmail.com

Mr Benacer Boulaajoul

Chair of ARSO &
Permanent Secretary
National Committee for Road
Accidents Prevention
Ministry of Transport

Morocco

boulaajoul@cnpac.gov.ma

Mr Kayode Fanola

Assistant Corps Marshal

Policy Research and Statistics

jk.fanola@frsc.gov.ng

Dr Henda Chebbi

Medical Officer
Ministry of Health

Tunisia

henda.chebbi@rns.tn

Mr Kebalepile Kepadisa

Supervisor
Police Service

Botswana

kkepadisa@gov.bw

Dr Afef Achour Skhiri
Specialist of Preventive Medicine
National Institute of Public Health

Tunisia
afefsk@gmail.com

Dr Nada Zoghlami
Statistics Engineer
Ministry of Health
Tunisia
zoghlaminada@gmail.com

Mr Nouredine Sayedi
Traffic Director
Ministry of Transport
Tunisia
nouredine.sayadi@gmail.com

Ms Pamela Kakande
Senior Statistician
Bureau of Statistics
Uganda
pamela.kakande@ubos.org

Mr Ousmane Ly
Civil Engineer
Ministry of Infrastructure, Transport
Telecommunications & ICT
Senegal

lyousmane.6@hotmail.com

Mr Amos Motshegwe
Director
Ministry of Transport and
Communications
Botswana
amotshegwe@gov.bw

Mr Bushe Laba
Chief Health Officer
Ministry of Health and Wellness
Botswana
blaba@gov.bw

Ms Bettinah Naluga
Directorate of Traffic and Road Safety
Police Force
Uganda
nalugo_b@yahoo.com

Mr Christophe Abouna
Evacuations Chief
Ministry of Public Health
Cameroon
christopheabouna@gmail.com

Mrs Viviane Ndoungue
Monitoring and Evaluation specialist

Ministry of Public Health
Cameroon

vfossouo@gmail.com

Dr Sene Bineta

Head of the Office of Prevention
of Trauma and Violence
Ministry of Health

Senegal

bibisene68@yahoo.fr

Dr David Edward Lenga

Ministry of Health

Ministry of Health

United Republic of Tanzania

davidlenga2015@gmail.com

Mr Emmanuel Botchway

Assistant Registrar
Births and Deaths Registry

Ghana

emmabotchway@yahoo.co.uk

Ms Demetria Kokulamuka Ngilwa

Senior Statistician
National Bureau of Statistics

United Republic of Tanzania

demetria.ngilwa@nbs.go.tz

Mr Gabriel Sarpong Adu

Planning Officer
National Road Safety Commission

Ghana

adugabriel@gmail.com

Mr Deus Wilbroad Sokoni

Assistant Superintendent of Police
Traffic Headquarters

United Republic of Tanzania

sokonid@yahoo.com

Mr Nicholas Nyagblornu

Policy Planning Monitoring and
Evaluation Directorate
Ministry of Health

Ghana

nyagblornu@yahoo.com

Mr Phathai Singkham

Medical Epidemiologist
Office of Non communicable Disease
Ministry of Health

Thailand

phathais@gmail.com

Annex B. Agenda

Improving Civil Registration and Vital Statistics: mortality from road crashes in Africa

3-5 April 2019 at Ramada Plaza Hotel in Tunis, Tunisia

Day 1: 3 April 2019

Scope: Review of data sources and quality

Time	Session	Presenter
08.30 : 09.00	Registration	<i>All participants</i>
09.00 : 09.30	Opening remarks: objectives and expected outcomes of the workshop	<i>Dr Yves Souteyrand, WR/WHO Dr Henda Chebbi, MOH/TUNIS Dr Kacem laych, WHO</i>
09.30 : 09.45	Introduction	<i>All participants</i>
09.45: 10.15	African Road Safety Observatory (feedback high level meeting)	<i>Benacer Boulaajoul, ARSO</i>
10:15 10.30	Structure of workshop	<i>Kacem laych, WHO</i>
<i>10.30: 10.45</i>	<i>Coffee break</i>	
10.45 : 11.15	Road traffic deaths: data sources & quality Strengths and limitations of data systems	<i>Kacem laych, WHO Doris Ma Fat, WHO</i>
11.15 : 11.45	Thailand experience: inter-sectoral collaboration (health, Police, interior, transport, insurance) to improve data on road traffic deaths	<i>Dr Singkham MoPH I Thailand</i>
11.45 : 12.15	Discussions	<i>All participants</i>
<i>12.15 : 13.30</i>	<i>Lunch</i>	
13.30: 13.45	Introduction to group work	<i>Doris Ma Fat, WHO Kacem laych, WHO</i>
13.45: 14.45	Group work: review of country death collection system & data quality	<i>All participants</i>
14.45 : 15.30	Presentations of group work	<i>All participants</i>
<i>15.30 : 15:45</i>	<i>Coffee break</i>	
15.45 : 16.45	Presentations of group work (cont'd)	<i>All participants</i>
16.45: 17.00	Summary of group work & main outcomes	<i>WHO</i>

Day 2: 4 April 2019

Scope: Focus on improving data flow among systems

Time	Session	Presenter
09.00 : 09.05	Recap of previous day discussions	<i>Kacem laych, WHO</i>
09.05 : 10.00	Death notification, certification and registration: Business process mapping: CRVS Business process mapping: violent deaths	<i>Daniel Cobos, STPH Maryam Tavakkoli, STPH</i>
10.00: 10:30	Group work: process mapping, identify weaknesses and ways to improve	<i>All participants</i>
<i>10.30: 10.45</i>	<i>Coffee break</i>	
10.45 : 12.30	Group work: process mapping, identify weaknesses and ways to improve (cont'd)	<i>All participants</i>
<i>12.30 : 13.45</i>	<i>Lunch</i>	
13.45: 15:30	Group work: process mapping, identify weaknesses and ways to improve (cont'd)	<i>All participants</i>
<i>15.30 : 15.45</i>	<i>Coffee break</i>	
15.45: 17.00	Presentation of group work	<i>All participants</i>
16.15: 17.00	Discussions	

Day 3: 5 April 2019

Scope: Refining national strategies for improving data systems

Time	Session	Presenter
09.00 : 09.05	Recap of previous day discussions	<i>Kacem laych, WHO</i>
09.05: 09.30	CRVS systems: global initiatives, principles and operational framework Health sector contribution to improving CRVS system	<i>Doris Ma Fat, WHO</i>
09.30: 10.30	Improving CRVS system: country experiences: Ghana, Tunisia	<i>Ghana, Tunisia,</i>
<i>10.30: 10.45</i>	<i>Coffee break</i>	
10.45: 11.00	Defining national strategy/action plan for CRVS system	<i>Daniel Cobos, STPH</i>
11.00: 12.00	Group work: Towards a national strategy/action plan: feasibility, costs, sustainability (cont'd)	<i>All participants</i>
<i>12.00: 12.30</i>	<i>Presentation of group work</i>	<i>All participants</i>
<i>12.30 : 14.00</i>	<i>Lunch</i>	
14.00 : 14.45	Presentation of group work (cont'd)	<i>All participants</i>
14.45 : 15.15	Contribution to the next global report on road safety, Next steps	<i>Kacem laych, WHO Doris Ma Fat, WHO</i>
15.15 : 15.30	Coffee break	
15.30	Closure of workshop	