Rural Transport Training Materials

Module 5:

Social and Environmental Issues

Environmental impact assessment case study: Mkuze river crossing to Phelendaba, South Africa

Session 5.4

Part 2

Presentation 5.4b











1. Introduction

Learning Objectives

This session enables participants to:

- © Examine South Africa's EIA system in design and practice
- Weigh the environmental costs and benefits of a specific road project
- Explore the role of participation in environmental decision making
- Reflect on key lessons learnt and how they might be applied to other settings



Session Overview

- Background & South African EIA regulations
- Background and context to the proposed development
- © Environmental issues
- Conclusions of EIA



2. Background & EIA regulations

- In South Africa, EIAs are compulsory on development proposals
 - result of1997 Environmental Conservation Act
- Applies to construction or upgrading of
 - national roads
 - toll roads
 - provincial, arterial and municipal roads
 - any road in a sensitive area



Also...

- South African Constitution
 - upholds right of individuals to environment that is not harmful to their health and well-being
- Environmental Management Act
 - seeks to 'provide for co-operative environmental governance by establishing principles for decision-making on matters affecting the environment'



South African EIA regulations

Three major components

- Scoping
 - determines scope of assessment
 - consultation with 'interested and affected parties'
- Assessment
 - explores impact, magnitude, duration and significance
- Openion
 Decision
 - relevant authorities, coordinated by 'lead agent'



3. Background & context to proposed development

- Last gravel section of tourist access from Hluhluwe to Mozambique border
- Proposal
 - tar existing road
 - construct new crossing over bottom of Mozi Pan
 - upgrade bridge at lower Mkuze Crossing
 - upgrade the crossing over Mseleni River



Context

Biophysical environment

Development

Social environment



Biophysical environment

- Biodiversity 'hot spot'
 - many lakes (e.g. Lake St. Lucia)
 - many endemic plant species
 - 112 reptile species (20 inadequately protected, 7 threatened with extinction)
 - 102 mammal species
 - 462 bird species (47 of which need protection)



Development

- Project area part of Spatial Development Initiative (SDI)
 - programme to encourage rapid investment in designated areas
- Area of high eco-tourism potential
- Road upgrade provides infrastructure to
 - unlock area's economic potential
 - improve access for local people, tourists and commercial activities
 - effect a direct link between northern KwaZulu-Natal and Mozambique



Social environment

- Maputaland among poorest and underdeveloped areas of South Africa
 - 38% unemployment
 - most rely on subsistence agriculture
- Tourism has potential to increase development



4. Environmental issues

Two alternative routes for the road:

- 1. Existing (eastern) alignment and upgrading Mozi Swamp crossing
- 2. Alternative (western) alignment



Eastern (existing) alignment

- Benefits
 - roadway already cleared
 - shorter and cheaper
- Negative impacts
 - passes through Sodwana State Forest thereby creating hazards for game and hazards for traffic



Upgrading Mozi Swamp crossing

Benefits

- removal of barriers to fish migration
- improved access to Kwa-Jobe
- increased frequency of water exchange
- reduced salinity in Lake St. Lucia
- improved fish yields

Negative impacts

- constricting water movements
- possible embankment collapse in floods
- reduction in hydrologic pressure on Mkhuze Swamp during floods



Western (alternative) alignment

- Proposed by KwaZulu-Natal Nature Conservation Service
- Benefits
 - expanded width of migration corridor
 - no need to cross Mozi Swamp
 - easier access for eco-tourists to Mozi and Yenguenie Pans
 - avoids Sodwana State Forest
 - provides better access to poverty stricken Kwa-Jobe Tribal authority
- Negative impacts
 - need to clear 140 HA of mature sand forest
 - easier access to woodcutters → potential deforestation



Weighing the evidence: which road alignment should be selected?



Group Activity

Given the benefits and negative impacts outlined above, which road alignment should be selected and why?



5. Conclusions of EIA

- Existing (eastern) alignment was selected
- Oue to:
 - environmental considerations
 - vehement opposition to alternative route by tribal authorities
- Recommended stringent Environmental Management Programme (EMP)
 - to mitigate negative impact of upgrade
 - especially for Mozi Swamp crossing



- Mighlights complexity of EIA in terms of dynamics of social and natural systems
- Indicates importance of public participation
- Extended scoping study (not full EIA) was adequate for decision-making
 - EIA regulations therefore 'development friendly' without compromising environmental protection
- Indicates types of issues typical of road building in rural and ecologically sensitive setting
- Emphasises importance of EMP to ensure that EIA recommendations put into practise

